



AGENDA
BOARD OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW-SMALL

September 9, 2021 4:30 P.M. "virtually via Zoom Webinar"

1. **12 King Street - - TMS # 457-16-02-065** **BAR2021-000591**

Request conceptual approval for modifications to front (west) elevation, including removal of brick veneer; construction of one-story porch; and reconfiguration of entry stair.

Category 4 (Charlestowne) c. 1897 Old and Historic District

Owner: Gordon and Bonnie Geer

Applicant: David W. Richards

DEFERRED BY APPLICANT

2. **175½ Wentworth Street - - TMS # 457-03-030063** **BAR2021-000592**

Request conceptual approval to replace terne metal roof with architectural shingles.

Category 3 (Harleston Village) c. 1887 Old District

Owner: Lynda Benjamin

Applicant: Scott Benjamin

MOTION: Deferral as denial with staff comments.

MADE BY: MARTIN SECOND: GARDNER VOTE: FOR 5 AGAINST 0

Staff Comments:

1. The historic terne metal roof should be repaired as necessary, rather than replaced, as stated in the Charleston Principals and Secretary of the Interior's Standards. Repairing the roof is the best option to preserve the historic integrity of the building.
2. A replacement in like-kind would be suitable in the case that the roof is found irreparable.
3. Asphalt shingles are not an appropriate replacement material in the historic districts of Charleston.

Staff Recommendation: Denial for architectural shingles.

3. **48 Bull Street - - TMS # 457-03-02-028** **BAR2021-000432**

Request conceptual approval for four single-family residential units.

Category 3 (Harleston Village) c. 1848 Old and Historic District

Owner: Dr. Michael Ammon

Applicant: Robbie Marty

DEFERRED BY APPLICANT

4. **7 Smith Street - - TMS # 457-08-03-077** **BAR2021-000567**

Request conceptual approval for a new two-story addition to rear.
Not Rated (Harleston Village) c. 1940 Old and Historic District
Owner: John and Elizabeth Rhoads
Applicant: Guv Gottshalk

MOTION: Conceptual approval with two board comments: for the roof to be a hipped roof to eliminate the pork chop return, and a plan showing the extent hardscaping and landscaping be provided for next review.

MADE BY: HUEY SECOND: MARTIN VOTE: FOR 5 AGAINST 0

Staff Comments:
1. The Board’s motion from July 22, was for the addition to “... be recessed in plan from the sidewall of the existing house”. The addition is inadequately recessed as it remains extended beyond the plane of the existing house.

Staff Recommendation: Deferral for restudy.

5. **283 East Bay Street - - TMS # 458-05-01-160** **BAR2021-000593**

Request final approval for wholesale window replacement.
Category 2 (Ansonborough) c. 1840 Old and Historic District
Owner: JD Sullivan
Applicant: Grace Chapin/Renew Urban

MOTION: Deferral for further details; and final review by staff with staff comment provided.

MADE BY: MARTIN SECOND: WILSON VOTE: FOR 4 AGAINST 0
HUEY recused

6. **515 East Bay Street - - TMS # 459-13-02-016** **BAR2021-000590**

Request final approval for after-the-fact stucco application onto existing brick building.
Not Rated (Mazyck-Wraggborough) c. 1958 Old City District
Owner: NCGS Investments
Applicant: Jonathan Colarusso

MOTION: Denial of the after-the-fact application with removal of the unapproved stucco to expose the original brick; with samples or test areas to be performed for review with BAR staff

MADE BY: GARDNER SECOND: MARTIN VOTE: FOR 5 AGAINST 0

Staff Comments:
1. As per the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards, we generally discourage the application of stucco to historic brick, and this instance would have been no different. Remove the stucco, if possible to do so without damaging the brick.

Staff Recommendation: Denial of after-the-fact application of stucco.

7. **1 Percy Street - - TMS # 460-08-03-155** **BAR2021-000541**

Request conceptual approval for previously-existing internal piazza stair; and rear addition.
Category 4 (Cannonborough/Elliottborough) c. 1898 Old City District
Owner: Heather and Will Greene
Applicant: Cameron Glaws

MOTION: Denial on stair; and deferral of the addition for graphic clarification; with final review by staff.

MADE BY: MARTIN SECOND: WILSON VOTE: FOR 5 AGAINST 0

Staff Comments:

1. According to the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, removing historic fabric is discouraged. Charleston's iconic element is the piazza and therefore deserves to retain its integrity. The preservation staff feel that the piazza stair is not appropriate. While there are many sets of stairs in piazzas, most were constructed prior to BAR purview.
2. A second kitchen/unit is not approved by the zoning department, and so at this moment, the stairs are not a code requirement. If they were to become required, we would suggest that they be located in the rear where most recently located.
3. The Board deferred the rear addition on August 12 for restudy of general architectural direction, no changes have been made to follow the Board's directive, and we recommend deferral.

Staff Recommendation: Denial for stair, restudy of addition for general architectural direction.

8. **91 Spring Street - - TMS # 460-08-03-067** **BAR2021-000594**

Request conceptual approval for renovation including new dormers and window relocation.
Category 3 (Cannonborough) c. 1885 Old City District
Owner: 91 Spring, LLC
Applicant: Eddie Bello

MOTION: Conceptual approval with final review by staff, with Board comment that ridge point of the dormers be lowered such as they are subordinate to the main roof line.

MADE BY: HUEY SECOND: MARTIN VOTE: FOR 5 AGAINST 0

Staff Comments:

1. The proposed alterations are acceptable and supported by the Preservation staff.

Staff Recommendation: Conceptual approval with final review by staff.

9. **91 Spring Street - - TMS # 460-08-03-067** **BAR2021-000595**

Request conceptual approval for the new construction of two (2) new one and two-family units in rear.
Category 3 (Cannonborough) c. 1885 Old City District
Owner: 91 Spring, LLC
Applicant: Eddie Bello

MOTION: Conceptual approval of both with final review by staff of building one; and Board comment to refine proportions and details of building two; with staff comments 1, and 5.

MADE BY: MARTIN SECOND: HUEY VOTE: FOR 5 AGAINST 0

Staff Comments:

1. Staff is pleased with building One. It is subordinate yet relatable to the primary building. We support the design. The plans detail the information to sufficiently review at the final level thus; we recommend conceptual approval with final details to staff of Building One.
2. Building Two is conceptually appropriate, however, we have a few design concerns.
3. The west-facing wing presents like an enclosed piazza and the preservation staff would prefer to see the element detailed differently so it does not read as such.
4. The east-facing element is interesting and staff are not opposed to the concept of this entryway, but we feel that the contrast of these opposing wings could be restructured, and the width narrowed slightly.
5. Coordinate the design of the east and west-facing elements for a more cohesive design (low-slope roof, siding, fenestration, volumetric proportions, width, etc.)

Staff Recommendation: Conceptual approval with staff comments noted, and final review by staff.

10. 93 Spring Street - - TMS # 460-08-03-188 BAR2021-000596

Request conceptual approval for a two-story addition to the rear of historic building.
 Category 4 (Cannonborough) c. 1910 Old City District
 Owner: 91 Spring, LLC
 Applicant: Eddie Bello

MOTION: Conceptual approval with final review by staff.

MADE BY: MARTIN SECOND: WILSON VOTE: FOR 5 AGAINST 0

Staff Comments:

1. Staff are in support of the sensitive addition, which is subordinate and differentiated. The use of the recess element clearly defines this portion as a new building campaign. We also commend the applicant for removing hardware from the east side of the building.
2. Normally, we would request that the windows remain in place without relocation, but this change is minor, far from view, partially concealed by the chimney and already misaligned.

Staff Recommendation: Conceptual approval with final review by staff.

11. 34 New Street - - TMS # 457-12-03-122 BAR2021-000597

Request final approval for modifications to existing non-original two-story porch, new porch floor at second level, and new railing at first floor.
 Category 4 (Charlestowne) c. 1880 Old and Historic District
 Owner: Rita + Jamie MacDonald
 Applicant: Julia F. Martin Architects

MOTION: Final approval.

MADE BY: HUEY SECOND: GARDNER VOTE: FOR 4 AGAINST 0
Martin recused

Staff Comments:

1. This is a wonderful project and we look forward to seeing the piazza reestablished.

Staff Recommendation: Final approval.

12. **62 Cannon Street - - TMS # 460-08-03-037**

BAR2021-000598

Request conceptual approval for renovation to existing historic house including the reconstruction of rear porch; and new construction of a two-story commercial addition at rear.

Category 4 (Cannonborough) c. 1886 Old City District

Owner: 62 Cannon, LLC

Applicant: Julia F. Martin Architects

MOTION: Conceptual approval with final review by staff.

MADE BY: HUEY SECOND: GARDNER VOTE: FOR 4 AGAINST 0
Martin recused

Staff Comments:

1. We have no objections to the project, and feel that this is a sensitive, thoughtful and well-designed addition.

Staff Recommendation: Conceptual approval with final review by staff.
