

BOARD MEMBERS PRESENT: BILL HUEY, GLEN GARDNER, FILLMORE WILSON,
LINDSAY VANSLAMBROOK
STAFF PRESENT: KIM HLAVIN



RESULTS
BOARD OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW-SMALL

August 12, 2021 4:30 P.M. "virtually via Zoom Webinar"

1. **115 Wentworth Street - - TMS # 457-04-03-058** **BAR2021-000577**

Request final approval for complete demolition of building.
Not Rated (Harleston Village) c. 1950 Old and Historic District
Owner: Grace Church Cathedral
Applicant: Simons Young

MOTION: Deferral; for submittal of a site plan with hardscaping proposal at a later date.

MADE BY: GARDNER SECOND: WILSON VOTE: FOR 4 AGAINST 0

Staff Comments:

1. While a vacant lot in a neighborhood is not ideal, this building has some fatal issues that the applicant has outlined, and modern day code and health concerns overshadow our opposition to the demolition of historic buildings as a general principal.
2. The criteria for considering demolition is fairly clear, to look at structural quality, materials, and weather it has inherent historic integrity and value in the context of the neighborhood and contributing to the City itself.
3. In light of all this, we feel it has tipped the scale and are in support of the demolition.
4. The property is in AE(10) flood zone, and it is pretty near to 10' at the curb, therefore, any new construction would be (+/-) two feet above the sidewalk. All of the neighboring buildings (except for the 1970s apartments) have elevated foundations; some of which are around five feet above the sidewalk. We are not concerned with a new building being out-of-context.

Staff Recommendation: Final Approval

2. **115. 5 Wentworth Street - - TMS # 457-04-03-059** **BAR2021-000576**

Request final approval for the removal of non-original brick veneer.
Not Rated (Harleston Village) c. Old and Historic District
Owner: Grace Church Cathedral
Applicant: Simons Young

MOTION: Final approval of the removal of the 1950 brick veneer, with staff comment; and to resubmit the proposal for the joint condition proposal if building 115 Wentworth is to be retained.

MADE BY: HUEY SECOND: GLEN VOTE: FOR 4 AGAINST 0

Staff Comments:

1. It is clear that the brick veneer of this building is neither secure, original; in fact it obscures the original veneer, and is contributing to an accelerated deterioration.

Staff Recommendation: Final Approval

3. 109 Rutledge Avenue - - TMS # 457-03-01-103 BAR2021-000578

Request conceptual approval for renovations to historic building.

Category 3 (Harleston Village) c. 1852 Old District
Owner: 109 Rutledge Avenue LLC
Applicant: AJ Architects

MOTION: Conceptual approval with staff comments; Board comment for a staff site visit with the architect upon completion of selective demolition to verify accuracy of presumptions and final review by staff.

MADE BY: GARNDER SECOND: HUEY VOTE: FOR 4 AGAINST 0

1. In efforts to return the building to its original design, it would be best to reduce the number of extraneous French doors on piazza by replacing with double hung windows.

These locations are on the south elevation at:

- a. Second bay on the first floor (kitchen);
- b. The second bay on the second floor (into the living room);
- c. The first and second bays on the third floor if visible.

While we realize some of these doors might be older, they likely coincided with the alterations to the building post 1967, when the building was made into apartments. In addition, the 1967 Sanborn map depicts the third floor but not a third piazza so perhaps some extra sleuthing or conceding to French doors here is appropriate. We feel we can sort those details with Ms. Jennings.

2. Use an historically appropriate mortar mix to repair stucco and chimney, and note it on the drawings for final review.

Staff Recommendation: Final Approval with staff comments and final review by staff.

4. 19 Logan Street - - TMS # 457-12-03-085 BAR2021-000575

Request conceptual approval for addition on rear and renovation including the demolition of steps and mechanical platform.

Category 4 (Harleston Village) c. 1870 Old and Historic District
Owner: Karl Riner
Applicant: AJ Architects

MOTION: Conceptual approval with staff comments and final details to staff.

MADE BY: HUEY SECOND: WILSON VOTE: FOR 4 AGAINST 0

Staff Comments:

1. The preservation staff have studied the proposal and we realize that the lot is quite small and has very little space for expansion; therefore the siting of the addition is appropriate.
2. A relocation of the HVAC unit would be ideal to remove it from public view.
3. We would suggest using a low sloping roof in lieu of the gable.

Staff Recommendation: Final approval with staff comment; and final details to staff.

5. **1 Percy Street - - TMS # 460-08-03-155** **BAR2021-000541**

Requesting conceptual approval for modifications including removal of rear stair and ramp, and new construction of rear addition, and circular stair onto piazza.

Category 4 (Cannonborough/Elliottborough) c. 1898 Old City District
Owner: Heather and Will Greene
Applicant: Cameron Glaws

MOTION: Denial for stair; and restudy of addition for general architectural direction, staff comments; and Board comment to ensure graphic quality represents the true intent of construction.

MADE BY: HUEY SECOND: WILSON VOTE: FOR 4 AGAINST 0

Staff Comments:

1. According to the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation, removing historic fabric is discouraged. Charleston’s iconic element is the piazza and therefore deserves to retain its integrity with an unbroken balustrade. The preservation staff feel that the piazza stair is not appropriate in either location. While there are many sets of stairs in piazzas, many of these were constructed prior to the adoption of the neighborhood to the purview of the BAR.
2. The siting of the addition would be better suited behind the primary building of the house, but is not extremely visible.
3. The second set of stairs is not necessary as there is only one unit in this building. Just as a reminder to the applicant, inspectors can issue stop-work orders when work scope approved is exceeded. The second kitchen/unit has not been approved per zoning staff members.

Staff Recommendation: Denial for stair, restudy of addition for general architectural direction.

6. **23 Reid Street - - TMS # 459-09-03-030** **BAR2021-000389**

Requesting preliminary approval for new construction of a single-family residence.

New Construction (East Side) Old City District
Owner: Dawn Limberg
Applicant: Clay Shackelford Architect

MOTION: Preliminary approval with staff comment number two; and final details to staff.

MADE BY: HUEY SECOND: GARDNER VOTE: FOR 4 AGAINST 0

Staff Comments:

1. The applicant has addressed all of the Board’s previous comments from the May 27th meeting with the exception of the comment to readdress the junction of the piazza from the rear mass. The staff continue to request that that mass be further recessed in the plane of the primary volume so that the primary volume reads as such.
2. We continue our concern with the vertical transition of the brick to stucco wall plane. Traditionally, stucco would have been applied on top of the brick, and would result in a plane that is proud of the brick. With this modern construction, you are able to align these planes. Although I am slightly concerned with the appearance of this false construction method, the edge should be defined by a row lock, or stucco band. It may be as simple as using the 10” CMU and adding the brick or brick veneer and a chamfered or sloped brick to the top course. That said, perhaps the solution is to reverse the envelope material and have a stucco foundation with a brick body, which is historically more traditional.

Staff Recommendation: Preliminary Approval with staff comments and final details to staff.

7. **49 South Battery - - TMS # 457-16-03-020**

BAR2021-000574

Request final approval for slate roof replacement in like-kind.

Category 2 (Charlestowne) c. 1795 Old and Historic District

Owner: Marcia Schiller

Applicant: Picquet Roofing, Inc.

MOTION: Deferral for lack of applicant

MADE BY: HUEY SECOND: WILSON VOTE: FOR 4 AGAINST 0



Lindsay Van Slambrook, chairwoman

8/17/2021

date



Kim Hlavin, BAR-S Administrator

August 17, 2021

date