



CITY OF CHARLESTON BOARD OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW - SMALL

MEETING RESULTS

AUGUST 11, 2022

4:30 P.M.

2 GEORGE STREET

BOARD MEMBERS PRESENT: Van Slambrook, Huey, Wilson, Martin, Gardner

STAFF MEMBERS PRESENT: Pinto, Bennett, Gordineer

A. MINUTES

1. APPROVAL OF MINUTES FROM JULY 28, 2022 MEETING

APPROVED

~~WITHDRAWN~~

~~DENY~~

~~DEFERRED~~

MOTION: Approved

MADE BY: Wilson SECOND: Huey VOTE: FOR 5 AGAINST 0

B. APPLICATIONS

1. 51 POINSETT STREET

TMS # 463-12-03-018 | BAR2022-000874

NS | North Central | c. 1915 | Historic Material Demolition Purview

Request partial demolition of historic structure. Site visit 8:30 am.

Owner: Mencer D Edwards

Applicant: April Magill, Root Down Designs LLC

NOTES: **Deferred by Applicant**

2. 119 – 121 BROAD STREET

TMS # 457-12-04-009 | BAR2021-000663

Category 2 | Charlestowne | c. 1803 | Old and Historic District

Request conceptual approval for new two-story guest-house, pool, and pergola.

Owner: MCCURU Properties

Applicant: Neil Stevenson Architects, Neil Stevenson (speaker)

~~APPROVED~~

~~WITHDRAWN~~

~~DENY~~

DEFERRED

MOTION: Deferral with staff comments 1 - 6 with Board clarifications

MADE BY: Martin SECOND: Wilson VOTE: FOR 4 AGAINST 1
OPPOSED: Huey

BOARD Clarifications:

(2) If it is to be stucco, must be stucco on masonry

(3-4) Details more in keeping with property, reduce pool house to 1 ½ stories, restudy height to ensure compliance with ordinance

(5-6) Reduction of overall height of pergola, and detailing of garden structure

NOTES:

- Stucco on wood frame on guest house, masonry on pergola
- Questions ceiling height
- Finished floor elevations, in flood zone but at DFE
- HVAC and pool equipment inside structure
- Roof – galvanized aluminum, hand crimped ridge

- Landscape plan – were columns/gate moved?
- Chuck Baker, speaking for Marty and Shawn Mullin and other neighbors
 - Applicant appeal of Board decision still pending
 - Do not oppose pool & pool house, oppose scale
 - Is the size of 121 Broad
 - Oppose height/scale/mass
 - Another guest room not needed
 - Pool complex is too large, biggest residential pool on Broad Street
- Letter from Carrie Agnew, 52 Legare
 - Appears to be a house, larger than own
 - Proper screening of equipment
 - Request landscape buffer
 - Want parking reduced
 - Fountain – commercial scale
- Larry Wetzles, 50 ½ Legare, read comments from neighbors
 - Draws unwanted attention to site
 - Unreasonable size
 - Want vegetative screening
- Therese Smyth, neighborhood board of architectural review
 - Request denial
 - Object to height/scale/mass
 - Sits at beginning of neighborhood
 - Pergola too large/dense
- PSC
 - Think there have been positive revisions
 - Support neighbors. overly complex, should remove pergola and have one story pool house
 - New construction should be compatible but differentiated
 - Should defer to existing
- Restudy, use masonry with stucco
- Size of property is unique to Charleston
- dramatic improvement, architectural direction is good, properly differentiated
- East fenestration needs work
- Pergola needs restudy
- Zoning issue, floor height is too tall
- Double porch makes it seem more grand
- Could easily have guestroom with 1 ½ story structure, too tall
- Details in between, stucco on frame has no detail/depth
- Flat roof is problematic
- Pergola - folly like, too elaborate, could be wall or similar, more diminutive
- Could to vault for pool equipment, need details
- Louvered screening for pergola windows
- Will read with fair amount of mass at 16' tall, needs detailing
- Ordinance will reduce height by 2'

Staff Comments:

Guest-house:

1. Fenestration patterns should be simplified, currently it is very busy.
2. Are the new structures stucco on masonry or frame? The elevation says on masonry, section shows on frame. If it is stucco on frame the control joints should be shown.
3. On the east elevation the windows are out of scale for the building and appear to exceed floor to ceiling height in reference to the porch. Overall, the structure is very balanced and symmetrical with the exception of the east wall. Staff recommend mimicking the window size on the west elevation and matching the fenestration patterns.
4. No roof plan was included, staff is concerned about drainage on the flat roof over the porch.

Pergola:

5. Staff recommend restudying the architectural direction of the pergola. Details should be refined to be more classical, similar to the proposed guest house and existing main house, which are more high style.
6. Detailing the apertures on the front elevation with windowsills or trim would give a more classical direction.

Staff Recommendation: Conceptual approval with staff comments and final review by staff

3. 96 ASHLEY AVENUE

TMS # 457-03-04-073 | BAR2022-000860

Category 2 | Harleston Village | c. 1800 | Old and Historic District

After the fact request. Request conceptual approval to rebuild piazza stair, replace piazza screening, add hood over entrance, pedestrian and driveway gates, and hardscaping.

Owner: William Cromer & Dang Minh Nguyen
Applicant: Neil Stevenson

NOTES: **Deferred by Staff**

4. 235 MEETING STREET

TMS # 457-08-01-012 | BAR2022-000858

Category 3 | c. pre 1884 | Old and Historic District

Request conceptual approval for storefront alterations, move entrance from center bay to left bay at store front, install lights at entry, add decorative screens between front bays.

Owner: Sticky Charleston LLC, Chad Waldorf
Applicant: Neil Stevenson

NOTES: **Deferred by Staff**

5. 117 BROAD STREET & 17 ORANGE STREET

TMS # 457-12-04-009 | BAR2022-000836

Category 3 | Charlestowne | c. 1770 | Old and Historic District

Request conceptual approval to shift driveway entrance, establish new driveway gate for 17 Orange Street.

Owner: Governors House Inn LLC
Applicant: Glen Gardner, Landscape Architect

NOTES: **Deferred by Applicant**

6. 182 TRADD STREET

TMS # 457-07-04-019 | BAR2020-000390

Category 4 | Charlestowne | c. 1920 | Old and Historic District

After the fact request. Request approval for alterations to previous final approval, hardscaping improvements including new rear fence and wall, gates, bluestone paving, trellis, and fence at front; and modifications to rear of building including new brick stair (REVISED); rear door with sidelights, and modification of window openings.

Owner: Gordon Manor
Applicant: Elizabeth Pope (speaker)

APPROVED

~~WITHDRAWN~~

~~DENY~~

~~DEFERRED~~

MOTION: Conceptual approval with staff comments 2 – 7, Board Conditions, and final review by staff

MADE BY: Martin SECOND: Gardner VOTE: FOR 5 AGAINST 0

BOARD CONDITION:

- Screening under accessory structure it so be vertical
- Unapproved work at rear porch must be removed
- Painting brick is acceptable, color to be reviewed by staff

NOTES:

- Accessory structure has poured concrete piers
- Brick to be painted to match house (house brick is already painted)
- Accessory underpinning – should be vertical, painted
- HVAC - paint to match, continue siding to ground

Staff Comments:

Rear porch:

2. Staff has no opposition to the proposed changes to the railing.
3. Current alterations must be removed for propose to be constructed.

4. Applicant to coordinate with staff for BAR inspection when newly constructed deck has been removed.
Fence:
 5. Staff has no opposition to the proposed changes to the fence.
Accessory structure siding:
 6. Provide details for the proposed siding, however, per BAR policy, *no "beachy" style horizontal slats or stock lattice will be approved.*
HVAC stand:
 7. Stand should be painted to match house; base and screening should be painted to match siding, stand legs should be painted dark to match base of house.
- Staff Recommendation: Deferral for drawings to be updated with siding details and for staff inspection to confirm unpermitted / unapproved construction is removed.
-

7. 186 SAINT PHILIP STREET

TMS # 460-12-02-064 | BAR2022-000789

New | Cannonborough - Elliottborough | Old City District

Request preliminary approval for new, three-story, mixed-use building.

Owner: Ottoman Investments
Applicant: Ashley Jennings, AJ Architect (speaker)
Colin Colberg (speaker)

APPROVED

~~WITHDRAWN~~

~~DENY~~

~~DEFERRED~~

MOTION: Preliminary approval subject to Board review of mock up with final review by staff.

MADE BY: Martin SECOND: Gardner VOTE: FOR 5 AGAINST 0

NOTES:

- Cornice brick is body color of Savannah gray brick
 - Questions about stucco band purpose/ location
 - Need mockup – show joint, mortar color that works with brick
 - Cornice and field brick
 - Color study
-

8. 169 WENTWORTH AVENUE

TMS # 457-03-04-012 | BAR2022-000856

Category 4 | Harleston Village | c. pre-1944 | Old and Historic District

Request conceptual approval for new accessory structure.

Owner: Cope and Sophie Willis
Applicant: E E Fava Architects, Michael Strople (speaker)

APPROVED

~~WITHDRAWN~~

~~DENY~~

~~DEFERRED~~

MOTION: Final approval with final review by staff and Board Condition

MADE BY: Martin SECOND: Huey VOTE: FOR 4 AGAINST 0
Recused: Gardner

BOARD CONDITIONS:

- Confirm required height of chimney for code compliance

NOTES:

- Goal is for structure to be flush rainscreen system
 - Code compliance issue for chimney height, if height changes would be subject to re-review
-

9. 178 ASHLEY AVENUE

TMS # 460-15-02-109 | BAR2022-000875

Category 1 | Radcliffeborough | c. 1850 | Old and Historic District

Requesting conceptual approval for rehabilitation of historic structure and small additions at rear to previously modified non-historic additions.

Owner: MUSC Health Sciences Foundation

Applicant: E E Fava Architects, Joel Trantham (speaker)

APPROVED

~~WITHDRAWN~~

~~DENY~~

~~DEFERRED~~

MOTION: Conceptual approval with Board Condition and final review by staff

MADE BY: Martin SECOND: Huey VOTE: FOR 5 AGAINST 0

BOARD CONDITION:

- Document north porch roofline

NOTES:

- ABS water & moisture intrusion – consultants
- Taking care of building just in time, appreciate efforts
- North side porch is missing swoop, should be documented

10. 155 TRADD STREET

TMS # 457-11-04-032 | BAR2022-000876

Category 3 | Charlestowne | c. 1900 | Old and Historic District

Request conceptual approval for partial enclosure at rear of piazza.

Owner: David Hallman

Applicant: David Foster

~~APPROVED~~

~~WITHDRAWN~~

~~DENY~~

DEFERRED

MOTION: Deferral

MADE BY: Gardner SECOND: Wilson VOTE: FOR 5 AGAINST 0

NOTES:

- Applicant not in attendance

11. 31 ROSE LANE

TMS # 460-08-01-125 | BAR2022-000841

Category 4 | Cannonborough - Elliottborough | c. 1852 | Old City District

Request conceptual approval for renovation of existing historic house, new addition, and new garage at rear.

Owner: Harrison Malpass

Applicant: Sebastian von Marschall Architect, LLC (speaker)

APPROVED

~~WITHDRAWN~~

~~DENY~~

~~DEFERRED~~

MOTION: Conceptual approval for renovation of existing house, new addition, and new garage with staff comments 1 – 2, Board Conditions, and final review by staff

MADE BY: Martin SECOND: Gardner VOTE: FOR 5 AGAINST 0

BOARD CONDITIONS:

- Simplify roofline at connector elements
- Reinstate balustrade at piazza
- Clarify all proposed siding
- Decrease mass of dormers on garage

NOTES:

- Same siding - clapboard, shiplap, clapboard
- Beth Fraiser, 32 Rose Ln
 - Questions lack of balustrade on first floor
 - Concerned about garage double dormers, looks boxy
- PSC
 - Full support for rehab
 - Questions response to Board's previous motion of denial
- Garage set back, shouldn't read as boxy like in elevation
- Argue description of "hyphen", not applicable in this area
- Each side elevation will be exposed due to location, adjacent lot is vacant
- Redefine "hyphen", geometry very complex
- Ordinance issue with 3' setback?
- Complicated massing, questions about visibility as proposed, steps back
- Bottom balustrade was there recently, would like to see returned
- Existing form reasonable respected, height/scale/mass acceptable
- Question of resizing "French doors"
- Size of dormers, feels wide

12. 47 CHURCH STREET

TMS # 458-13-01-025 | BAR2022-000850

Category 3 | Charlestowne | c. 1767 | Old and Historic District

Request conceptual approval for rear portico.

Owner: Harrison Malpass

Applicant: Sebastian von Marschall Architect, LLC (speaker)

APPROVED

~~WITHDRAWN~~

~~DENY~~

~~DEFERRED~~

MOTION: Final approval

MADE BY: Huey SECOND: Martin VOTE: FOR 4 AGAINST 0
Recused: Gardner

13. 492 KING STREET

TMS # 460-12-02-025 | BAR2022-000877

Category 3 | Mazyck-Wraggborough | c.1852-60 | Old and Historic District

Request alterations to previous conceptual approval (April 2021) extension of rooftop awning, add door at back of courtyard.

Owner: Casamigs

Applicant: Pasta Beach / Simons Young + associates
Simons Young (speaker)

APPROVED

~~WITHDRAWN~~

~~DENY~~

~~DEFERRED~~

MOTION: Final approval

MADE BY: Gardner SECOND: Martin VOTE: FOR 5 AGAINST 0

NOTES:

- Request they clean weathered boards
- Ties in nicely

14. 86 MURRAY BOULEVARD

TMS # 457-11-01-005 | BAR2022-878

NR | Charlestowne | c. 1941 | Old and Historic District

Request conceptual approval for new front windows changing proportions, new dormers on front, new doors at balcony, and new fenestration at third floor.

Owner: Colin Coletti and Clair Schwartz

Applicant: Julie O'Connor, American Vernacular Inc
Salt Marsh (speaker)

APPROVED

WITHDRAWN

~~DENY~~

DEFERRED

MOTION: Deferral for restudy with Board Conditions

MADE BY: Gardner SECOND: Wilson VOTE: FOR 5 AGAINST 0

BOARD CONDITION:

- Clarification of effects flood zone to ground level
- Alterations on historic portions of building,
- Verify age and material of all windows and doors where changes are requested

NOTES:

- Added staff comment #6, proportions of windows should not be changed
- HCF - Original size of windows should be respected
- PSC – ask that scope be minimized, restricted
- Change in windows, asking to lower sills 9”
- Window survey should be done to determine which windows are original
- Issue with changing original window sizes
- No compelling reason to change dormers (front)
- Staff could not verify age past 1941
- Not rated structure, but of that age
- Lowering first floor window sills could compromise flood issue
- Some flexibility on rear is appropriate
- Fenestration survey
- Clarify flood scenario

15. PRESENTATION BY STAFF ON THE STATUS OF ORDINANCE CHANGES AND POLICY PROPOSALS AFFECTING BOARD OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW RELATED REVIEWS.
