

BOARD MEMBERS PRESENT: GLEN GARDNER, BILL HUEY, JULIA MARTIN, FILLMORE WILSON, LINDSAY VAN SLAMBROOK
STAFF PRESENT: KIM HLAVIN



RESULTS
BOARD OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW-SMALL

June 10, 2021 4:30 P.M. "virtually via Zoom Webinar"

1. **158 Darlington Avenue - - TMS # 463-08-01-087** **BAR2021-000517**

Requesting after-the-fact final approval for the demolition of historic elements including windows, trim, siding, porch decking, bead-board ceiling, and balustrade.

Category 4 (Wagner Terrace) c. 1938 Historic Materials Demo Purview

Owner: Craig Swzekie
Applicant: Michael Loveday

MOTION: Denial of after-the-fact demolition with Staff comments.

MADE BY: MARTIN SECOND: HUEY VOTE: FOR 5 AGAINST 0

Staff Comments:

1. Windows should be wood, true-divided light, two-over-two windows.
2. Siding should be replaced with the 4" clapboard wood that was originally there.
3. The tongue and groove porch decking should be restored, along with a bead-board ceiling.
4. A set of architectural drawings by a qualified architect should be provided to the BAR, detailing each of these issues and how they will be replaced.
5. A stop-work order should remain in place until a new permit is issued by the BAR with proper documentation of the restoration.
6. Per zoning ordinance, plywood should temporarily cover the openings.

Staff Recommendation: Denial of after-the-fact demolition.

2. **2337 Sunnyside Avenue - - TMS # 463-07-00-003** **BAR2021-000528**

Request extension of approval for complete demolition, as previously granted in 2016.

Not Rated (Wagner Terrace) c. 1945 Historic Materials Demo Purview

Owner: Daniel Atwill
Applicant: AJ Architects

MOTION: Approval.

MADE BY: GARDNER SECOND: MARTIN VOTE: FOR 5 AGAINST 0

3. **284 King Street - - TMS # 457-04-04-043** **BAR2021-000539**

Request extension of final approval for partial demolition of rear additions, as previously granted on 9/14/2017.

Category 4 (none) c. pre-1884; c. 1950 Old and Historic District

Owner: King & Society, LLC/ Troy Barber
Applicant: Neil Stevenson Architects/Tara Romano

MOTION: Approval.

MADE BY: MARTIN SECOND: GARDNER VOTE: FOR 5 AGAINST 0

4. **26 Montagu Street - - TMS # 457-03-02-047** **BAR2021-000530**

Request conceptual approval for rear addition to existing house, and the new construction of secondary building at rear.

Category 3 (Harleston Village) c. 1820 Old and Historic District
Owner: Rachel and Paul Alexander Crystal
Applicant: Becky Fenno

MOTION: Deferral with Staff comments 1,2,3; and Board comments to restudy footprint and geometry of rear dependency to be more narrow, more vertical proportionally; and to consider unification of historic fenestration.

MADE BY: MARTIN SECOND: HUEY VOTE: FOR 5 AGAINST 0

Staff Comments:

1. The removal of the disorderly and insensitive additions is a positive change.
2. The rooflines of what is proposed to remain are somewhat confusing to begin with, but a refinement of these intersections should be studied. (perhaps a deeper elevator recess and a separation of rooflines)
3. The HVAC location should be restudied in light of the major renovation.
4. The rear building is appropriately sized n height, scale, mass and general architectural direction; we appreciate the simple design.
5. With some kitchen layout modifications, coordinating fenestration could be achieved and the windows on the south elevation could be enlarged.
6. The window in the stairwell should be restudied, for its size, location and to eliminate trim between windows in favor of a mulled window.
7. Use brackets or some support under shed roof at entry.
8. A single pedestrian door is preferred, centered under the window above.
9. Fenestration in general should have a more centered and vertical rhythm.
10. Although it will not be visible, the north elevation should be refined.
11. Rear doors should employ an awning or weather protection above doors, and to provide interest and protection.
12. Mulled windows should be modified or separated.

Staff Recommendation: Conceptual approval with staff comments.

5. **40.5 State Street - - TMS # 458-09-01-187** **BAR2021-000531**

Request final approval for modifications including replacement of non-historic door, and two new iron gates.

Category 2 (French Quarter) c. 1815 Old and Historic District
Owner: Rebecca Stinson
Applicant: Patrick Lisi – The Village Company

MOTION: Approval for rear gate as submitted with encouragement to powder coat or rustproof prior to painting; remove the top arch off front gate in the submitted design; and scrollwork to closely mimic existing gate.

MADE BY: GARDNER SECOND: MARTIN VOTE: FOR 5 AGAINST 0

Staff Comments:

1. The design of the front gate should relate to the neighboring gate and nearly replicate it, with a flat top rail, similar scroll work, and lattice hatch below at the same height.

Staff Recommendation: Conceptual Approval with Staff comments and final review by Staff.

6. **15 Franklin Street - - TMS # 460-05-03-004** **BAR2021-000532**

Request final approval to replace iron fence with masonry wall.

Category 3 (Harleston Village) c. 1850 Old and Historic District
Owner: Jill Davidge
Applicant: Andrew Hargett

DEFERRED BY APPLICANT

7. **116 Queen Street - - TMS # 4570804074** **BAR2021-000534**

Request modifications to fenestration, rear addition, and removal of piazza enclosure on second floor.

Category 3 (Harleston Village) c. 1880 Old and Historic District
Owner: Patrick and Nora Burke
Applicant: Julie O'Connor – American Vernacular

WITHDRAWN FOR STAFF REVIEW

8. **24 Limehouse Street - - TMS # 457-11-04-043** **BAR2021-000535**

Request conceptual approval for removal of non-historic deck; new construction of one-story addition, covered porch, and raised patios; modifications to porch including steps and railings; new garden wall, gate, pool, and hardscape; and elevation of garage.

Not Rated (Charlestowne) c. 1912 Old and Historic District
Owner: William C. & Tamera Dengler
Applicant: Julie O'Connor – American Vernacular

MOTION: Conceptual approval with Staff comments 1-5; further differentiate details at addition; restudy gate in design and functionality; and final details to Staff.

MADE BY: MARTIN SECOND: WILSON VOTE: FOR 5 AGAINST 0

Staff Comments:

1. The proposal at the rear simplifies previous insensitive modifications, which is positive.
2. The scale of windows on the south elevation should be more closely related to the house.
3. The railing should remain brick if it is original or historic.
4. The scale of the chimney is out of proportion with the house; restudy the proportion to decrease the size—side-by-side fireboxes, perhaps?
5. The masonry wall requires further information but should be retained if original fabric.
6. The garage is being made functional which is a positive, but we would recommend a restudy of the stair arrangement. Retain the utilitarian nature in general, but perhaps reduce the footprint with a smaller switchback, and address the foundation.

Staff Recommendation: Conceptual approval with Staff Comments and final review by Staff

9. **183 Queen Street - - TMS # 457-12-01-001** **BAR2021-000536**

Request conceptual approval for exterior renovation including the demolition of chimney, and exterior stairs; and modifications to fenestration, and HVAC screening.

Not Rated (Harleston Village) c. 1880 Old and Historic District
Owner: Carol Stewart, Melissa and Jeff Vandewiel
Applicant: Clark Ferguson Architect

WITHDRAWN FOR STAFF REVIEW

10. **45 South Street - - TMS # 459-09-03-078** **BAR2021-000537**

Request conceptual approval for new construction of single-family residence.

New Construction (East Side) Old City District
Owner: Toni and Henry Johnson
Applicant: Kenny Craft - Craft Design Studio

MOTION: Deferral with Staff comments 1,3,4,5; Board comments to restudy parking to move understructure parking away from street; and restudy pedestrian entry to make it more prominent.

MADE BY: MARTIN SECOND: GARDNER VOTE: FOR 4 AGAINST 1
WILSON against

Staff Comments:

1. The design is appropriate in height, scale, mass; but staff have some design modifications to recommend.
2. Per code, the current DFE sits at 16-feet but should be at 12-feet, and therefore should be reduced by four feet.
3. The arched opening at the facade is inappropriate for the context of the street, and a traditional Charleston Single House; replace with recessed niches or smooth stucco.
4. The fenestration arrangement on the south elevation is excessive and chaotic; should be greatly reduced in quantity, and simplified to single windows of the same size.
5. The siding on the hyphen of the south elevation should continue to match the neighboring volumes.

Staff Recommendation: Deferral with Staff comments noted.

11. **12 Montagu Street - - TMS # 457-04-01-085** **BAR2021-000538**

Request conceptual approval for alterations to existing guest house.
 Category 2 (Harleston Village) c. 1812 Old and Historic District
 Owner: Eric Jablon
 Applicant: Beau Clowney Architects – Justin Ferrick

MOTION: Conceptual approval with final review by staff.

MADE BY: HUEY SECOND: MARTIN VOTE: FOR 5 AGAINST 0

Staff Comments:

1. The proposed alterations to the modern guest house are minimally visible and are appropriate.

Staff Recommendation: Conceptual approval with details of stucco wall to be provided to staff and final review by staff.

12. **1 Percy Street - - TMS # 460-08-03-155** **BAR2021-000541**

Request conceptual approval for removal of non-historic rear stair, ramp; and the new construction of side stair, piazza stair, and rear addition.
 Category 3 (Cannonborough / Elliottborough) c. 1880 Old City District
 Owner: Heather and Will Greene
 Applicant: Cameron Glaws

WITHDRAWN BY STAFF

13. **Adoption of Board Policy Statement concerning Solar Collectors**

MOTION: Deferral for Board and community input; and to bring the draft back for a later date.

MADE BY: GARDNER SECOND: MARTIN VOTE: FOR 5 AGAINST 0