

BOARD MEMBERS PRESENT: EDDIE BELLO, BILL HUEY, HUNTER KENNEDY, JULIA MARTIN, LINDSAY VAN SLAMBROOK
STAFF PRESENT: KIM HLAVIN, TORY PARISH



RESULTS
BOARD OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW-SMALL

May 13, 2021 4:30 P.M. "virtually" via Zoom Webinar

1. **35 Devereaux Avenue - - TMS # 463-07-00-020 APP. NO. 2105-13-1**

Request final approval for demolition.
Not Rated (Wagner Terrace) c. 1970 Historic Materials Demo Purview
Owner: Matthew B. Hastings
Applicant: Heather Wilson

MOTION: Final Approval

MADE BY: MARTIN SECOND: BELLO VOTE: FOR 4 AGAINST 1
VAN SLAMBROOK OPPOSED

Staff Comments:

1. The building is over 50 years old, but not a building that defines, or contributes to the National Register District, or the character of Wagner Terrace.
2. Many of the neighborhood's buildings that contribute to the National Register district have irreplaceable materials and craftsmanship. Modern materials of this house including T-111 siding, a type of plywood, make up parts of the exterior.
3. There are several striking examples of mid-century ranch houses in the neighborhood, but this particular house does not have the detailing, fenestration, wide overhangs, or other elements that define the architecture style.

Staff Recommendation: Final Approval.

2. **116 Ashley Avenue - - TMS # 457-03-01-090 APP. NO. 2105-13-2**

Requesting final approval for demolition.
Not Rated (Harleston Village) c. 1967 Old and Historic District
Owner: Dennis Patrick H MD and Patrick H Jr. MD
Applicant: Carol and David Houle

MOTION: Final Approval

MADE BY: BELLO SECOND: MARTIN VOTE: FOR 5 AGAINST 0

Staff Comments:

1. This building does not contribute to or characterize the neighborhood in Harleston Village, nor is it constructed with unique or irreplaceable materials.
2. It is in the Old and Historic district which requires board review for demolition.

Staff Recommendation: Final approval

3. **60 Meeting Street - - TMS # 458-09-03-177 APP. NO. 2105-13-3**

Request final approval for partial demolition of third-floor addition on carriage house, and carriage house chimneys.
Category 2 (Charlestowne) c. 1771 Old and Historic District
Owner: Jon Mazzoli
Applicant: Joseph Cronk

Deferred By Staff

4. **60 Meeting Street - - TMS # 458-09-03-177** **APP. NO. 2105-13-4**

Request conceptual approval for new construction of third-floor addition, modifications to the carriage house including window openings, removal of fire escape; and modifications to the gate and wall.

Category 2 (Charlestowne) c. 1771 Old and Historic District
Owner: Jon Mazzoli
Applicant: Joseph Cronk

Deferred By Staff

5. **4 Lowndes Street - - TMS # 457-11-02-002** **APP. NO. 2105-13-5**

Requesting conceptual approval for window replacements, roof replacement, new fence, and new shed.

Not Rated (Charlestowne) c. 1954 Old and Historic District
Owner: Ed Vaughn
Applicant: Patrick Orefice

Withdrawn By Staff

6. **62 Queen Street - - TMS # 458-09-01-082** **APP. NO. 2105-13-6**

Request final approval for new mural on east elevation.

Not Rated (French Quarter) c. 2019 Old and Historic District
Owner: Stuart Gross
Applicant: David Boatwright

MOTION: Deferral for restudy; and Board comments; and an emphasis on subtlety.

MADE BY: BELLO SECOND: KENNEDY VOTE: FOR 5 AGAINST 0

Staff Comments:

1. While the building is in a historic neighborhood, the building itself is not historic, and a mural could be appropriate for the location.
2. The mural is large and prominently repetitive, which does not further the distinctiveness or interest.
3. One of these figures, as opposed to the multiple that are proposed, could be interesting and more subtle.

Staff Recommendation: Denial.

7. **122 Tradd Street - - TMS # 457-12-04-111** **APP. NO. 2105-13-7**

Request garden renovations including new hardscape, pool, and landscape lighting.

Category 2 (Charlestowne) c. 1835 Old and Historic District
Owner: William and Sarah Dollens
Applicant: Wertimer + Cline Landscape Architects

MOTION: Final Approval.

MADE BY: BELLO SECOND: HUEY VOTE: FOR 5 AGAINST 0

Staff Comments:

1. This proposal is appropriate and modest, either reconstructing what was previously existing, or only moderately visible.

Staff Recommendation: Approval.

8. **164 King Street - - TMS # 457-08-04-019** **APP. NO. 2105-13-8**

Request final approval to replace concrete steps and mid-landing with matched marble slab treads; bluestone landing and walkways; and new rails to match existing.

Category 3 (Charlestowne) c. 1914 Old and Historic District
Owner: Charleston Library Foundation
Applicant: John Smart

MOTION: Final approval; with handrails to match the existing rails on upper run, with no pickets.

MADE BY: MARTIN SECOND: BELLO VOTE: FOR 5 AGAINST 0

Staff Comments:

- 1. Although we do not have any comments and find it to be a positive change, staff feel that this civic and prominent building requires Board review.

Staff Recommendation: Final approval.

9. **58 Hanover Street - - TMS # 459-05-04-101** **APP. NO. 2105-13-9**

Request conceptual approval for new construction of a single family dwelling.

New Construction (East Side) Old City District
Owner: Bill & Barnie Howell
Applicant: John Douglas Tucker, architect

MOTION: Deferral with Board conditions to restudy roof; north-side fenestration; and refine entry detailing.

MADE BY: MARTIN SECOND: BELLO VOTE: FOR 5 AGAINST 0

Staff Comments:

- 1. Typically, a shed roof includes additional clerestory windows to benefit from the additional height. If it sheds to the south instead of the north, it has the potential for solar collectors but that might be the only positive of this roofline which should be restudied.
- 2. The mass that simulates an enclosed piazza is inappropriate and should be restudied.
- 3. Fenestration is orderly except for the north elevation; align windows with more consistency.
- 4. The height, scale, and mass is appropriate, but general architectural direction should be refined.

Staff Recommendation: Deferral for general architectural direction, and staff comments noted.

10. **17.5 Hanover Street - - TMS # 459-09-02-087** **APP. NO. 2105-13-10**

Requesting final approval for modifications and renovations.

Category 4 (East Side) c. 1913 Old City District
Owner: Vernon and Robin Lowndes
Applicant: Byron Geddings, RA

MOTION: Final approval with staff comments; and final review by staff.

MADE BY: HUEY SECOND: MARTIN VOTE: FOR 5 AGAINST 0

Staff Comments:

- 1. Applicant followed the directives from the Board and staff from the April 8 meeting, and the proposal has improved significantly since its conception.
- 2. The cementitious siding as proposed is not appropriate; replace with wood.

Staff Recommendation: Final approval with staff comments.

11. **35 Ashton Street - - TMS # 460-11-01-033** **APP. NO. 2105-13-11**

Request extension of conceptual approval for new construction of a residential structure at rear of property.

New Construction (Westside) Old City District
Owner: Oak Tree Enterprises
Applicant: Brian Wells

Withdrawn By Staff

12. **37 Ashton Street - - TMS # 460-11-01-033** **APP. NO. 2105-13-12**

Request extension of conceptual approval for new construction of a residential structure at rear of property.

New Construction (Westside) Old City District
Owner: Oak Tree Enterprises
Applicant: Brian Wells

Withdrawn By Staff

13. **11 Anson Street - - TMS # 458-05-01-092** **AP. NO. 2105-13-13**

Request new construction of two-story addition at rear and to south of existing residence.

Category (Ansonborough) c. 1889 Old and Historic District
Owner: Jennifer Jernigan
Applicant: Glenn Keyes, Architect

MOTION: Conceptual approval with Staff comments; and final review by staff.

MADE BY: MARTIN SECOND: BELLO VOTE: FOR 5 AGAINST 0

Staff Comments:

1. This project has a history of non-compliance, which has to do with this rear portion. If this proposal should be denied, the owner should be required to complete the after-the-fact repairs.
2. That said, this house is small, and on a small lot, and there are examples of this similar example around the corner on Pinckney Street which further extend over the driveway.
3. The siding on the second floor should be more subtle, with nickle-gap or shiplap siding.
4. The east elevation should be included in the next submittal.

Staff Recommendation: Conceptual approval with final review by staff.

14. **157 Wentworth unit E - - TMS # 459-03-04-008** **APP. NO. 2105-13-14**

Request conceptual approval for new construction of a new 2 1/2 story house.

New Construction (Harleston Village) Old and Historic District
Owner: 157 Wentworth Street, LLC
Applicant: Neil Stevenson Architects

MOTION: Conceptual approval for height, scale, and mass; and general architectural direction with further study of architectural detailing per Board comments; and consideration of materials.

MADE BY: BELLO SECOND: HUEY VOTE: FOR 4 AGAINST 0
JM Abstained

Staff Comments:

1. The height scale and mass is appropriate.
2. The general architectural direction seems to be traditional but retains some suburban elements that are not appropriate for the neighborhood, especially from Beaufain Street.
3. Bays on two-story porch should be more vertical in nature and details refined, to align with the "Principals" set forth by the BAR. Restudy the fenestration to better relate to the bay proportions.
4. The shed dormers should be eliminated in favor of a traditional dormer such as on the north.

- 5. Pitches of the dormer and rooflines should be consistent.
- 6. In general, simplify all details for consistency.

Staff Recommendation: Conceptual Approval with staff comments.

15. 2 Council Street - - TMS # 457-11-04-028 APP. NO. 2105-13-15

Request conceptual approval for a second floor addition without change to footprint.

Category 3 (Charlestowne) c. Old and Historic District

Owner: Charleston Properties-Tradd LLC

Applicant: Tommy Manuel

Withdrawn By Staff
