



CITY OF CHARLESTON BOARD OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW – SMALL

MEETING RESULTS

APRIL 27, 2023

4:30 P.M.

2 GEORGE STREET

BOARD MEMBERS PRESENT: Van Slambrook, Altman, Huey Wilson, Turner

STAFF MEMBERS PRESENT: Pinto, Bennett

A. Minutes

1. Review of Minutes from the April 13, 2023 Meeting

DECISION: APPROVED

MOTION: Approval.

MADE BY: Van Slambrook SECOND: Wilson VOTE: FOR: 5 AGAINST: 0

B. Applications

1. 193 Line Street

TMS # 460-07-04-121 | BAR2023-001099

Category 4 | Westside | c. 1905 | Old City District

Request partial demolition of historic structure including chimney.

Owner: Legacy28 Enterprises Inc

Applicant: Old Carolina Construction of Charleston

Site visit 4/27/2023 at 8:30 a.m.

DECISION: DENIED

MOTION: Denial of after-the-fact with the condition that the chimney is to be rebuilt with salvaged brick in accordance with any photos or to match adjacent house.

MADE BY: Turner SECOND: Wilson VOTE: FOR: 5 AGAINST: 0

NOTES:

- PSC – opposed. Character defining feature.

- HCF – letter in opposition.
- Board Discussion
 - Adjacent house of similar age (to left). Chimney could be built to match.

Staff Observations:

1. The chimney a character defining features and should be repaired and retained.

Staff comments:

1. Chimney should be reconstructed to match previous.

Staff Recommendation: Denial with staff comment

2. 48 Rutledge Avenue

TMS # 457-08-03-089 | BAR2023-001100

NS | Harleston Village | c. 1968 | Old and Historic District

Request demolition of historic structure.

Owner: Tina & Joel Christy

Applicant: Gottshalk Architects

Site visit 4/27/2023 at 8:50 a.m.

DECISION: APPROVED

MOTION: Approval with Staff Comment and Board Comment to retain brick as possible.

MADE BY: Huey SECOND: Altman VOTE: FOR: 0 AGAINST: 0

NOTES:

- Brick is old, should be salvaged.
- No Public Comment.

Staff Observations:

1. Existing house disrupts the pattern of the street and is disproportionate to the streetscape.

Staff comments:

1. If the door surround and brick façade are historic, they should be retained if possible.

Staff Recommendation: Approval

3. 60 Tradd Street

TMS # 458-09-03-174 | BAR2023-001105

Category 2 | Charlestowne | c. 1732 | Old and Historic District

Requesting conceptual approval to reconstruct piazza.

Owner: John & Marnie Kerrison

Applicant: Bill Huey & Associates

DECISION: APPROVED

MOTION: Conceptual Approval with Final Review by Staff.

MADE BY: Wilson SECOND: Turner VOTE: FOR: 4 AGAINST: 0
Recused – Huey

NOTES:

- PSC – highly supportive. Suggest wood columns at ground.
- HCF- support as easement holder.
- Board Discussion
 - In favor

Staff Observations:

1. Staff believes the proposal is appropriate to the structure and appreciate that this important feature is being restored to the house.

Staff Recommendation: Conceptual approval with final review by staff

4. 24 Gordon Street

TMS # 463-11-04-059 | BAR2023-001037

NS | Wagener Terrace | c. 1938 | Historic Materials Demolition Purview

Request partial demolition of historic structure, including removal of rear portion of roof.

Owner: Christine & Abraham Dabit
Applicant: Patrick Orfice, Arwen Studio
(Board site visit was 2/23/2023 as part of prior review.)

DECISION: APPROVED

MOTION: Approval of Demolition.

MADE BY: Altman SECOND: Turner VOTE: FOR: 5 AGAINST: 0

NOTES:

- No Public Comment
- Board Discussion
 - Appreciate side gables are retained
 - Removal is restricted to rear.

Staff Observations:

1. While the roof is finished in asphalt shingles, which do not carry historic or architectural value, the proposal removes approximately 26% of the roof.

2. While this is a more sensitive demolition request, staff has concerns about the large continuous portion of the roof being removed. However, a portion of the rear roof has already been altered to a dormer.
3. Other proposals where demolition has been restricted have been contributing structures to National Register districts.

Staff Recommendation: Approval

5. 2307 Mount Pleasant Street

TMS # 463-07-02-027 | BAR2023-001062

Category 4 | Wagener Terrace | c. 1950 | Historic Materials Demolition Purview

Request partial demolition of historic structure, including removal of rear portion of roof.

Owner: Sarah Wrenn & John Milko

Applicant: Patrick Orfice, Arwen Studio

(Board site visit was 3/23/2023 as part of prior review.)

DECISION: APPROVED

MOTION: Approval of Demolition.

MADE BY: Huey SECOND: Altman VOTE: FOR: 5 AGAINST: 0

NOTES:

- No public comment.

Staff Observations:

1. While the roof is finished in asphalt shingles, which do not carry historic or architectural value, the proposal removes approximately 39% of the roof.
2. While this is a more sensitive demolition request, staff has concerns about the large continuous portion of the roof being removed and feel that any alterations to the roof should be limited to smaller portions that do not intersect the roof ridge.
3. Other proposals where demolition has been restricted have been contributing structures to National Register districts.

Staff Recommendation: Approval

6. 167 Grove Street

TMS # 463-15-01-012 | BAR2023-001053

Category 4 | Wagener Terrace | c. 1935 | Historic Materials Demolition Purview

Request partial demolition of historic structure, including removal of rear portion of roof.

Owner: Lauren Flatey

Applicant: Lauren Flatey & Ben Rabin

(Board site visit was 3/9/2023 as part of prior review.)

DECISION: APPROVED

MOTION: Approval of demolition

MADE BY: Huey SECOND: Wilson VOTE: FOR: 5 AGAINST: 0

NOTES:

- No Public Comment.

Staff Observations:

1. While the roof is finished in asphalt shingles, which do not carry historic or architectural value, the proposal removes approximately 39% of the roof.
2. Staff appreciate that the proposed area has been reduced and setback from the sides of the house to reduce visibility.
3. Other proposals where demolition has been restricted have been contributing structures to National Register districts.

Staff Recommendation: Approval

7. 9 Elliott Street

TMS # 458-09-03-101 | BAR2023-001101

NS | Charlestowne | c. 1947 | Old and Historic District

Requesting after the fact approval for equipment stand.

Owner: Eric Roden

Applicant: Babak Bryan

DECISION: DEFERRED

MOTION: Deferral for Restudy.

MADE BY: Huey SECOND: Altman VOTE: FOR: 5 AGAINST: 0

NOTES:

- Written public comments read into record: Neil Weiner, 7 Elliott & Cindy Wofford, 8 C Elliott.
- Board Comment
 - Visible from sidewalk in current condition without roof structure
 - Incongruous with existing structure.
 - Lowering would remove from visibility.
 - Now reads as HVAC stand.
 - To screen from neighbor's view will make more visible from street
- Applicant
 - Can create a non-structural solution – vegetation

- Board
 - Another rung of slats would screen
 - Roof add height? Suggestions for alteration.

Staff Observations:

1. 1/25/22 – permit was issued. Equipment was approved by staff to be on grade, behind house.
2. No City requirements mandated the raising of this equipment.

Staff comments:

1. Form reads as an addition. Additions should be subordinate and compatible to existing structure.

Staff Recommendation: Denial

8. 24 State Street

TMS # 458-09-01-120 | BAR2023-001102

Category 3 | French Quarter | c. 1841 | Old and Historic District

Appeal of staff approval of wall permit.

Owner: 24 State Street LLC

Applicant: Doe Cote

DECISION: APPROVED

MOTION: Reverse staff decision.

MADE BY: Huey SECOND: Turner VOTE: FOR: 4 AGAINST: 0
Recused – Wilson

NOTES:

- Douglas Kirkman – 4 Unity Alley – rear property, opposed
- Stephanie Wilson – President – request deferral. Negatively impacts character
- Peggy, 20 State – wall interrupting garden is distressing
- Virginia Marshall, 25 State – don't want courtyard divided, fence would be less obtrusive
- Lea, 20 Chalmers – in opposition
- Kim Bateman, 40 State – both gates lock – no safety concern
- Tim Brennan, 20 State – in opposition
- 21 Queen – object to modifications. Concerns for tree.
- Jana Hopkins – history of neighborhood, courtyard
- Doug Sanner – speaks for trees
- Derek Neiderman, 20 State
- Jeremy Tate, 24 S Hampton – represent owner of 24 State
 - Design professional, has met with Ms. Cote.
 - Working on redesign addressing concerns

- Will stop at rear property line, if is a zero lot line, won't abut adjacent house
- James Meadors, Meadors Inc. – photo of visibility, sun study
- Written Public Comment read into record
- Applicant response
 - Is stucco wall – only solution can if not be fence or wrought iron
- Board Discussion
 - 6' is not a tall wall
 - Concern more about visibility from State and Unity Alley
 - Don't think solution is big wall down middle
 - Extreme solution. Retention of light and air

Staff Observations:

1. 2/21/23 – original permit approval
2. 3/13/23 – revised approval

Staff comments:

1. This is a historic courtyard, with gardens and plantings over 50 years old, which would be destroyed by the proposed construction.
 - a. Not under BAR purview, approved by zoning
2. The material, size and mass of the proposed wall are incompatible with the existing historic brick courtyard.
 - a. Sympathetic to existing. Only item under BAR jurisdiction
3. I am concerned that the construction of the wall would extensively damage existing mature trees.
 - a. Evaluated by zoning
4. I am concerned about the potential for flooding because the enormous wall will remove areas of drainage.
 - a. Not under BAR purview
5. The survey on which the building plan is based is dated 1970. No current survey was done, and I question the accuracy of the property lines as they are given in the proposed plan.
 - a. Not under BAR purview

Staff Recommendation: Affirm Staff Decision.

9. 81 Columbus Street

TMS # 459-09-02-115 | BAR2023-001103

Category 4 | East Side | c. 1895 | Old City District

Requesting right-angle sign.

Owner: Miller Law Firm

Applicant: MCPG Ventures Inc, DBA Image360 Charleston

DECISION: DENIED

MOTION: Denial as proposed with Staff Comment.

MADE BY: Turner SECOND: Altman VOTE: FOR: 4 AGAINST: 0

NOTES:

- No Public Comment
- Board Comment
 - Agree with staff due to proportions of sidewalk/structure

Staff Observations:

1. 1/18/23 – Staff denied proposed 36”x36” sign and recommended reducing to 24”x24” due to narrowness of sidewalk and proximity to street.
2. Residential area. Signs are smaller due to narrow sidewalk

Staff comments:

1. Recommend reducing to 24”x24”

Staff Recommendation: Denial as proposed

10. 46 Cannon Street (73 Spring)

TMS # 460-08-03-057 | BAR2023-001104

Cannonborough / Elliottborough | New | Old City District

Requesting conceptual approval for new construction of single-family dwelling at rear of 73 Spring.

Owner: Historic Smalls Alley

Applicant: John Douglas Tucker, architect

Deferred by staff prior to meeting

11. 117 Broad Street & 17 Orange Street

TMS # 457-12-04-009 | BAR2023-001108

Category 3 | Charlestowne | c. 1770 | Old and Historic District

Request conceptual approval for alterations to non-original front stair and previous rear alterations, including the restoration of Georgian period details.

Owner: 117 SOB Project, LLC

Applicant: Simons Young

DECISION: APPROVED

MOTION: Conceptual Approval with Final Review by Staff.

MADE BY: Wilson SECOND: Turner VOTE: FOR: 5 AGAINST: 0

NOTES:

- Mike Laughlin, 14 Orange – request access shown for 17 Orange

- Henry Grimball, 11 Orange – opposes posted sign wording, access to Orange Street
- PSC – supportive of restoration
- Written Comment – HCF in support
- Applicant Response
 - No easement on 117 Broad
 - 117 Broad is a freestanding property

Staff comments:

1. Staff believes the proposal is appropriate to the structure and appreciate the restoration of original features and the sympathetic treatment of the rear alterations.

Staff Recommendation: Conceptual approval and final review by staff

12. 80 Alexander Street

TMS # 459-13-04-045 | BAR2023-001106

Category 2 | Mazyck - Wraggborough | c. 1850 | Old and Historic District

Requesting conceptual approval to restore piazza, reglaze windows, reconstruct front steps, construct brick wall, replace piazza door, alterations to crawlspace door, and hardscape alterations.

Owner: 80 Alexander LLC

Applicant: John Johansen

DECISION: DEFERRED

MOTION: Deferral with Board Comment for staff to quality which items need further detailing and Board Review.

MADE BY: Huey SECOND: Altman VOTE: FOR: 5 AGAINST: 0

NOTES:

- PSC – overall positive, need more detail drawings, not meeting submittal requirements
- No written comments submitted
- Board Discussion
 - Need more information, details
 - Staff determine which items are more repairs in nature to handle separately
 - Some details subject to more thorough drawings
 - Concept is great, submittal is incomplete

Staff Observations:

1. HVAC and water heater not visible from public ROW.
2. Proposed wall not visible from public ROW.

3. Windows repairs to be in kind to match existing.
4. Trim repair to be in kind to match existing.

Staff comments:

1. Staff suggest adding nosing to steps or other detailing.
2. Proposed door matches existing door on piazza. Request applicant confirms it is a size fits in piazza screen without alterations.
3. Site plan should locate house, driveway columns, and property wall and confirm width of gate opening matches width of driveway.
4. Crawlspace door illustration needs additional detail.

Staff Recommendation: Conceptual approval with final review by staff

13. 76 Queen Street

TMS # 457-08-04-010 | BAR2023-001107

Category 3 | Harleston Village | c. 1893 | Old and Historic District

Requesting conceptual approval to construct aluminum pergola.

Owner: Husk

Applicant: Structerra Outdoor

DECISION: APPROVED

MOTION: Conceptual Approval with Final Review by Staff.

MADE BY: Wilson SECOND: Altman VOTE: FOR: 5 AGAINST: 0

NOTES:

- Patio is existing, request is just for pergola
- Anchored with concrete wedge anchors
- No Public Comment
- Board Discussion
 - Lighting – minimal LEDs

Staff Observations:

1. Structure will be minimally visible between 74 & 76 Queen.

Staff comments:

1. Proposal is subordinate and differentiated from existing.

Staff Recommendation: Conceptual approval with final review by staff

14. 95 Ashley Avenue

TMS # 457-03-03-057 | BAR2023-001109

Category 3 | Harleston Village | c. 1845 | Old and Historic District

Requesting replacement simulated divided light windows.

Owner: Karl and Carolyn Bjork

Applicant: Karl Bjork

DECISION: DENIED

MOTION: Denial

MADE BY: Huey SECOND: Wilson VOTE: FOR: 5 AGAINST: 0

NOTES:

- Written comment from PSC – opposed & HCF – opposed
- Board Discussion
 - Opportunity to correct, previous SDL windows were not approved
 - BAR consistently does not approve SDL
 - Replacing these with insulated won't make energy difference in non-insulated structure.

Staff comments:

1. Simulated divided light windows are inappropriate at this located and for this age a structure.

Staff Recommendation: Denial

15. 2 Prioleau Street

TMS # 458-09-04-055 | BAR2023-001110

NR | Charlestowne | c. 1960 | Old and Historic District

Request replacement clad windows.

Owner: Kay Bachmann

Applicant: Historical Repairs and Maintenance

Withdrawn by staff prior to meeting
