CITY COUNCIL MEETING COUNCIL CHAMBER

Regular Meeting March 14, 2023

The one hundred fortieth meeting of the City Council of Charleston was held this date convening at 5:01 p.m. at City Hall and over video conference call (Zoom).

A notice of this meeting and an agenda were made available on the City's website March 9, 2023 and appeared in the Post and Courier on March 13, 2023.

PRESENT (13) The Honorable John J. Tecklenburg, Mayor

Councilmember Gregg	District 1	Councilmember Waring	District 7
Councilmember Shealy	District 2	Councilmember Seekings	District 8
Councilmember Sakran	District 3	Councilmember Shahid	District 9
Councilmember Mitchell	District 4	Councilmember Bowden	District 10
Councilmember Brady	District 5	Councilmember Appel	District 11
Councilmember Gregorie	District 6	Councilmember Parker	District 12

Mayor Tecklenburg called the meeting to order at 5:01 p.m.

The Clerk called the roll.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Now, if you all would like to join us, Councilmember Gregorie will lead us in an <u>invocation and the Pledge of Allegiance."</u>

Councilmember Gregorie opened the meeting with a moment of silence.

Councilmember Gregorie then led City Council in the Pledge of Allegiance.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Thank you so much. This evening we have four items under <u>Presentations and Recognitions.</u> First, we have a <u>Resolution honoring Judge Richard E. Fields</u>, Charleston's first African American Municipal Court Judge, who passed away last week at the tender age of 103. We are honored here to have, tonight, his daughter Diane Fields-Reed, Ms. Reed, and Circuit Court Judge Deadra Jefferson. Would you all please come up and join me as I read the Resolution? Then, if you're willing, we would love to have a few words from you."

Mayor Tecklenburg read the Resolution.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Now, I'd like to call on Ms. Reed, if she would like to make a few remarks and accept this Resolution."

Ms. Diane Fields-Reed said, "Thank you, Mayor Tecklenburg."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Yes, ma'am."

Ms. Fields-Reed said, "Good afternoon, members of the Council, guests, and residents of Charleston. I will make just a few short remarks, but, you all knew my father almost as well as I knew my father, and there have been so many stories, so very many pleasant stories, about your interactions with him. On behalf of the Fields family, please accept our thanks for this token on his behalf. I will say, before closing, there is a story that he always told about his love for Charleston. When he graduated from law school, he continued to work in Washington as a waiter. He wanted to make all of the appropriate money so that he could come back to Charleston and open his law office and represent the community appropriately. He was serving a group dinner at a restaurant. It was O'Donnell's, and they were trying to encourage him to practice law in some other area of the Country. Of course, he had gone to school with many distinguished lawyers who became very important during that time, and they, too, were encouraging him to practice in Chicago, Cleveland, Los Angeles, and Detroit, but he always said, 'No,' his path was going to lead him back to Charleston. That was the only place he ever wanted to be, that he would spend all of his days serving the community, and that that would be his legacy, and I believe he was a success at that. He certainly was a proud Charlestonian, and as his family, we, obviously, want to continue that legacy to make him proud. Thank you so very much."

There was a standing ovation in the Chamber.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "If I may, I mean, we don't get a Circuit Court Judge here very often, Judge Jefferson, would you like to make any remarks?"

Honorable Deadra Jefferson said, "I was really hoping I could be seen and not heard. I think Diane summed it all up. When I spoke to the paper, they asked me for some comments, and I said, 'You know, we know him as a legal icon, we know him as someone who made so many waves.' All of us stood on his shoulders, but the one thing I think that he would really want to be known as was just a good human being, and that's what he was. He loved people, he loved this community, he loved the legal community, and above all, he loved his family. So, we thank you tonight for honoring him. Diane and I were saying the other night, he would just be thrilled by all of this. He would just be having a wonderful time. So, thank you, all, so very much."

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Shahid.

Councilmember Shahid said, "Thank you, Mr. Mayor. Councilmember Waring and I sat together yesterday for the funeral service. It lasted two hours. With all of the speeches, it didn't seem like it was a two-hour service, and your remarks were right on point. There were judges from the Federal bench, Circuit bench, Family Court bench, Probate, and Municipal Court, plus several other elected officials, but there are two things that touched me. One was the comments about, of all of the things that Judge Fields had done in his life, what was incredibly important was that he was a man of faith, and his dedication to his church. We've heard it a thousand times how much he loved his church. But, I guess when we pass from this world to the next, if anybody could say just one thing about us, is that we were a person of God and a person of faith, and it was very clear and obvious that he was all of that, and that transcended every other accolade he could have had.

The other thing is that, which Justice Beatty made some comments on behalf of the Judiciary, and you made these comments, too, Mayor, in 1969 Mayor Gaillard appointed Judge Fields to be the first African American judge on a Municipal level, on any level, in the State of South Carolina, and he reflected on that. Judge Jefferson is a product, and she followed in

Judge Fields' footsteps as a Family Court judge and as a Circuit judge. But, when you look at the number of people of color and women who were wearing black robes yesterday in that church, and Justice Beatty touched upon it, he said, 'We would not be here, but for Judge Fields' acceptance of a challenge.' And, so, this morning, I called Foster Gaillard and I was just curious as to, and I said, 'Foster, did your dad ever talk about this appointment?,' and I was somewhat curious as to why Palmer Gaillard moved in that direction, and he said, 'You know, Peter, my dad appointed Morris Rosen as Corporation Counsel, and that was a switch from somebody else who thought they had it.' So, one of the first, he was very prominent, obviously, Jewish member of our community, and he became our Legal Advisor in the City of Charleston, and he said, 'Dad wanted to make sure he had the best of the best,' and that was true, and appointing Judge Richard Fields as a Municipal judge was appointing the best of the best because he thought that was in the best interest of the City.

The Mayor and I were present when we did the dedication at the courthouse, and we pulled a couple of artifacts I'm going to give you. One is actually the Resolution back in 1969, and we found this letter that your dad wrote and, I wanted to read this into the record, part of it, in accepting it, he wrote to Judge Gaillard and said, this is very lengthy, but I'll just read one paragraph, 'Should you at any time feel that my moving out of the position to which I have been elected will be in the best interest of this City, feel free to suggest it. I have depended upon you for advice and guidance in a number of matters in the past, and I look forward to the continuation of that relationship. Your sponsorship of my election has favored my family and me far beyond our capacity to adequately respond.' Now, that's Judge Fields, a man who had humility to the very end, and I just thought that it was very important that our record reflected that today in honor of Judge Fields, I'm going to give you all these two papers that had the Resolution and his letter."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Thank you, Councilmember. That was terrific. I remember that being recited when we dedicated the courtroom."

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Waring.

Councilmember Waring said, "Thank you, Mr. Mayor. When we left the funeral on yesterday, I had never seen so many smiles on people's faces. It was like we were at a reunion. Good times were held in that church yesterday. And, you're right, Councilmember Shahid, it was clear when Chief Justice Beatty said all of the women, there were no women on the courts by the time when he got appointed. Obviously, he was the first African American male, and today, I wish you could have seen, because I know you all were not involved with it, but Julie Armstrong was in front of me, and she was shaking her head up and down so hard, if she didn't have a neck, it would have come off."

There was laughter in the Chamber.

Councilmember Waring continued, "I guess about between 15, not quite 20 years ago, the College of Charleston did not have a scholarship endowed in the name of an African American. So, I pointed that out and they said, 'Well, okay, do something about it.' So, I got with Tom Waring, who happens to be a long-time attorney in this town, and we always kid one another about being cousins. I got with Tom Waring and myself, and I sat, well, I actually met with your dad and asked if he would allow a scholarship to be endowed in his name, of course, he did. You know how willing he was, and so Tom and I started raising money, and in less than 60 days, we raised not quite \$100,000 to endow the scholarship in your father's name. The first place we went to was the Charleston BAR. And, Frank McCann was the Chairman of the BAR

at the time, and the BAR stepped up with a \$20,000 contribution like that. And, we're talking almost 20 years ago. When the scholarship was awarded, a young man came out of Sumter. Your dad started questioning the young man, he said, 'Son, ask your grandmother, you're my cousin.' So, it kind of gets back to where when Congressman Clyburn said that everybody in Berkeley County are cousins, well, I guess maybe that's the way it is in Sumter or something like that. But, thank you, all, for giving and allowing the gift of your father to be so widely exposed to all of us in the City of Charleston and really this State. Thank you so much."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Absolutely. Diane, thank you, again, for being with us tonight, and Judge, an honor for you to be with us. Thank you, both. God bless. So, next up we have a <u>proclamation recognizing Women's History Month.</u> Councilmember Parker, would you please join me up here as a member of the Commission on Women? We've got a couple of amazing women with us here, as well."

Mayor Tecklenburg read the proclamation.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "I give this to you. Councilmember Parker."

Councilmember Parker said, "Yes. Thank you, Mr. Mayor, for recognizing the important role that women play in this City and in this room, and such a fitting evening to recognize your father for what he's done for women to uplift them like that. I mean, what a true testament, what a great evening to celebrate him, as well. The Women's Commission has great things coming, so stay tuned. Thanks, you all."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Thank you."

There was applause in the Chamber.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "It's proclamation night tonight you all. So, next up is a proclamation recognizing the American Red Cross Month. Any time our friends and neighbors are in need here in Charleston, the American Red Cross is there. We're honored to have Lowcountry Red Cross Board, Chair Katarina Fjording, here with us tonight. Katarina, would you please join me at the podium? She is a volunteer chairman of the local effort. You all may know Katarina. She moved here from Sweden some years ago to help open the Volvo plant. She is an amazing woman herself, speaking of amazing women, and the effort that she puts in to help the American Red Cross is really admirable. Thank you for your advocacy for the Red Cross."

Mayor Tecklenburg read the proclamation.

There was applause in the Chamber.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Katarina."

Katarina Fjording said, "I'm speechless, and that will be the first time. Yes, and you know why, because this time the proclamation is really including all of the things that we communicate, and I wrote a letter to the editor of the Post and Courier the other day, so it's got that. So, I'll just throw away most of what I was going to say because, John, you already said it. So, thank you, Mayor Tecklenburg, and thank you, Councilmembers, and the City and County of Charleston for being a great partner to the Red Cross. Thank you for having me here today.

Just, I want to make a few notes, you talked about Clara Barton, and it was a long time ago she founded the American Red Cross about 20 years after it was originally founded in Geneva. Ever since then, the Red Cross, team members and volunteers, have been an essential part of every response to war, disaster, and human suffering. We were there then, and we are here now. To put that in context, the disaster team of the Red Cross in America issued an overview of the disaster that happened last year, and they called it the 18 different billion dollar climate disasters last year. So, we have 18 different disasters that each cost at least a billion dollars in total to take care of, and only the three months between November and January, the Red Cross initiated 82 separate disaster relief operations in such a short time. We did, obviously, take care of Hurricane Hugo, sorry, Hurricane Ian here, we don't want Hurricane Hugo again. You spoke about the home fires, and we do install a lot of fire alarms etc., so we installed over 2,000 in this region last year. And, 30%, typically, anything we do is in Charleston County.

I also want to mention blood. You mentioned a lot of unfortunate stuff, you mentioned our service to the Armed Forces, yes, it's teamwork. And, basically, every second someone in the U.S. needs blood or platelets, and if you donate a pint, it goes to our forces, typically our Armed Forces or the firemen. They can fill a pint in two to three minutes only. It can save up to three lives. We are always trying to modernize and in our board team. We have been working on some. If you missed the blood drive, I know you host blood drives here, if you missed one, then you think, 'Oh, I'll do it the next time,' and it's far and between sometimes. Now we have something called a blood link, and I'm trying to prove that that one is working, so anyone who would like to donate this month, I hope you will scan this QR Code, and we will circulate that in some links to that because that way anyone who misses a blood drive can go in, choose any location you want, rather than the one that was hosted, and we can still get credit for it. So, that's a good way of showing them modernization work, and I would love to show that.

Yes, you basically said most things. This is Red Cross Month, and we want to just honor the volunteers who support us and all of the patrons. We cannot do this life-saving work without them. So, on behalf of them, and on behalf of the people we serve, we are very grateful. We are there in times of need, and sometimes we are the only hope. So, thank you."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Thank you. Appreciate it."

There was applause in the Chamber.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "I scanned it and the little form comes right up. I think our Councilmembers know, we do our own City of Charleston blood drive multiple times a year, and I invite everyone to participate that can. Alright. Thank you, Katarina. Finally, tonight we have a proclamation honoring Thuane Brockington Fielding. Thuane, would you please join me up here on the podium? Speaking of another incredible woman. And, could I ask Councilmember Sakran to join me? I think originally this request was made by Councilmember Sakran."

Mayor Tecklenburg read the proclamation.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Thuane, thank you."

There was applause in the Chamber.

Thuane Brockington Fielding said, "Well, I am more than honored and quite humbled to have this opportunity to receive this recognition. I see one of my other partners in crime, our

current Vice-Chairman Jerry Harris, Thank you for being here. Many thanks though to Mayor Tecklenburg and to all of you Councilmembers, especially mine, for having the foresight to set up this Council to be able to work along with the Charleston Police Department. It is a wonderful learning experience working with Chief Reynolds. So happy you are here, sir, and with Deputy Chief Chito Walker, and with our facilitator Jillian Eidson. It's a wonderful thing to see how people from different backgrounds can meet together, flesh out issues, to determine a positive way forward for the harmonious relationships in this Charleston community. Yes, Mayor, we have a lot of work to do, there is still a lot of work to do, there's miles to go before we sleep, but we ask that you not grow weary in your well-doing and that you remember to remain patient, and please, Councilmembers, send us people who have the same amount of commitment who want, honestly, to work on CPAC to bring about a difference for Charleston. It matters not from whence they've come. I the product of educators in this Charleston community. I'm a graduate of Columbus Street Elementary School, who you probably don't even know anymore, right? And Charles A. Brown High School that was over on the Eastside of Charleston. I have never forgotten my foundational growth, and it led me successfully through Clemson University. So, thank you so very much for the recognition, but most especially, please remain committed to the opportunities that the Citizen's Police Advisory Council for the City of Charleston's Police Department can really make in this community, and maybe make a difference, and not just here, but the State of South Carolina and the nation. Thank you, again."

There was applause in the Chamber.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Thank you, Thuane. That was wonderful. Alright. So, next up is our <u>approval of the City Council minutes from February 14th."</u>

Councilmember Brady said, "Move for approval."

Councilmember Seekings said, "Second."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "We've got a motion and a second. Any additions or deletions, edits?"

No one asked to speak.

On a motion of Councilmember Brady, seconded by Councilmember Seekings, City Council voted unanimously to approve the minutes of the February 14, 2023 City Council meeting.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "There are no public hearings tonight. So, we're going to move right to <u>Citizens Participation Period</u> and, Madam Clerk, if you want to help lead that for us, that would be terrific."

The Clerk said, "And we have six people signed up. Did you want to set a time limit?"

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Two minutes."

Councilmember Sakran was excused from the Chamber at 5:36 p.m.

The Clerk said, "Alright. The time is two minutes. Anthony Bryant."

1. Anthony Bryant said dissent was important. He asked how the comfortable could secretly be uncomfortable. As he watched, he watched generations and generations past that were comfortable, but the uncomfortable were still there. He made a public comment to Homeland Security earlier that day. It was faith-based groups, neighborhood associations, and Homeland Security, Department of Education, Department of Labor, and HUD, which was online currently. He just got on Facebook after ten years. A lot of his friends asked him why he did what he does. He said he didn't have any children, he was single, and not married, but he thought about George Stinney all of the time. He had seen the Alex Murdaugh case in Walterboro and the BAR Association. He said George Stinney lived for 14 years, and paid a million dollars to get double life. Alex Murdaugh got what George Stinney would never get. His grandfather, historically, in 1920 was doing the same thing at the time George Stinney was executed at 14 years old. He had no skill set. In the City of Charleston currently, people needed \$60,000 to buy a house in the region. If people didn't have \$60,000, people were at risk to being unhoused. He said to get used to it. They were in New York currently, and it was going to cost some money. He wasn't there to be pleasing to Council or comfortable to Council because people were uncomfortable. As Dr. King said the three dimensions to complete life was, 'Life as it should be life was three dimensional in yourself, your community, and your relationship with God.' He said the question became they were praying, but were they acting on their prayers? If they were acting upon their prayers, it didn't matter if they prayed or not. To all his detractors, and his grandmother told him years ago, she said, 'God of universal purposes, change is not.' It didn't matter what they thought about his speech. God didn't change his purpose.

The Clerk said, "Time."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Thank you, sir."

The Clerk said, "Mohammed Idris."

2. Mohammed Idris showed a sign that said New World Order, Racism is Dead and Buried. He said 13 letters were in New World Order, and racism was dead and buried, but the devil wasn't. He said they used racism to hide the crime. Any time they were selling something in the store that said the devil was square, something was wrong with society and those who were in authority. He said there were 12 people on the Council and when they looked at Devil Squares and counted the letters in it, they had 12, so they were saying that the leadership of the City of Charleston was the devil. He wasn't saying that. He was just looking at the interpretation. There were two Devil Cremes and a new young lady who was a victim of circumstances named Little Debbie. When they looked at that, Little Debbie and her made 13 letters, and 13 was as they knew was what they had in the flag, in the Cabinet, and there were 12 Councilmembers and the Mayor made 13. He said so racism was dead.

The Clerk said, "Time."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Thank you, sir."

Councilmember Sakran returned to the Chamber at 5:40 p.m.

The Clerk said, "Harris Cohen."

Harris Cohen addressed the lack of safety and cleanliness on King Street particularly below Calhoun. He said it wasn't just the bars on Upper Calhoun at night that had seen a lot of incidents. He said his Councilperson had not heard about an incident two weeks ago on a Friday night or early Saturday morning where there was a 150-person fight out on Ann Street at King Street. He suggested that City Council be given a report if something like that happened from the police or the Mayor, so that they were notified and knew what was going on. He said there was another incident where a suspect pulled a knife on a vacationing couple on King Street two Sundays ago in the daytime. He knew about it because that person had an assault and a hate crime against him. He said he was glad Police Chief Reynolds was there. He said they did disagree on a lot of things, but they agreed on some things, and he applauded Chief Reynolds for saying they had to have follow-through on those repeat offenders. He said that person had an assault on him, and the judge gave him ten days which he had already served, and for the hate crime it was a suspended sentence. He said that was ridiculous. It was one of the newly-appointed judges, Judge Burke, and two weeks later he trespassed against the order, and it went before Judge Herdina. That person asked why it didn't apply to him while he was working and Mr. Cohen asked to see the pay stubs. Judge Herdina said no that they were going to trust him on it, and a few months later he was trespassing again. Two weeks after that he called the Chief Prosecutor for the City and he didn't know about it whatsoever. Mr. Cohen asked him what he was going to do and the Chief Prosecutor said he didn't think he was going to prosecute it because he didn't think the Judge was going to do anything. He said it was a hate crime and that was ridiculous. He showed a picture of a vagrant in front of Chipotle at 2:30 p.m. He had to call Consolidated as there weren't any police around. He showed another picture of a skateboarder going up King Street in front of a police officer and less than a week after someone was hurt on St. Philip, and the police officer did nothing.

The Clerk said, "Time."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Thank you, sir."

The Clerk said, "Suzanne Hardie."

4. Suzanne Hardie, 32 Prioleau Street, said she was speaking for CAJM, and she acknowledged and appreciated the Public Safety Committee for bringing up CAJM's concerns and questions regarding the CPD assessment for the audit. She hated to say it, but unfortunately, their key concerns were not resolved as CPD reiterated their current plan. She said their requests were simple and reasonable, and they asked that Council help resolve them. One was they wanted the community to be included, to be able to comment and ask questions of CPD on the Racial Bias Audit results just as CNA recommended. They wanted to hear directly from CPD the disparity data, the analysis, and the plans going forward to alleviate those. She said they didn't want to have to hear those through notes from a Public Safety meeting or CPAC. Those forms were closed to community discussion and the thousands of CAJM members did not view either as substitutes for their voices. She said they wanted Council and the assessment team to address how without Black representation the community was assured that racial bias would not be inadvertently inserted into the assessment. It was gross error and a lack of racial

sensitivity for that criteria to not be part of choosing the consultants, but it wasn't too late to identify a third-party perspective and/or assure a meaningful review by some of their local Black leaders. She said CAJM reiterated its passion which they knew Council knew of and many offers to help make their Racial Bias Audit a success for bring disparities to their collective consciousness and to put plans in place to diminish them. It was going to make all of them safer. She looked forward to the time when their input was sought and accepted ahead of time so they didn't have to continually come back and complain after the fact, where they were inclusive, where they worked together to create the best and just City for all of them, not just in name, but in reality for the real people living under Council's guidance.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Thank you."

The Clerk said, "Jerome Harris."

Jerome Harris, Chairman of the Citizen's Police Advisory Council, thanked Council for recognizing their fearless leader, Thuane Fielding. He had in his hand an imaginary bouquet of flowers that they wished to give her and thank her for her service. It was important in her comments about her being a role model for service on CPAC became important. He said they asked Council as they thought about their relationship with the individual who represented them on CPAC that they looked to Thuane as a model for that. He said those who served on CPAC looked to her as a model for how they performed their duties and responsibilities. He thanked Council and asked them to act rapidly to approve the recommendation and fulfill the vacancy that the Mayor was bringing forward and that those members of Council who had not filled their vacancy do so expeditiously as they would love to come to the next meeting and see that on the agenda. They wanted to reiterate the fact it was a good instructive meeting yesterday afternoon with the Public Safety Committee as a number of issues were raised. He said CPAC remained committed to its responsibility to be the bridge between the community and the Police Department, a two-way bridge. If the assessment resulted in them having a sense of transparency and improved public safety, some of the concerns raised ought to be addressed. He thought they were in a good space, and all it took was a little bit of work. It wasn't what they did, but how they did it, and he wanted everyone to remember that as they moved forward.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Thank you. Yes, sir."

The Clerk said, "Zac Viscidi."

No one asked to speak.

The Clerk said, "Alright. Those were all of the speakers that were signed up. We did receive two comments. One was from Anthony Bryant, and he already spoke tonight, and we forwarded that to you yesterday. We also received a comment from Brian Turner, and he said that they urged Council to support the Board of Architectural Review's authority in twice denying the elevation request for 1 Henrietta Street on grounds that a 1st floor storefront could be feasibly floodproof or alternatively a FEMA variance could be obtained. Approving this agreement would send a message that if you are denied by the BAR, you can find a path to approval by a closed-door mediation process, and those were all of the comments we received."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Thank you, Madam Clerk. Did anyone else want to be heard while we have it open?"

No one else asked to speak.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "We appreciate your comments this evening and thank you for being a part of our meeting and sharing with us. So, next up is our <u>Petitions and Communications</u>. First, is an appointment to the Citizen's Police Advisory Council."

Councilmember Seekings said, "So moved."

Councilmember Waring said, "Second."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Alright. We've got a motion and a second."

On a motion of Councilmember Seekings, seconded by Councilmember Waring, City Council voted unanimously to approve the following appointment:

1. Appointments:

- (i).Citizen Police Advisory Council:
 - Harrison D. McIver III Mayor's selection

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "You will find that Harrison will be a great addition to the Council. Next, Ms. Geona Shaw Johnson saw a presentation from <u>Trident United Way 2-1-1 Hotline</u> that she thought would be terrific to share with Council just to give an update of the input that the 2-1-1 system is getting with all of the calls they take. Ms. Katie Reams is here with us from Trident United Way. Take it away."

Katie Reams, Director of SC 2-1-1 Services, said, "Again, I'm Katie Reams, I'm the Director of 2-1-1 Services for the State of South Carolina with United Way. So, what we do is we serve the community in a number of ways and specifically what we're going to go over today a little bit is 2-1-1 Services, how that's offered to the community and then the data that we collect from that that informs community needs. So, we're going to run through that really quickly, and if you have questions, you're welcome to ask.

So, what is 2-1-1? Some of you might be from other states and may be familiar with 2-1-1, but if you've seen one 2-1-1, you've seen one 2-1-1. They all function differently in all of the different states. Some states have 13 and 14 2-1-1 systems. We are lucky in South Carolina. We have one 2-1-1 system which is all provided by local United Ways. All of your locally United Ways pay for 2-1-1 to be offered in all of the local areas specifically in our area of Dorchester, Berkeley, and Charleston County, Trident United Way provides all of that for free. There's three ways that 2-1-1 is provided. Most of you probably know you can pick up the phone and dial 2-1-1. People can pick up the phone, dial 2-1-1, and get a live person 24/7/365 in a number of different languages with translation services to walk through what's going on. So, as you guys I'm sure are familiar, lots of things are happening, right, in our community and in our nation. People are struggling to pay rent assistance, struggling for food, struggling with substance abuse treatment, struggling to have mentoring programs for their children, struggling to find counseling and things among a million other issues. That is what we work to connect people with is the community service providers, our local non-profits, that provide those direct services.

Someone could pick up the phone at any time, call them, and connect with them directly about who will help them in their area.

So, we have over 3,000 service providers in our State and so we walk individuals through what that looks like for them, who they can connect with, and how they can get connected to those agencies. We also have a website and texting. You're welcome to try that texting. I promise I won't be offended if you pick up your phone. You can text the key words 'Home,' 'Electric,' 'DSS,' or 'Food' to 211-211 and get direct referrals to agencies that can support you right here in Charleston, and so it's free to users. Again, that's supported by Trident United Way, and it's confidential. It's a big deal for us because we get a lot of calls from people that may be in domestic violence situations, unsafe home situations, and a lot of other varieties of things, but what we recognize is we have a ton of data. We know why people call, where they call us from, what they call us about, who they are referred to, and what happens with that. In 2022, we had over 76,000 calls from the State of South Carolina, 76,000 calls, so it's a lot of calls. Just in the Tri-County area we had 10,766 calls, that is just Charleston, Dorchester, and Berkeley counties. As you notice, that's about a 3% decrease from 2021 which is not too tremendous, but we do see a tremendous decrease in referrals, so you will notice that referrals are double what our phone calls are typically. That's good for us. We want to offer people multiple food pantries to go to because transportation is a barrier especially when there's bridges and bodies of water, right, and we recognize that eligibility and intake and when places are open may not work for everyone, so we offer multiple options. We also offer multiple options when they call about things like rent assistance, right, because you don't just need rent assistance, you might need legal aid, you may need the Housing Authority, so we provide a lot of options for people, but you can see that's a 16% decrease from last year. That's a big deal.

What that means to us and what we're able to glean from that is there are less programs and services available. That is simply the answer there. You will notice particularly in Charleston County, that's most important to you guys, that there is a 2% increase in calls. So, while there was a 3% decrease overall, there was a 2% increase in Charleston County. You will notice again with the referrals, so the blue is 2021 and the yellow is 2022, and overall, the blue is increasingly higher, so we offered way more referrals in 2021 even though there was a pretty close similar call volume. What we know from that is that is when ERAP funding, ARPA funding, and C.A.R.E.S. Act funding were running out. So, as we got to the middle and then end of the year those programs and services simply did not exist anymore and so the community need was very similar, but where we could refer them to and what they could do was very, very different.

So, what do people call about? That's a big deal for us because it matters. We can all kind of anecdotally talk about we have a cousin, a sister, a brother or someone who has an experience, but data matters. We want our elected officials, and we want our non-profits, and we want our community members, to make data-driven decisions especially when it comes to money, and service areas, and all of those things, and overwhelmingly what people call about is housing needs. Of the top 18 needs in the Tri-County area, only one of them was not related to housing this year. That was food. Everything else was related to housing and you might think, 'Well, what's General Legal Aid?,' it's all about Housing Court, right? So, it's all about having representation in Housing Court and preventing those evictions and so that's a really big deal for us because we recognize this is different than Statewide. These same numbers are not reflected Statewide. In some regions, they are, but food and some other services are much more needed Statewide. We see a much larger housing need in this Tri-County area. As you can see, it shifts by quarter. Things are very seasonal with our calls because of taxes and when kids are in schools and weather is mild, people call less, right? When the weather is not so mild,

kids are out of school, we see an increase in calls, and then you can also see that increase in calls as money started to run out towards the end of the year, and there was just simply not enough programs and services to go around.

You will notice the breakdown by City. We can get this granular as zip code, and we are certainly happy for anyone on this Council if you would like us to get you information for your district, we can do that. We can get as granular as zip code, we can break down demographics, and we can break down who got referred to what agency. There is a lot of information for us, and we're happy to provide that for you to be useful as you guys make decisions. You will notice that, in particular, North Charleston received over 2,000 calls more than any other municipality, and they often receive more calls than any other zip code in the State. That is very common, and it's a tremendous need, but you will notice the need is pretty prevalent throughout, and then Charleston City is the second below that, and it is always number two in our numbers monthly or annually.

So, our hope for this is that you will use this data for grants, strategic planning, program and service area expansion. You guys make decisions about a lot of money, you make decisions about a lot of zoning, and you make decisions about a lot of things. We would love for you to make that based on very fact-based information about community need. We're not just anecdotal. We had 10,000 people that had a thought and had a need. We have demographics on them, and we want to share that with you because we want to be part of the process in just making sure that we're making fact-based decisions. We're also happy to provide to any of your districts whether it's Fire, EMS, local non-profits any materials to get the community and constituents that you represent connected to 2-1-1 so we get them to the right places with the right agencies that can support them. You can always contact me. My contact information is there. Geona certainly has it. We talk regularly these days, and you can also contact any of the TUW staff, so we are happy to help at any time. I was recently asked, someone said to me, 'So, what are you looking for out of this?' and our answer is 'Nothing.' We just want to be helpful. We have a ton of data. It means something. We're able to explain what's happening in real time. I can get you information as most recent as yesterday, and so we want to provide you with real time data as you're making decisions about the community. Thank you. Appreciate it."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Thank you, Katie. Any questions for Katie?"

Ms. Reams said, "Yes, I can answer anything now."

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Brady.

Councilmember Brady said, "Less a question. I had the pleasure of sitting next to Katie at the Together SC Conference up in Columbia and also the pleasure of working, I see Kathy Easley back there, at Trident United Way. So, I have a unique kind of insider's perspective on it, but also after I left United Way I worked for the Salvation Army and we referred out to 2-1-1 all the time when people would call if we didn't offer the service and we would refer out. So, I would remind my colleagues that the City of Charleston does participate in the Trident United Way Campaign that goes out. That's the little form that we usually get mailed to us, and so I would just encourage you having sat on both sides of this both raising money for United Way as a fundraiser but also now serving as a donor for United Way because I've been on both sides. I would encourage you, next time we go back around with that, to keep this presentation in mind that it's not just please donate a few dollars out of our meager Council paycheck, but to really invest in the community and folks that need our services, and you see we're number two for the

City up there, as well. So, obviously, there's folks in need and United Way is doing a great job helping that out. So, thank you guys for what you're doing."

Ms. Reams said, "Thank you very much."

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Parker.

Councilmember Parker said, "Thank you, Mr. Mayor, and thank you, Katie, for that presentation. We've been talking about grants a lot recently, and it's something I'm trying to keep a close eye on, but if I can ask, help me help you, so if there is something, I know that our City already does a great job with going after those grants. I know in Geona's division and Police and Fire, but all of these different aspects that you guys are sort of a one-stop shop, but if there's a specific need or grant that you know of, we might not know about it. So, please let me know."

Ms. Reams said, "Yes, we would love that, we would love to participate in any way that we can. Absolutely. Any questions?"

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Any other questions?"

No one else asked to speak.

Ms. Reams said, "Thank you, guys, for your time."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Thank you, Katie, for the work you all do, and it's a good reminder for us with our constituent service if you don't readily know who to refer someone to, they could just call 2-1-1 and in good likelihood they will find some help for what they're looking for. So, thank you for that. So, next up, we have a consideration of a Mediation Settlement Agreement Witty v. City of Charleston and the Board of Architectural Review, and I see Magalie stepping forward to present this to us."

Magalie Creech said, "Good evening. We are requesting your approval on this Mediation Settlement pursuant to Title 6, Chapter 29 of the State Code. To the extent that it's not clear in the settlement documents you've received, we suggest adding under Section 4b(4) all provisions stating that the first floor will be floodproof. We've discussed that change with Council for the property owners, and they are in agreement with it. I'm happy to answer any questions you might have about the agreement."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Alright."

Councilmember Brady was excused from the Chamber at 6:01 p.m.

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Mitchell.

Councilmember Mitchell said, "Yes. Mayor, I'm going to move for approval on that. This was going through the Neighborhood Association for the past two years, and they voted unanimously to approve that at the time, and that couple is trying to do what they do there and they're working hard on that. So, I would put this for approval for it and ask my colleagues to approve it also."

Councilmember Seekings said, "Second."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Alright. Sure. We have a motion and a second."

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Sakran.

Councilmember Sakran said, "Thank you, Mayor. Is it possible just to kind of give us a CliffNotes version of the denial and resolution?"

Councilmember Mitchell was excused from the Chamber at 6:01 p.m.

Ms. Creech said, "Absolutely. So, the property address is 1 Henrietta, and it is a two-story corner store. The owners' initial request to elevate the building to above the DFE was denied. So, in the mediation process, we devised some alternate mediation design which would allow them to incorporate certain changes, but without elevating the building. So, they can floodproof it and then subject to these other design changes, they're able to make some of those changes that they wanted without having to elevate the building, which was the main concern from the BAR."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Follow up."

Councilmember Sakran said, "The applicants wanted to raise it?"

Ms. Creech said, "They did want to raise it above the DFE, and that was the basis for the denial by the BAR."

Councilmember Sakran said, "So, they wanted to raise it out of the flood--"

Councilmember Brady returned to the Chamber at 6:02 p.m.

Ms. Creech said, "Yes, above the DFE and the, I guess, concern from the BAR was that that would be too significant of a change to the form and function of the building."

Councilmember Sakran said, "And this is in Councilmember Mitchell's district?"

Ms. Creech said, "Yes."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "That's correct."

Councilmember Sakran said, "Thank you."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Yes. Any other questions or comments?"

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Parker.

Councilmember Parker said, "I mean, I'm with you, I sort of needed the CliffNotes version on that one. I did read what you all sent, but are we setting any type of precedent here?"

Ms. Creech said, "No."

Councilmember Parker said, "Okay."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "I'm sorry. Are we what?"

Councilmember Parker said, "Setting any type of precedent."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Alright."

Councilmember Mitchell returned to the Chamber at 6:03 p.m.

Ms. Creech said, "We're not. That's in fact actually right out of the State Code that any settlement approval does not set a precedent."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Alright. Any other questions or comments?"

No one else asked to speak.

On a motion of Councilmember Mitchell, seconded by Councilmember Seekings, City Council voted unanimously to approve a Mediation Settlement Agreement (<u>Witty v. City of Charleston and City of Charleston Board of Architectural Review-Small</u>).

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Let the record show it was unanimous. Alright. Next up is <u>Council Communications.</u> We have a <u>Resolution for Council to support South Carolina House Bill 3236 allowing a municipality to annex an area surrounded by that municipality, so called <u>donut holes</u>, requested by Councilmember Shahid. Councilmember Shahid."</u>

Councilmember Shahid said, "Yes. Thank you, Mr. Mayor, and if you haven't been following this, I know that our counterpart, Charleston County, has issued a resolution in direct opposition to this. This is a very simple and common sense approach to try to fill in the donut holes that we are experiencing, and Molly is doing such a terrific job. You saw the report we got from our Real Estate Committee regarding this. I ask and I just sort of focus this on only in West Ashley to give us sort of a concept about the number of pieces of property and homes and commercial uses that would be impacted by this. As it stands right now, there are over 40,000 living units in West Ashley. Of those 40,000 units, 34,000 are in the City which leaves about 6,000 outside of the City. Those are just residential units. There are 430 vacant commercial units and 135 other commercial units, or over 560 commercial units, outside of the City just in West Ashley alone, plus there is 768 parcels and 1,200 acres of unannexed land just in West Ashley. So, what this House Bill will do and why I would ask Council to vote to approve this resolution is to help us make this annexation effort a whole lot easier. This is simply about good government, Councilmember Appel in West Ashley, Councilmember Bowden, and just about every member of Council who lives or who has a representation of a part of West Ashley, has these donut holes in it. They're in Avondale, they're in Maryville-Ashleyville, they're in Pinecrest, they're in Huntington Woods. Try to get your answer to your constituents about speed bumps or traffic calming devices in an area, try to get police enforcement in these areas in which we don't have people are trying to have people stop speeding. We've got the Public Service District picking up trash following the same route that our City trash collections follow, the same route, talk about duplication of services.

Annexing these properties is going to close this duplication of government services, and it's going to help us with planning. One of the main things that we've been fussing over in West Ashley is flooding issues. Storm water does not follow boundary lines, it doesn't follow if you're in the City of Charleston, not in the City of Charleston. The collaborative efforts that we need to have, we heard that today at Traffic and Transportation with the improvements on Highway 17

dealing with Mr. Palassis' property off of Dupont and the Wappoo/Orleans Road area. That project has been spearheaded by the City of Charleston, and it's going to help improve Mr. Palassis' property, even though it's outside of the City limits. I can go on about this. It's one of my pet peeves about annexation. I think approving this resolution is a very clear and direct signal to our Charleston delegation that we support this. This is important for us to have this resolution approved, and I would urge my Council to vote for this unanimously. Thank you, Mr. Mayor."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Is that a motion?"

Councilmember Waring said, "Second."

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Parker followed by Councilmember Brady and Councilmember Shealy.

Councilmember Parker said, "Thank you, Mr. Mayor. I am completely with you, Councilmember Shahid. This is certainly something on James Island that we see. I mean, obviously, our public services suffer. That's the probably the biggest issue. My hesitation or my concern is I also hear from a lot of people on James Island regarding building, regarding what they're allowed to do on their property whether it's City, Town, or County. So, I do just wonder what would your response be to that? Because I understand that we're getting, I mean, I know that this is just a resolution, and it has to pass through a lot of other steps before we could do this, but I'm just curious what your response to that would be just sort that forcing of annexation?"

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Shahid.

Councilmember Shahid said, "Thank you, Mr. Mayor. Well, James Island is unique, in a lot of ways, James Island is unique. So, you have the City of Charleston, you have the Town of James Island, you have the County, and you have a Public Service District. You've got four different government agencies, and this bill is not set to push out the boundary lines of the City of Charleston. If that happens, that will happen in more of a natural occurrence if the property owner wants to do that. I did not look at the numbers tonight as to James Island, but I did look at the numbers tonight about the cost of being incorporated into the City of Charleston. Your property taxes go down significantly and the services that you get, I mean, this is sort of what the silliness of all this is, if a fire breaks out on James Island, you're going to have a Public Service District fire truck and a City of Charleston fire truck respond to that. That's going to happen. So, what you're going to pick up from the City mainly is something dealing with planning issues, and it's going to make sure that at least the planning that takes place out there is more concurrent, more systematic than a hodgepodge. So, a prime example of this, off of Sam Rittenberg Boulevard, there was a Bi-Lo that was tucked away off of Sam Rittenberg in between Sam Rittenberg and Orange Grove Road. That Bi-Lo closed. What was built there and replaced was Palmetto State Armory. Palmetto State Armory wanted to place in that building a firing range which is prohibited by our existing zoning. However, if you go further down Sam Rittenberg, an unincorporated area, there is a firing range over there because my constituents were extremely upset about Palmetto State Armory coming next door to a residential community with a concern of a firing range backed up right up to Northbridge Baptist Church. So, our zoning helped prevent not a viable commercial business, but it did stop having a firing range take place there. So, there are issues, I think, that not everybody's going to be happy, Councilmember Parker, but I think overall it's going to add a level of symmetry to the area, and I

would hope that doing that will alleviate a lot of the concerns that your folks have on James Island."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "And, of course, by supporting this resolution, we're not making this happen, we're just urging the Legislature to make it happen. It's chances up there, we will see about that."

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Brady followed by Councilmember Shealy.

Councilmember Brady said, "Thank you, Mr. Mayor. So, I share like some of my colleagues in West Ashley the frustration of the donut holes, especially as it comes to putting a burden on the City, and also on the Public Service District for that matter, where we're having to negotiate agreements where, because we're going down the same street, we have duplication of services. We're having to waste our time entering into these agreements, when the fix is clear and the Legislature is looking, at least in this iteration though I'm not sitting in Columbia so I do not have any input into it, but for the constituents they will look at a piece of property and can't understand why it's in the unincorporated County. It's literally next to a City property or in this case surrounded by City property, and they just can't understand that, well, the developer made a decision that they wanted to develop in an easier place to do business. This gives us the ability to when something is, I would argue urban in nature like it looks like it could just be part of the City, and it's surrounded by the City, this bill as it currently stands would help us kind of fix those issues. I know I have a lot of them on Johns Island, as well, and so while the bill's not perfect, and I would agree with that, we should urge the Legislature to help us fix this problem. I would just add an amendment, Councilmember Shahid, if we look at the 'NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED' maybe it was a scrivener's error, but it should be Charleston City Council, not Charleston County Council. So, I wholeheartedly support this, and thank you for bringing this forward."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Yes. Thank you."

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Shealy.

Councilmember Shealy said, "Yes. Thank you, Mr. Mayor. I'll support the resolution as it's going forward. I think we need to be very careful with this for a lot of reasons. I happen to have lived within the boundaries of District #2 for 53 years, and I can tell you that there are people that live within those boundaries that do not live in the City limits that do not want to be in the City limits, and I've had those conversations. While I personally believe that they would benefit from this, they are just as adamant that they don't want to be in the City, and I want us to be very careful with forcing someone to come into the City that doesn't want to be there. I was glad to see that there's a public hearing. I can tell you in the neighborhoods that I represent, Springfield, Canterbury Woods, Church Creek, Forest Lakes, and I can go on and on, I have as many probably within District #2 as there is in any district in the City of Charleston. We will have long, lengthy public hearings if we were to move forward with this. Nine days ago, there was a fire at Colonial Grand, as the Mayor spoke about. St. Andrews Public Service District played a major role in helping contain that fire and working with our firefighters. Councilmember Gregg, they used their million-dollar truck to come in there and helped out, and while our City guys did an outstanding job, and would have done an outstanding job without St. Andrews PSD there, they came in and they helped us contain that fire, and they did an outstanding job of working with us. I don't want to ruin that relationship over something like this. So, I want us to be very, very careful with this because they are very good at fire, they're very good at trash pickup, and

while I agree, the neighborhoods we have, I know I have people who live within the district that I represent that only put trash in their garbage can Monday, Tuesday, and Wednesday because it picks up on Thursday, and they use their neighbor's trash can that goes to St. Andrews. So, there is a lot of overlap and a lot of crazy extra expense where we've got trash trucks running up and down, so I agree with it. I just want us to be very careful, if this comes about, in how we handle it. So, thank you, Mr. Mayor."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Well, I think that's a good point, and as I just said a minute ago, our approving this recommendation doesn't make it happen. The State Legislature has to pass it, but even if they do, then it's still up to this body to make an individual decision as to any annexation that would come forward or to be recommended. I'm sure with public hearings and input from citizens who resolutely were opposed, or whatever the case might be, that we would act with all good judgment I would like to think so. So, at this point, we're just trying to give towns and municipalities a tool, if they choose to use it, and that's why the Municipal Association of South Carolina supports this and, I think, in the long run it's a good thing to have."

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Brady.

Councilmember Brady said, "And I was just going to follow up on that, as well, that while this is unusual in South Carolina because of the way that it's predominantly voluntary, this is fairly common in most states that have the whole concept of unincorporated counties. I know growing up in North Carolina, I mean, the City of Asheville would forcibly annex if there was a development that went in adjacent to the City limits that looked like it should be in the City. They would go through the three readings, the public hearing, and annex it. So, while it's unique in South Carolina that we don't have it, this is not something that's like not happening in other places, in other major metropolitan areas. So, I just wanted to make sure that that was on the record, as well."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Yes. Alright."

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Shahid.

Councilmember Shahid said, "Just one point of process, Mayor. Assuming that we pass this resolution, I would ask the Clerk to make sure that we send the resolution to our local delegation."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Yes. Absolutely. Anyone else like to be heard?"

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Waring.

Councilmember Waring said, "I really thank my colleagues for all of the words that they said. I've been in favor of this before they even had it in Columbia on the agenda up there. In particular, the West Ashley area that we live in the millage rate is 50% more than the City of Charleston, 50% more among property taxes. So, I think elevating this conversation a lot of the old-time residents that are big proponents of remaining in the PSD, they still believe that their taxes are lower in the PSD than the City of Charleston. That hadn't been the case for almost a decade, they just don't know. We need more money, but we have one of the best Stormwater Departments in any municipality in the State of South Carolina. Look at the complex projects that we are doing. The PSD doesn't even have a stormwater department. Now, and you're right, Councilmember Shahid, in that water doesn't know any jurisdictions, but we actually need a coordinated effort kind of like Councilmember Appel has been doing, pulling together the State,

pulling together the County, and working with the City, but we can't work with the PSD, well, they can talk, but financially, they can't fund, and we actually need a funding mechanism for a lot of these ditches, pipes, and culverts that need to be upsized to keep water from coming in people's homes. A number of Councilmembers around this table, it's one thing to have a flooded street, it's one thing to have a flooded yard, but when you have to literally pray that it stops raining so water won't intrude your home. I've got people across my district that three or four inches of rain, I'm not talking about a storm, and you do, too, Councilmember Bowden, we need a coordinated effort working with government. Mayor, you're doing a great job on that. A number of Councilmembers around the table are pulling together that Council of Governments to work together, and this is just another tool, like the Mayor said. So, I invite the public hearings because what it does it's going to inform a lot of people who have been passing along obsolete information thinking, 'I'm staying in the PSD because I pay lower taxes,' and the inflationary times we're in when you can basically get a 50% reduction on your owner-occupied home. In most cases people can take a small vacation with that savings. They just don't know. Thank you, Mr. Mayor."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Thank you. Any other comments or questions?"

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Gregg.

Councilmember Gregg said, "Thank you, Mr. Mayor. I'm going to support this resolution, but I would like to point out that if you are in Berkeley County and you go into the City your taxes will be higher, so it's a little different in Berkeley County. So, I would like to put that on the record to make sure everyone knows that I am not voting to forcibly annex anybody into Berkeley County. Thank you very much."

Councilmember Waring said, "Berkeley County or the City? I'm just asking a question. He said Berkeley County."

Councilmember Gregg said, "Sorry. If you live in Berkeley County and you annex into the City, your taxes would go up."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "That's right."

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Parker.

Councilmember Parker said, "Thank you, Mr. Mayor, and Councilmember Shealy, you spoke my sentiments perfectly. Same thing on James Island. So, while I support this resolution today, also I understand Councilmember Waring it's great to have those conversations with constituents because my job would certainly be easier if this were done. The multi-level, as you know, on James Island makes it complicated, but it's still a mindset of forcing the annexation. So, thank you."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Alright. Any other comments or questions?"

No one else asked to speak.

On a motion of Councilmember Shahid, seconded by Councilmember Waring, City Council voted unanimously to approve the following Resolution:

Resolution for Council to support SC House Bill 3236, regarding allowing a municipality to annex an area surrounded by that municipality (donut holes)

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Now for our <u>Council Committee Reports</u>, first up is <u>Committee on Human Resources</u>. Councilmember Gregorie."

Councilmember Gregorie said, "Mr. Mayor and Council, the Committee on Human Resources met on March 9th, and we had New Business relating to Staffing and Retention Report, the Recruitment Update, and the Upcoming Recruitment Efforts. I must say that, based upon the numbers that we were given, that our actions in terms of increases in salaries etc. seems to be making a difference in each one of those areas, so things are very promising. Now we have requested from HR to send those slides to all Councilmembers because once you see the slides, it's pretty obvious that things seem to be heading in the right direction and that we must have made some pretty good decisions. We had nothing to approve. This was just for information only. That concludes my report."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Thank you, sir. Any questions for Councilmember Gregorie?"

No one asked to speak.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Hearing none, next up our <u>Committee on Public Safety.</u> Councilmember Shahid."

Councilmember Shahid said, "Thank you, Mr. Mayor. The Committee on Public Safety met yesterday at 2:00 p.m. You have in front of you a very full and detailed agenda. What I would ask to do, if I may go out of order, Mr. Mayor, is address what's on our agenda as Item C, and this was the review of the Research Agreement between University of South Carolina and CPD. Chief Reynolds is here with us with Jill, and I'd ask them to sort of give us a little preview as to what the discussions were regarding this review. As you may remember, we approved this contract at our last Council meeting. You all directed me to have a Public Safety Committee hearing to address some of the concerns on this contract, and I'm going to let the Chief sort of tee this off and Jill can fill in right after that."

Councilmember Gregg was excused from the meeting at 6:25 p.m.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Alright. Thank you, sir. Chief Reynolds."

Chief Luther Reynolds said, "Thank you, Mayor. Thank you, Councilmember Shahid. We did have a lengthy discussion and a lot of really good questions were raised. With me today, I have Chief Walker, I have our Procedural Justice Director Jill Eidson, and we also have Dr. Bob Kahle who should be able to join us online. I'm going to let Jill kind of frame up a little bit of what we discussed yesterday and maybe we pass it off to Bob because there were some really good questions, and I don't think we are as prepared to answer those, so I think we will be able to get some good answers from them tonight. Thank you."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Great. Thank you."

Jillian Eidson said, "Thank you, all, for having us, and thank you, Councilmember Shahid, for allowing us to discuss further the whole scope of the proposal for the assessment of the Racial Bias Audit to date. We really believe in this, that this is an important step to be able to assess the progress that's been made. It's been a tremendous amount of progress, although

we're not done. We've implemented, but now we need to better understand whether we had fidelity to the initial intentions of the CNA audit. We also would like to bring in a third party to give us the best practices recommendations on how we proceed and keep the momentum going. The discussions last night mainly centered around making sure that we involved community members, which is definitely our intention to get them involved in the very substantial community engagement piece and also there were some concerns raised about the diversity of the assessment team. So, at this time, I'd like to offer Dr. Kahle a chance to basically give you guys some feedback on his thoughts for moving forward with the last item on trying to better diversify the assessment team."

Dr. Robert Kahle said, "Thank you, Jill, and thanks, Mr. Mayor, and members of Council for a few minutes to speak. I want to say that I listened carefully to the Public Safety meeting from yesterday via the YouTube recording. I listened to it this morning. I heard the concerns and want to acknowledge that I have very clearly heard the concerns about the lack of diversity of the assessment team and also the strong theme about the importance of frequent and authentic community engagement.

I also want to make the point that in the proposal we did address one dimension of the diversity issue, and we indicated that we would be hiring an African American facilitator for the co-facilitation of the community forums. After listening to the discussion, I understand and now realize that this is not enough, and I suggest that moving forward we broaden the role of the forum facilitator to more of a community engagement lead and a specialist who could help us in that regard. I would commit that this should be a person of color, someone who is known and respected in, hopefully, Charleston, but of course in South Carolina, and someone who has the research and facilitation skills to be at the table equally with every other member of the assessment team. I do have two candidates in mind but until we can get someone contracted, I don't feel comfortable offering up specific names. I also want to commit to more frequent communication on what is built into the current project timelines. You can expect from me an independent voice and from each member of the assessment team. Please realize that Dr. Eckert is not only well known here in South Carolina, but is actually an internationally known expert on the issues that we will be studying.

Two other brief points. Let's keep in mind also that this is a process evaluation. We're not focusing on outcomes at this time. That would be a much more extensive study, much bigger budget, and we don't have the resources to do it. Rather what we will try to do is to identify the strengths of the CPD approach, and we will shine a bright light on areas where more work needs to be done. Admittedly, the assessment plan that we developed is imperfect, but through authentic dialogue, response to concerns shared with us, we will seek to propel the momentum created by CPD's voluntary and proactive examination of its policing practices in our racially diverse City. Thank you for your time."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Thank you, sir. Any questions for Jill, or Dr. Kahle, or Chief on any of these matters?"

Councilmember Shahid said, "I just want to add two things, Mr. Mayor. So, we did receive a list of questions from CAJM. We went over those, and we tried to respond to those I think the best we could. Also, Mr. Harris, if he's still present with us today, was able to interact with the Committee in offering questions. He did send me an e-mail yesterday, or early this morning, and these were sort of the themes of the questions that I think that they brought up and just want to reiterate those. 'Will CPAC and HARCC be involved in the study kick-off meeting and subsequent project status meetings with CPD and their consulting team?'"

Ms. Eidson said, "I'm happy to speak to that. So, the CPD is definitely interested in collaboration. We do want to proceed according to the proposal given the limited amount of time and the amount of information that we have to share. However, we're happy to work out a way to communicate with HARCC and with CPAC. I'm actually one of the facilitators of CPAC, as was noted earlier, so they can always reach out to me, contact me, and I also am in communication with Adrian Swinton. So, we will definitely be able to have ongoing discussion and dialogue with them related to getting their input on especially the community feedback part. If they request updates along the way or if you request updates along the way through the Public Safety Committee, we're more than happy to do that."

Councilmember Shahid said, "Okay. Then, the second question is with the same organizations their concern about being engaged in the development and outreach for the forums. We talked about the forums yesterday and how those forums will be interactive with the different stakeholders including just private citizens, as well, I understand."

Councilmember Mitchell was excused from the Chamber at 6:32 p.m.

Ms. Eidson said, "Yes, and that's always been our intention. We cannot perform successful forums without the help of our partners. We consider HARCC, and CPAC, and you all, frankly, to be important partners in getting the word out about our forums and making sure that we're providing a way for people who are not usually able to participate in other methods such as surveys to be able to come forth and share their experiences with us. So, we're still kind of working out the methods to have all of that planned, but we definitely will commit to making sure that we include all of these parties in the decisions and that we make sure that they help us recruit people because the study will be better if we have their input, and I'll ask Dr. Kahle if he has any other comments on that."

Dr. Kahle said, "I would just reiterate what you're saying, Jill. We have to have these partners at the table. It was always our intent to have those partners at the table. It's the only way that you can really do the community engagement piece. So, those along with others that we hope will become aware of what we're doing, and we hope to have robust participation from the community in all of those forums."

Councilmember Brady was excused from the Chamber at 6:33 p.m.

Councilmember Shahid said, "Yes, and the third question, I think, Dr. Kahle has sort of already addressed this as with the exclusion of racial minorities on this team and so my understanding what he just mentioned we're looking into that and trying to address that need. Just one other comment, Mr. Mayor, while my microphone is on. This is critically important, as we discussed this yesterday, for us to be inclusive of our different partners with us, our stakeholders, CPAC, our community in general, and while there are certain implementation items that the CNA audit call for, and that we've showed the implementation successful inclusion of those particular points, there are other areas of the audit that are ongoing. Even though we can report that we have accomplished something in year 2022, in year 2023, it's going to be a review of that same process. I'm not giving you specifics, but I just want to make sure that everybody understands in some general terms this is an ongoing process. This is not that we're going to just say we've accomplished something in this particular field in one year and then not pay any attention to it the next year, and that's really critical and important. This is a living breathing audit, and I think that the commitment from the Police Department to make sure of the two important factors, one is being inclusive and being transparent, and that is the message I

want this Council to have. Anything we can do to make that better, I know that Chief Reynolds and his team will be able to do that. Thank you, Mr. Mayor."

Councilmember Brady returned to the Chamber at 6:34 p.m.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Well, thank you, Mr. Chairman, and if I may add I think every presentation I've seen from the Charleston Police Department verified that, that of the 72 or whatever total recommendations that there were like 37 items that were not one and done kinds of things. They were all kinds of things, so it's a journey and not a destination, and that we have to continually monitor and patrol those things and make recommendations as we go forward, so that's absolutely correct."

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Sakran.

Councilmember Sakran said, "Thank you, Mayor. I wanted to thank Chief Reynolds and his team for continuing to push this work ahead. As I sat in and listened on the Public Safety meeting yesterday, and certainly had some comments and thoughts, but I want to let you know that I'm fully supportive of the effort. As my comments mentioned yesterday, when you look at the region, this effort is being done when other municipalities are not doing this, so I think we need to think things from a holistic standpoint. So, I just want to say thank you for leading that, there's work ahead of us, but I think we're at a critical point, and I hope we don't do anything to derail this. I think we've got to keep the momentum going, so any comments that I made yesterday or folks in the community in terms of critical comments, I think they need to stay focused on making sure that this moves forward, and the progress continues. Lastly, we did have a lively and energetic discussion, and I wanted to thank specifically Jill for your work. We're here to support you, and I know there are other groups out there that have questions, but I think this discussion leaning into CPAC and leaning into HARCC, those two institutions, those two organizations can certainly lend the support that you all need particularly around the public engagement piece. So, thank you for the continued work, and let's keep moving forward."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Great. Thank you."

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Bowden.

Councilmember Bowden said, "Thank you, and I just want to quickly say since I've had some mild criticism recently, that I just really appreciate you all's openness to engaging in this process further, and I think it just speaks to the kind of organization that CPD is and I've repeated that loud and clear for everybody to hear that CPD really leads in the region and the State, and I can't thank you enough to responding to issues that were raised with absolute professionalism and engagement with the community."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Great. Dr. Kahle, thank you for being with us, and we look forward to working with you, as well, sir."

Councilmember Waring said, "Mr. Mayor."

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Waring.

Councilmember Waring said, "Thank you. I want to thank the Chief, the Public Safety Committee, Councilmember Bowden, Councilmember Sakran, and Council in general for having a second run at this. We could have passed that through without that engagement dialogue that

Councilmember Sakran spoke about being inclusive with Jill and, obviously, now Dr. Kahle looking at it on YouTube. One of the things that Dr. Kahle made mention of was broadening the scope or the role I should say of the facilitator and picking the right person to be the facilitator. I whispered it to my colleague, as I often do to my right and left, while meetings are going on. I'm not being impolite. I'm trying to be a little more accurate."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Do I need to get the gavel out?"

There was laughter in the Chamber.

Councilmember Waring said, "That's right, but picking that person, and if it's not the right person, it could serve to derail. One example of a person is a person we just relieved from duty, Thuane Fielding. Now, I don't know if she would even do it, and I know both of you all know her, but the signal that goes out to the community that the legitimacy of a person like that is involved with the community, it sends that positive message that we all would like to see. So, picking that person, if not Thuane, whoever it is, certainly there are others out there, there's got to be a person of credibility, or it could clamp down on the Achilles heel of this process and none of us want to see that happen. So, keep up the good work, keep the open communication coming, and together we will solve these problems. Thank you."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "That's right. Anyone else?"

No one else asked to speak.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Alright. Councilmember Shahid, do you want to finish your report on the Public Safety meeting?"

Councilmember Shahid said, "Jill, thank you."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Yes. Thank you, Jill. Thank you, Chief."

Councilmember Shahid said, "We had the approval of finishing up an application for the 2023 DHS State Homeland Security Program Grant in the amount of \$515,005.56. That was approved. The second item was a Police Department approval of a Law Enforcement Assistance and Support Agreement with Aiken County. That's to help with, I think, security issues dealing with the Cooper River Bridge Run, as well. That also was approved. The next was a Fire Department approval to submit an application for the 2023 State Homeland Security Program in the amount of \$82,000 for the Collapse Search and Rescue Team. This was also an ongoing grant that we had previously approved, as well. So, Items a., b., and d. were approved, and I would move to have those also approved by this Council."

Councilmember Brady said, "Second."

Councilmember Shahid said, "Then, finally, we had an update--"

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Can I take action on that since we have a motion on the floor?"

Councilmember Shahid said, "Yes. I'm sorry."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Any further discussion on any of those items?"

No one asked to speak.

On a motion of Councilmember Shahid, seconded by Councilmember Brady, City Council voted unanimously to approve Items K.2.a., K.2.b., and K.2.c. of the Committee on Public Safety Report:

- a. Police Department: Approval to submit an application for the 2023 DHS State Homeland Security Program Grant in the amount of \$515,005.56. The grant will fund vehicle barrier systems to protect crowds and reroute traffic during public events. There is no match required for this grant.
- b. Police Department: Approval of a Law Enforcement Assistance and Support Agreement with Aiken County Sheriff's Department
- d. Fire Department: Approval to submit an application for the 2023 State Homeland Security Program Grant in the amount of \$82,000.00 for Charleston FD Collapse Search and Rescue Team. There is no match required for this grant.

Councilmember Mitchell was not present for the vote.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Yes, sir."

Councilmember Shahid said, "Thank you. Then, Chief Curia gave us an update on the Board of Fire Masters. This is something I thought we needed to look at in reinstituting of this Board. He has been in contact with the Chief about the counterpart which is the CPAC on some of the issues that they're dealing with. So, he is going to look at this in more of an informal nature of bringing in some advisors that he can meet with from time to time. We're going to have a dry run on this to see how this pans out to see if this addresses the issues that we're looking at to help make the Fire Department a stronger and more better department, more inclusive, in taking in the information and advice from our citizens and experts. The other item that we, I forgot this one, this is the approval to name the Forensics Services Building in honor of Judy Gordon. Is she here? Okay. I thought she was. It may have been earlier, but if you don't know who Judy is, she is sort of the mother, I guess, of a better lack of saying, of the forensic services throughout the City, helped spearhead our beautiful facility in Councilmember Shealy's District. If you haven't been out there, you really should. The work that they do at the Forensics Services Building is top notch. This came at the request of the Police Department, and we voted unanimously to approve naming the Forensics Services Building in Judy's honor."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "I move for approval."

Councilmember Gregorie said, "Second."

On a motion of Mayor Tecklenburg, seconded by Councilmember Gregorie, City Council voted unanimously to approve Item K.2.f. of the Committee on Public Safety Report:

f. Approval to name the Forensics Services Building in honor of Judy Gordon

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "We will have the Judy Gordon Forensics Services Building. Thank you, Judy."

Councilmember Shahid said, "The other two items were discussion only. The first one came from Councilmember Sakran. There was a horse named Moonshine, which I thought was somewhat ironic. There was a Charleston Police Department horse named Moonshine who died in the line of service. He was killed by a drunk driver. Moonshine's remains, we think, are buried some place in Hampton Park, and so we're talking about either locating the remains of Moonshine and any other horse who has died in the line of duty and Councilmember Brady brought up also our other four-legged animals, our K-9 Unit, and so we're looking at forming a memorial to those, and these are very important tools in our community for fighting crime, the K-9 Unit and also these horses which we have reinstituted, so I've somewhat tasked Councilmember Sakran to help us get this moving on. There's some momentum with getting the memorial erected, and we have an unofficial historian at the Charleston Police Department who is working with the Chief and Councilmember Sakran to identify those other horses and other K-9s who may have died in the line of duty. Finally, I wanted to hear from Animal Control Officer Bavles. I've had a number of complaints and concerns in my district right by the Fire Station #12 of an alligator who decides to sun himself on the sidewalk on Old Towne Road. So, apparently what the policy is with the CPD is that they will replace the animal back into the body of water from which it came, but will not relocate it, and that would be either DNR's responsibility or more likely that of a private citizen. Now, if the animal is a threat on private property, they will take different actions, but this is one of the divisions with this department of the Police Department that we don't think a whole lot about unless you've got a nuisance animal out there. I had the privilege, and Councilmember Appel had the privilege, and we were sitting at the same table at the 'Salute the Blue' back in January in which her and her department were recognized for some of the work that they had done. So, this is an ongoing issue dealing in District #9 with Albert the Alligator, I guess, he just sort of wants to come around our area, and I appreciate the information that Officer Bayles gave us. So, if you've got an alligator, call Animal Control. They will put it back in the body of water from which it came that would not destroy the animal and not remove it to another location. That's our report. Everything else is just for information only, and I appreciate the support from our Committee members."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Thank you, sir. Alright. Next up is our <u>Committee on Public Works.</u> Councilmember Waring."

Councilmember Shahid was excused from the Chamber at 6:45 p.m.

Councilmember Waring said, "We had one item for information only, but it's an item that's been around about four or five years. Slab on grade, hearty discussions. I've got to give credit to all of the factors that's worked together on that one. If you remember, we started out probably pushing back against one another four or five years ago, but we're definitely arriving at a consensus on that. It seems as though that our Legal Counsel will come forward with an ordinance for us to review at the next meeting and maybe actually get some progress going, an actual ordinance that we all can come together on, but beyond that that was the only item on the agenda."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Right. So, next meeting we hope to be able to take first reading."

Councilmember Waring said, "That's right."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Thank you for the report. Next up <u>Committee on Traffic and Transportation.</u> Councilmember Seekings."

Councilmember Seekings said, "Thank you, Mr. Mayor. The Committee on Traffic and Transportation met today at 3:00 p.m. We met in person and apparently, well, you guessed it, there was some traffic."

There was laughter in the Chamber.

Councilmember Shahid returned to the Chamber at 6:46 p.m.

Councilmember Seekings continued, "Anyway, when we all finally assembled, the entire Committee appeared as did two Councilmember guests, so we had actually seven of our colleagues at the table today to take up the following items. The first was a report from the County. It was Sunshine Trakas and Devri DeToma, but I think Sunshine gave us a report on the Savannah Highway Capacity Improvement Project. If you don't know what that is, it's in the Highway 17 Corridor West Ashley. It's a project that is funded from the 2016 Half-Cent Sales Tax. There are three general areas and intersections that have been studied and are moving forward, Magnolia Road and Highway 17, Stinson and Highway 17, and then what I would call the Avondale/Wappoo/Magnolia Road area which is a little more complicated. So, Stinson and Wappoo are projects that are being designed currently and will be implemented when the final details are completed by mid-construction. I think they told us will begin about mid-2024. Magnolia Road a little bit more complicated. There are a lot of intersections there. They still have some land acquisition challenges. There's still some input needed, but if you've been into Avondale and Magnolia Road and that whole area, it's a white-hot complicated mess, and the County is looking to address it in conjunction, by the way, with the City with input from the City, so more to come on that. I know that Councilmember Shahid and Councilmember Appel were particularly interested in those projects because they bisect and dissect their districts, so more to come.

Councilmember Waring was excused from the Chamber at 6:47 p.m.

The fourth item on our agenda which was the approval of the Municipal State Highway SCDOT Corridor Improvement Project was deferred. We will get back to you once we get with the DOT on some of the particulars of that. We took up the extension of the pedicab decals to add six nighttime decals and we voted to put those back out for bid. There will be six additional if this Council approves doing that. It's in an ordinance we've already adopted. We adopted it a couple of years ago. We had one failed attempt at letting out those additional six decals. There's been some time, but the Committee now thought it was time to do so, and so that passed through our Committee. The next was an ordinance that was proposed by Councilmember Shahid that's been currently deferred for a little bit more refinement. There were four traffic calming approvals, Laurel Avenue and North Central; Staffordshire Drive in the Ardmore/Sherwood Forest area, Canterbury Road-Parkwood/Farmfield, and Oak Leaf Street on Daniel Island. Councilmember Gregg pointed out, although listed last, it's not the least important. For those of you who are wondering how we're doing with traffic calming devices when it comes to our budget, we're early on in the year. These should take up about \$30,000 of the \$140,000 we have set aside. So, if you have constituencies that are looking for traffic calming devices, there is still money in the budget for those. How about that?"

Councilmember Gregorie said, "That's a switch."

Councilmember Seekings said, "Well, it's only March, like which it's actually usually by March we've gone through it, but that was back in the days when we had \$40,000 and now we've got \$140,000. So, and the last thing we had was an update from Mr. Lawrence and team

on the King Street Towing Update, Captain Bruder appeared and gave us an update on the now five-week old towing policy on Upper King Street. So, just a few things for your all's information, we have now gone through five weekends of approved towing by this Council including SEWE and Wine and Food. Prior to the implementation of the towing, we were seeing, as you know, we had a no parking policy on Thursday, Friday, and Saturday nights on Upper King Street, we were seeing about 90 to 100 tickets a night on Thursday, Friday, and Saturday nights over the course of two years. Since we began five weekends ago, why not, I'll ask you all, how many tows do you think we've had over five weekends which is 15 nights? Those of you on the Committee don't get to play."

There was laughter in the Chamber.

Councilmember Mitchell returned to the Chamber at 6:50 p.m.

Councilmember Seekings continued, "We've had 33, but interestingly not all of those are actually scofflaws of just the policy of not parking though. There were others, who I'd say had outstanding tickets and the like. So, we've had some nights where there's been zero tows. So, I think by all accounts it has been a successful program. We're averaging about four to five a night and 12 tickets in addition to that, so not so much. One of the, I think, legitimate questions was would this create a volatile situation on Upper King Street? That was brought up during our discussions. Captain Bruder and Mr. Lawrence discussed that and were very poignant about it. It has not. It has actually been peaceable up there. It has taken a cooperative effort between our T&T Department and the Police Department. The T&T team who is out there leading the tow is accompanied by uniformed police officers and apparently that has really sort of calmed everything down up there. So, to the extent there's been some fears about that, I know Councilmember Bowden brought it up legitimately, so far so good. One of the discussions, and I thought it was a good one, is how do we now through this organic process sort of lessen the look. If you've been up there to see what it looks like on a Thursday, Friday, or Saturday night, once the cars are moved, there are orange cones out there and there is a lot of activity around. Can't we sort of lighten it up and make it look a little less intrusive? And I think we're going to work towards that, and we have some plans to do so. We talked about having community valet. That's something that we will take up at T&T sooner rather than later. Take advantage of now the open spaces up there, having designated areas for pedicabs, and also for food pickup and delivery which supports the businesses along there. So, just congratulations to Lieutenant Bruder and Mr. Lawrence--"

Councilmember Shahid said, "Captain."

Councilmember Waring returned to the Chamber at 6:52 p.m.

Councilmember Seekings said, "Captain. I wrote it down twice today. By the way, for those of you South Carolina fans, I think he got demoted because he was at a conference and he was wearing a Clemson shirt, so we demoted him for purposes of tonight to Lieutenant. And, Lieutenant, if you're watching, you're back to Captain again, but they've done a really good job. They've worked incredibly hard up on King Street. I don't know if Mr. Lawrence has gone, but Robbie can tell us, on nights we were doing towing, our Parking Enforcement team is out there in large numbers. I mean, I think just about everybody on our Parking Enforcement team has been working literally time and overtime to make this be successful and it has been, so that was the report. So, with that, unless there's any questions, I would ask for adoption of the report including, but not limited to the advancing of the six new pedicab decals."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "We have a motion on the floor."

Councilmember Waring said, "I'll second."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "And a second."

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Gregorie.

Councilmember Gregorie said, "Yes, just a question, on Item 4(ii), the Municipal State Highway Safety Improvement Project Agreement, is that something that should be jointly looked at with our Public Safety Committee, as well?"

Councilmember Seekings said, "So, I think the answer to that is not necessarily, not to add a whole another layer of rocks into it, but let's see where it turns out. It's not complete yet. It's not fully baked to come back to us through T&T. I'll have a discussion with the Mayor and Councilmember Shahid, but I think it's properly in the hands of T&T, but again, always open to suggestion, the more eyes the better. So, and the Chairman, by the way, of the Public Safety Committee was at T&T today, and I think will be there again, so we will have that discussion."

Councilmember Gregorie said, "I mean, the reason why I asked the question is can you just give me a little bit more about what this is going to do? Is this going to look at crosswalks, lights--"

Councilmember Seekings said, "Yes. The answer is yes. I call them micro projects, but they're very important projects. It is funded by the State DOT to look at safety improvements in certain areas, and this one is to look at safety improvements on the Peninsula. So, for instance, one of the things that you're going to see for the first time in our history once this is up and running, approved and built-out is what I call 'scatter crosswalks' or 'all-way crosswalks' where you can cross on a diagonal that all of the cars stop. There's some road dining that's going on, there's looking at some signal timing, what else am I missing Robbie? There are a few other things. There's about six or seven different layers of it, but it is micro projects to make bike/pedestrian traffic safety flow better."

Councilmember Gregorie said, "And what seems to be the holdup? Because it sounds like something that we've been talking needing for years."

Councilmember Brady was excused from the Chamber at 6:54 p.m.

Councilmember Seekings said, "There's one stretch of King Street that has got some question about what the configuration of it will be."

Councilmember Gregorie said, "Is that the business community?"

Councilmember Seekings said, "It is. Well, it's not just the business community, it's the constituency, it's the College of Charleston, it's the Councilmembers in that district. We've had lots of conversations with the DOT where we're working towards a resolution to bring back through T&T and to Council, we're getting there, we're not sitting on it. Believe me, we're moving on it."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Right. We hope to have a resolution soon. It covered King, Meeting, Calhoun streets primarily, just a little bit of St. Philip's Street, as well. The scatter

crosswalks are going to be really cool and, of course, they will be where we have a lot of student population, King and Calhoun, Calhoun and St. Philip, Calhoun and Coming Street, but interestingly also Meeting and Market Streets. You know how the street doesn't line up properly? And it's just not safe when you're trying to cross over Meeting and so many people want to take a left turn. So, stop all traffic, let everybody walk whichever way they want to walk, and then get going with the cars again. I think it's a very wise recommendation, so those are some of the things to come with it."

Councilmember Gregorie said, "Yes. I just don't want it to get stuck in committee because it's something that can really--"

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "No, it won't."

Councilmember Seekings said, "It's not stuck, it's moving, and just so you know once the MOU is signed with the DOT, this is a DOT funded project."

Councilmember Gregorie said, "That's what I thought."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "That's right."

Councilmember Gregorie said, "Okay. Thank you for that answer."

Councilmember Seekings said, "Sure."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Councilmember Sakran, did you want to be heard?"

Councilmember Sakran said, "Yes. Just briefly, I just wanted to say thank you to Chairman Seekings and Robbie. It looks like this item is starting to draw more attention to some of the pedestrian safety issues on the Upper Peninsula. This is, obviously, not Upper Peninsula, right?"

Councilmember Seekings said, "It is not the Upper Peninsula, but it clearly has attention on there, and I think, I don't know if you saw we penned and I penned a letter of support for the Upper Peninsula Project to the DOT, so we're moving through that, too."

Councilmember Sakran said, "Thank you, and then one last thing which is kind of connected to the closure on King Street, and I just want to give a shout-out to Meg Thompson and her team for the Charleston Wine and Food Festival, the block party on King Street. I'm going to give my obligatory plug for making sure that it's an awesome event. We should really continue to think about what that would look like with a street closure very similar to Second Sunday. I thought it was a great crowd control and I'd love to hear more about thinking, investigating, and examining if that's possible at a future event. So, thanks to Meg and her team for that."

Councilmember Brady returned to the Chamber at 6:56 p.m.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "So, that was a terrific event, and I'll just very briefly share that we are looking to do a similar thing at Piccolo Spoleto, at MOJA this year, and during the holiday season during our Holiday Festival. So, that will be a total of four times this year, and I think as we do it this was more comfortable than when we had it at MOJA that everybody's kind of

getting into sync and kind of likes it, so we're going to try to keep it going. Thank you. So, there was a motion on the floor to accept the report. Any further questions or discussion?"

No one else asked to speak.

On a motion of Councilmember Seekings, seconded by Councilmember Waring, City Council voted unanimously to adopt the Committee on Traffic and Transportation Report, as amended:

- (i). Savannah Highway Capacity Improvement Project Presentation
- (ii). Approval of the Municipal State Highway/SCDOT Corridor Safety Improvement Project Agreement
- (iii). Pedicab, 6 Night Time Decal approval
- (iv). Ordinance to amend Chapter 21 of the Code of the City of Charleston by adding new Section 21-2 to Article 1(Parking or storage of commercial vehicles.) (AS AMENDED)(DEFERRED)
- (v). Traffic Calming approvals
 - -- Laurel Avenue, North Central
 - -- Staffordshire Drive, Ardmore/Sherwood Forest
 - -- Canterbury Road, Parkwood/Farmfield
 - -- Oak Leaf Street, Daniel Island
- (vi). King Street Towing Update

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Now for our Committee on Ways and Means."

Councilmember Gregorie said, "Move for approval."

Councilmember Shealy said, "Second."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "We've got a motion and a second. Any discussion?"

No one asked to speak.

On a motion of Councilmember Gregorie, seconded by Councilmember Shealy, City Council voted unanimously to adopt the Committee on Ways and Means Report, as presented:

(Bids and Purchases

- (Budget, Finance, and Revenue Collections: Approval of the 2023 Master Lease Purchase Financing Agreement in the amount of \$9,824,294.00 with Bank of America, 1111 E. Main St., 10th Floor, Richmond, VA 23219. Solicitation #23-B001C. [Ordinance]
- (Police Department: Approval to submit an application for the 2023 DHS State Homeland Security Program Grant in the amount of \$515,005.56. The grant will fund vehicle barrier systems to protect crowds and reroute traffic during public events. There is no match required for this grant.
- (Fire Department: Approval to submit an application for the 2023 State Homeland Security Grant in the amount of \$82,000.00 for Charleston FD Collapse Search and Rescue

- Team. There is no financial impact with this grant in the FY23 or 24 Budget. There is no match required for this grant.
- (Parks-Capital Projects: Approval of St. Thomas Island Dr. Nowell Creek Crossing Fee Amendment #1 in the amount of \$25,150.00 with JMT, to redesign the pedestrian bridge based on previously unforeseen conditions related to untraceable sub-aqueous utility locations. Approval of Fee Amendment #1 will increase the professional services contract by \$25,150.00 (from \$172,319.22 to \$197,469.22). Funding sources for this project are: SCDOT Grant (\$592,000.00), General Fund Reserves (\$99,467.00) and contributions from Berkeley County (\$60,000.00).
- (Parks-Capital Projects: Approval of the Municipal Operations Complex Fee Amendment #2 in the amount of \$46,700.00 with Edifice, LLC, for geotechnical exploration which will be used to inform the building structural design and Stormwater Design Teams for the project. Approval of Fee Amendment #2 will increase the professional services contract by \$46,700.00 (from \$176,300.00 to \$223,000.00). Funding sources for this project are: General Fund Reserves (\$700,000.00) and contributions from the Ports Authority (\$5,100,000.00).
- (Parks-Capital Projects: Approval of Charleston 9 Fire Fighters Memorial Construction Contract with Landscape Pavers, LLC, for renovations of the Charleston 9 Fire Fighters Memorial located at 1807 Savannah Highway. With the approval of the project budget Staff is authorized to award and/or amend contracts less than \$100,000.00 to the extent contingency funds exist in the Council Approved Budget. Approval of this will establish a project budget of \$321,034.55 of which \$228,888.00 will be for the construction contract. Funding sources for this project are: General Fund Reserves (\$281,847.00) and Contributions (\$39,187.55).
- (Office of Cultural Affairs: Approval to apply for \$15,000.00 from Charleston County Local Accommodations Tax Funding to support the 2024 Piccolo Spoleto Festival. The project period is 5/4/2024 to 6/9/2024; 6/19/2024. There is no match required.
- (Office of Cultural Affairs: Approval to apply for \$25,000.00 from Charleston County Local Accommodations Tax Funding to support the 2023 MOJA Arts Festival. The project period is 9/28/2023 to 10/8/2023. There is no match required.
- (Office of Cultural Affairs: Approval to apply for \$10,000.00 from Charleston County Local Accommodations Tax Funding to support the 2023 Free Verse Poetry Festival. The project period is 10/15/2023 to 11/15/2023. There is no match required.
- (Office of Cultural Affairs: Approval to apply for \$10,000.00 from Charleston County Local Accommodations Tax Funding to support the 2023 Holiday Magic in Historic Charleston. The project period is 12/1/2023 to 12/31/2023. There is no match required.
- (A Resolution to approve an Amendment of the Agreement for Development for Joint County Industrial Park, by and between Charleston County, South Carolina and Colleton County, South Carolina, so as to include additional property in the City of Charleston as part of the Joint County Industrial Park. The property is owned by the City of Charleston. [Resolution]
- (An Ordinance authorizing the Mayor to execute an MOU with Lowcountry Land Trust, Inc. and Angel Oak Park, LLC for the development, operation, and maintenance of the Angel Oak Park and Angel Oak Preserve on Johns Island. The property is owned by the City of Charleston. (TMS# 279-00-00-248 and 279-00-00-116) [Ordinance]
- (A Resolution extending the Review Period of the Memorandum of Understanding between the City of Charleston and Landmark Development, LLC for thirty (30) days. [Resolution]
- (Please consider the following annexations:
 - -- 226 Norris Avenue (.58 acre) (TMS# 349-09-00-019), West Ashley, (District11). The property is owned by Thomas and Patricia Moore.

- -- 1408 Orange Grove Road (.23 acre) (TMS# 352-10-00-949), West Ashley, (District 9). The property is owned by Sharon Hartnett.
- -- 1349 Ashley Hall Road (.21 acre) (TMS# 351-11-00-056), West Ashley, (District 7). The property is owned by Madison Pfeifer and Carter Brakefield.
- -- 1648 Secessionville Road (.54 acre) (TMS# 431-06-00-072), James Island, (District 12). The property is owned by John and Kathleen Simpson.
- -- 1708 Jessamine Road (.20 acre) (TMS# 351-12-00-023), West Ashley, (District 7). The property is owned by 10-4 Props, LLC.
- -- 1721 Ashley River Road (.23 acre) (TMS# 351-16-00-030), West Ashley, (District 7). The property is owned by Conti Investment LLC.

First reading was given to the following resolution and bills:

An ordinance to authorize the execution and delivery of Lease/Purchase Agreements with Banc of America Public Capital Corp. in order to provide for the acquisition of certain Police, Fire, Public Service, Fleet, Stormwater and various other vehicles and equipment; to provide the terms and conditions of such Lease/Purchase Agreements; to provide for the granting of a security interest to secure all obligations of Lessee under the Lease/Purchase Agreements; to authorize the execution and delivery of all documents necessary or appropriate to the consummation of such Lease/Purchase Agreements; and to provide for other matters related thereto.

An ordinance authorizing the Mayor to execute an MOU with Lowcountry Land Trust, Inc. and Angel Oak Park, LLC for the development, operation, and maintenance of the Angel Oak Park and Angel Oak Preserve on Johns Island.

A Resolution extending the Review Period of the Memorandum of Understanding between the City of Charleston and Landmark Development, LLC for thirty (30) days.

An ordinance to provide for the annexation of property known as 226 Norris Avenue (.58 acre) (TMS# 349-09-00-019), West Ashley, Charleston County, to the City of Charleston, shown within the area annexed upon a map attached hereto and make it part of District 11. The property is owned by Thomas and Patricia Moore.

An ordinance to provide for the annexation of property known as 1408 Orange Grove Road (.23 acre) (TMS# 352-10-00-949), West Ashley, Charleston County, to the City of Charleston, shown within the area annexed upon a map attached hereto and make it part of District 9. The property is owned by Sharon Hartnett.

An ordinance to provide for the annexation of property known as 1349 Ashley Hall Road (.21 acre) (TMS# 351-11-00-056), West Ashley, Charleston County, to the City of Charleston, shown within the area annexed upon a map attached hereto and make it part of District 7. The property is owned by Madison Pfeifer and Carter Brakefield.

An ordinance to provide for the annexation of property known as 1648 Secessionville Road (.54 acre) (TMS# 431-06-00-072), James Island, Charleston County, to the City of Charleston, shown within the area annexed upon a map attached hereto and make it part of District 12. The property is owned by John and Kathleen Simpson.

An ordinance to provide for the annexation of property known as 1708 Jessamine Road (.20 acre) (TMS# 351-12-00-023), West Ashley, Charleston County, to the City of

Charleston, shown within the area annexed upon a map attached hereto and make it part of District 7. The property is owned by 10-4 Props, LLC.

An ordinance to provide for the annexation of property known as 1721 Ashley River Road (.23 acre) (TMS# 351-16-00-030), West Ashley, Charleston County, to the City of Charleston, shown within the area annexed upon a map attached hereto and make it part of District 7. The property is owned by Conti Investment LLC.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Next up is <u>bills for second reading.</u> We do have a request from the applicant to <u>defer number one</u>. Can I entertain a motion to do that?"

Councilmember Brady said, "So moved."

Councilmember Shealy said, "Second."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Any discussion?"

No one asked to speak.

On a motion of Councilmember Brady, seconded by Councilmember Shealy, City Council voted unanimously to defer the following bill:

An ordinance to amend the Zoning Ordinance of the City of Charleston by changing the Zone Map, which is a part thereof, so that 657, 661, and 663 King Street (Peninsula) (approximately 0.31 acre) (TMS #460-04-04-090, 091, and 092) (Council District 3), be rezoned from 6 Story Old City Height District and 4 Story Old City Height District classification to 5 Story Old City Height District classification. The property is owned by the Twisted Bubble LLC. (**DEFERRED**)

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Number one is deferred. Then, we could take <u>two through eleven</u> <u>together."</u>

Councilmember Mitchell said, "Move for approval of two through eleven."

Councilmember Gregorie said, "Second."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Number two through eleven because we deferred number one. Any discussion on any of those?"

No one asked to speak.

On a motion of Councilmember Mitchell, ten (10) bills (Items L-2 through L-11) received second reading. They passed second reading on motion by Councilmember Gregorie and third reading on motion of Councilmember Mitchell. On further motion of Councilmember Shealy, the rules were suspended, and the bills were immediately ratified as:

2023-042 - AN ORDINANCE TO AMEND THE ZONING ORDINANCE OF THE CITY OF CHARLESTON BY CHANGING THE ZONE MAP, WHICH IS A PART THEREOF, SO THAT 200 MAGNOLIA ROAD (WEST ASHLEY) (APPROXIMATELY 0.23 ACRE) (TMS #418-13-00-164) (COUNCIL DISTRICT 3), BE REZONED FROM SINGLE FAMILY RESIDENTIAL (SR-2)

- CLASSIFICATION TO SINGLE-TWO FAMILY RESIDENTIAL (STR) CLASSIFICATION. THE PROPERTY IS OWNED BY JOHN STANFORD JENNINGS KERR.
- **2023-043 -** AN ORDINANCE TO AMEND THE ZONING ORDINANCE OF THE CITY OF CHARLESTON BY CHANGING THE ZONE MAP, WHICH IS A PART THEREOF, SO THAT 35 RIVERDALE DRIVE (WEST ASHLEY) (APPROXIMATELY 0.28 ACRE) (TMS #4181400063) (COUNCIL DISTRICT 11), ANNEXED INTO THE CITY OF CHARLESTON DECEMBER 6, 2022 (#2022-200), BE ZONED SINGLE-FAMILY RESIDENTIAL (SR-2) CLASSIFICATION. THE PROPERTY IS OWNED BY ALLISON RYAN.
- **2023-044 -** AN ORDINANCE TO AMEND THE ZONING ORDINANCE OF THE CITY OF CHARLESTON BY CHANGING THE ZONE MAP, WHICH IS A PART THEREOF, SO THAT 1610 POINSETTIA ROAD (WEST ASHLEY) (APPROXIMATELY 0.25 ACRE) (TMS #3511200101) (COUNCIL DISTRICT 9), ANNEXED INTO THE CITY OF CHARLESTON DECEMBER 6, 2022 (#2022-201), BE ZONED SINGLE-FAMILY RESIDENTIAL (SR-1) CLASSIFICATION. THE PROPERTY IS OWNED BY ROBERTO ABBATI.
- **2023-045 -** AN ORDINANCE TO AMEND THE ZONING ORDINANCE OF THE CITY OF CHARLESTON BY CHANGING THE ZONE MAP, WHICH IS A PART THEREOF, SO THAT 222 ISLAND DRIVE (WEST ASHLEY) (APPROXIMATELY 0.90 ACRE) (TMS #3491400021) (COUNCIL DISTRICT 11), ANNEXED INTO THE CITY OF CHARLESTON JANUARY 10, 2023 (#2023-014), BE ZONED SINGLE-FAMILY RESIDENTIAL (SR-1) CLASSIFICATION. THE PROPERTY IS OWNED BY PETER GREEN.
- **2023-046 -** AN ORDINANCE TO AMEND THE ZONING ORDINANCE OF THE CITY OF CHARLESTON BY CHANGING THE ZONE MAP, WHICH IS A PART THEREOF, SO THAT 1888 RAOUL WALLENBERG BOULEVARD (WEST ASHLEY) (APPROXIMATELY 0.35 ACRE) (TMS #3531300031) (COUNCIL DISTRICT 2), ANNEXED INTO THE CITY OF CHARLESTON JANUARY 10, 2023 (#2023-015), BE ZONED GENERAL BUSINESS (GB) CLASSIFICATION. THE PROPERTY IS OWNED BY CORDUROY PROPERTIES LLC.
- **2023-047 -** AN ORDINANCE TO AMEND THE ZONING ORDINANCE OF THE CITY OF CHARLESTON BY CHANGING THE ZONE MAP, WHICH IS A PART THEREOF, SO THAT 3111 MAYBANK HIGHWAY, 1850 GRIFFITH LANE, 3114 CANE SLASH ROAD (JOHNS ISLAND) (APPROXIMATELY 26.1 ACRE) (TMS #3130000064 AND 063) (COUNCIL DISTRICT 5), ANNEXED INTO THE CITY OF CHARLESTON JANUARY 10, 2023 (#2023-016), BE ZONED CONSERVATION (C) CLASSIFICATION. THE PROPERTY IS OWNED BY CITY OF CHARLESTON.
- **2023-048 -** AN ORDINANCE TO AMEND SECTION 7-14 OF ARTICLE 1, CHAPTER 7 OF THE CODE OF THE CITY OF CHARLESTON, SOUTH CAROLINA TO ESTABLISH AN ADVISORY LIVABILITY REVIEW BOARD FOR CERTAIN CODE VIOLATIONS AND THE ABATEMENT OF VACANT STRUCTURES THAT CONSTITUTE A PUBLIC NUISANCE, AND FOR THE LIVABILITY REVIEW BOARD TO HEAR APPEALS PURSUANT TO SECTION 21-64 OF ARTICLE III, CHAPTER 21 OF THE CODE OF THE CITY OF CHARLESTON, SOUTH CAROLINA.
- **2023-049 -** AN ORDINANCE AUTHORIZING THE MAYOR TO EXECUTE ON BEHALF OF THE CITY A CONSENT AND FOURTH AMENDMENT TO LEASE AGREEMENT BETWEEN THE CITY AND ECOVEST-EAST SHED DEVELOPMENT, LLC OF PROPERTY KNOWN AS THE EAST SHED LOCATED AT TMS# 460-16-02-010 DATED JANUARY 19, 2016.

2023-050 - AN ORDINANCE TO PROVIDE FOR THE ANNEXATION OF PROPERTY KNOWN AS 19 OAKDALE PLACE (.47 ACRE) (TMS# 418-14-00-003), WEST ASHLEY, CHARLESTON COUNTY, TO THE CITY OF CHARLESTON, SHOWN WITHIN THE AREA ANNEXED UPON A MAP ATTACHED HERETO AND MAKE IT PART OF DISTRICT 9. THE PROPERTY IS OWNED BY ELIZBAETH OAKLEY AND CINDY CARTER.

2023-051 - AN ORDINANCE TO PROVIDE FOR THE ANNEXATION OF PROPERTY KNOWN AS 1419 ADELE STREET (.13 ACRE) (TMS# 351-07-00-046), WEST ASHLEY, CHARLESTON COUNTY, TO THE CITY OF CHARLESTON, SHOWN WITHIN THE AREA ANNEXED UPON A MAP ATTACHED HERETO AND MAKE IT PART OF DISTRICT 7. THE PROPERTY IS OWNED BY KERR ADELE PROPERTIES LLC.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "So, we do have up for <u>first reading</u> a few items tonight. First are two items. Maybe we could take <u>one and two together</u> because they both refer to changes in the Tourism Ordinance. Either someone from Legal or Dan Riccio maybe could explain to us."

Dan Riccio said, "I'm right here, Mayor."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "There's Dan Riccio. So, did we end up with a motion to accept number one and two for first reading?"

Councilmember Brady said, "So moved."

Councilmember Shealy said, "Second."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Okay. Dan, you want to explain briefly?"

Mr. Riccio said, "Yes, sir. Real quickly, both of these ordinances are basically cleaning up our existing ordinance. The first one is the Tour Guide Licensing Requirement which is no longer required, so we're basically amending the ordinance to conform to voluntary compliance. The other ordinance is merely just removing the position of Arts and History Manager. It does not exist anymore and changing reporting to instead of the Director of Tourism to Director of Livability and Tourism. And that's it, nice and clean."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "We've got a motion on the floor. Any questions on that?"

No one asked to speak.

On a motion of Councilmember Brady, seconded by Councilmember Shealy, City Council voted unanimously to give first reading to the following bills:

An ordinance to amend Chapter 29 of the <u>City of Charleston Code of Ordinances</u> by removing references to tour guide licensing and registered tour guides and establishing a voluntary tour guide certification program.

An ordinance to amend Chapter 29 of the Code of the City of Charleston by removing references to the Manager of Arts and History/Tourism Commissions and references to Tourism Director and replacing them with Director of Livability and Tourism.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "I apologize. I overlooked that <u>number 12</u> for second reading was active as amended. I just saw that and thought it was deferred."

Councilmember Gregorie said, "Move for approval."

Councilmember Brady said, "Second."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "We've got a motion on that. Any discussion?"

No one asked to speak.

On a motion of Councilmember Gregorie, one (1) bill (Item L-12) received second reading. It passed second reading on motion by Councilmember Brady and third reading on motion of Councilmember Gregorie. On further motion of Councilmember Shealy, the rules were suspended, and the bill was immediately ratified as:

2023-052 - AN ORDINANCE TO AMEND CHAPTER 2, ARTICLE IV, DIVISION 7, SECTION 2-183(B) OF THE CODE OF THE CITY OF CHARLESTON TO STAGGER THE MEMBER TERMS OF THE CITY COUNCIL/CITIZEN RESILIENCY AND SUSTAINABILITY ADVISORY COMMITTEE. **(AS AMENDED).**

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Now back to <u>first readings. We've got number three</u> regarding the conference space requirements. Somebody from Planning want to share with us about this matter? Mr. Summerfield."

Robert Summerfield said, "Yes, Mayor and Council, so this one is an amendment to the Accommodations use. So, at present we require a certain amount of meeting space per rooms in the hotel that really has traditionally been a requirement for the Peninsula or an expectation for the Peninsula. In more Suburban model hotels, this would be like a hotel built out in West Ashley near the freeway. We don't normally see a lot of meeting space in those Suburban model hotels. They usually have some meeting space, but not a lot. So, what this amendment would do, it would just eliminate that meeting space requirement from those Accommodations uses off the Peninsula."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Alright. Any questions or discussion on that?"

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Gregg.

Councilmember Gregg said, "Thank you, Mr. Mayor. So, why have a requirement for meeting space anyway? Can you just educate us on that? I mean, if a hotel owner wanted to build their hotel and eliminate all of their meeting space and devote it all to their rooms, you know, I guess, what's the reasoning behind the Zoning Code?"

Mr. Summerfield said, "So, the way the Accommodations use was built was based on a lot of work that the Council and the community did when the Accommodations Overlay was done. On the Peninsula, it's a component of what defines an Accommodations use. In fact, we break Accommodations use particularly on the Peninsula into the full-service hotel versus a boutique or a 50-room hotel is what we normally call it. So, the meeting spaces were so that we don't have just like a bunch of hotel rooms on the Peninsula so that we create that diversity so that there's a greater draw for those properties. That is not a model, and that model really works on the Peninsula. It's not a model that you typically see though in the Suburban hotel model like what see, again, out in the Savannah Highway area in West Ashley out towards I-526. We have a property

out there that's interested in moving forward, and this was something that they demonstrated to us in the national models that they work with. They just usually do not have this meeting requirement for that type of model."

Councilmember Gregg said, "So, would other hotels, not in the Accommodations Overlay, would they be able to remodel if they wanted to and convert to this?"

Mr. Summerfield said, "Potentially. Yes. So, this is the first hotel that we're aware of that's out in that area since we've instituted that meeting area requirement and so that's kind of where this came up because we do have older hotels out particularly in the area where this latest one has raised this question. So, they do have meeting space, but per their model they don't have it based on the current Accommodations Ordinance."

Councilmember Gregg said, "Okay. Thank you."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Alright. By the way, we started the discussion, but could I entertain a motion for number three. We didn't get one on the floor."

Councilmember Shealy said, "Move for approval."

Councilmember Gregg said, "Second."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "We've got a motion to approve and a second."

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Seekings.

Councilmember Seekings said, "So, are we just abandoning the meeting space requirement off the Peninsula? Is that what we're doing?"

Mr. Summerfield said, "So, again, it would not be a requirement. It doesn't preclude anybody from including meeting space in their project, but it would be not a requirement."

Councilmember Seekings said, "I mean, as we grow as a City and the whole idea of hotel rooms and keeping people sort of centrally located, isn't that a tool that you've got that allows for that to happen? I mean, we're about to build this big ole hotel out in West Ashley which is going to have lots of meeting space, right?"

Mr. Summerfield said, "Correct."

Councilmember Seekings said, "I don't know. I think you're giving a competitive advantage and maybe missing an opportunity for us to sort of keep people and spaces that otherwise might be moving and cars and all of that kind of stuff by just getting rid of any requirements for meeting space it seems to me. By the way, the Citadel Mall is a PUD, right, so this isn't going to affect the Citadel Mall. Am I right about that?"

Mr. Summerfield said, "Correct. The Citadel Mall is a PUD. It has its requirements already established."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "So, could I ask is there a mechanism by which we could allow an exception for this like a BZA-type review, an exception rather than doing a blanket so that a case

comes like the one, frankly, that's proposed, I think, on Dulsey Road? We would be able to offer an exception rather than having the blanket. I think if we can do that, that might be worth pursuing."

Mr. Summerfield said, "Yes. So, that would definitely be one option, that just requires another layer of review and another board that that would have to go to, but that's definitely an available option."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Right. Comments? Thoughts?"

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Sakran.

Councilmember Sakran said, "Thank you. This is one of these issues where we vote on and then four years later another Councilmember says, 'How the heck did that happen?' So, I'd like to make a motion. It seems innocuous to me, but just hearing from fellow Councilmembers and myself just thinking this through, can we defer this?"

Councilmember Gregorie said, "Second."

Councilmember Sakran said, "This is one of those things where we make a decision, and I don't know what the repercussions are, to be honest with you. It seems like a pretty lengthy and hefty decision for a hotel to come in and then, so just let me get this straight, so a hotel will come in what's otherwise designated for a meeting space, they will have the opportunity to turn it into hotel space or hotel rooms. So, the unintended consequences is we are actually increasing density at some hotel locations. Is that--?"

Mr. Summerfield said, "So, to that point, yes, so if you're in an off-Peninsula location, and you're an existing hotel and you, again, to my knowledge and from our research, no one has come in since this was added to the Code in the Suburban hotel model and, therefore, been required to include meeting space that they would now then be able to convert to something else. Additionally, this meeting space is often on the ground floor which is not an area that's typically amenable to conversion to hotel rooms, but, yes, I guess, technically, if there had been a hotel that had been built under the current provisions and had been required to have meeting space, with this elimination they could go back and ask to have that space devoted to something other than meeting space which could potentially include if they aren't already at their limit because, again, we do have limits on the number of rooms that these locations can have, if they weren't already at their limit, then they could potentially convert to additional hotel rooms within their space."

Councilmember Sakran said, "And my last question, I thought this pertains to the Peninsula, too?"

Mr. Summerfield said, "No, this is off-Peninsula."

Councilmember Sakran said, "This is only off-Peninsula."

Mr. Summerfield said, "Correct. This is only changing to address that Suburban model like True Hotel or a Holiday Inn or what have you and, again, that's not to say that these locations don't provide some meeting space. They just don't typically provide meeting space at the ratios that we currently require under the current use."

Councilmember Sakran said, "I'd like to defer if possible."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "And if I may ask a question, the current requirement, is it dependent on the number of rooms, or is it just dependent on the square footage?"

Mr. Summerfield said, "I believe it's the number of rooms. The square footage is determined by the number of rooms. The amount of meeting space is determined by how many rooms you have."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Yes. So, could I, respectfully, request that rather than a simple deferral that we actually proactively ask staff to come back to us with a proposed ordinance that would allow for an exception to be made with some reasonable process for the instants where a hotel product type comes forward in an appropriate location where it's clear upon consensus that no meeting space is needed or required? Does that sound fair enough?"

Mr. Summerfield said, "Okay."

Councilmember Sakran said, "Do you want me to withdraw the deferral or amend it to include--"

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Just say deferred with that condition."

Councilmember Sakran said, "Yes, deferred with that amended condition that they come back with a solution."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Alright."

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Waring.

Councilmember Waring said, "Mr. Mayor, why doesn't this go to the Committee? Why doesn't this ordinance go to the Community Development Committee and some of this vetting could be done at the Committee level before it comes to the floor at Council?"

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "It could."

Councilmember Waring said, "I mean, we're just getting ready to deal with Slab on Grade, but it came to Committees, right? I think this should go to a Committee and get a little bit more vetting at the Committee level, Mr. Mayor. I'll make a motion that it be sent to Community Development."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "We have a motion on the floor."

Councilmember Waring said, "I thought he withdrew it."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Yes. Alright."

Councilmember Seekings said, "Defer it, put the Mayor's proviso on it, and send it to Committee."

Councilmember Waring said, "I agree with that."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "There we go. Wrap all of that together. Put a bow on it."

Councilmember Seekings said, "The triple play of motions to work on it and to send it to Committee."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Alright. Does that sound like a plan? Okay. That sounds like a motion. You got a second?"

Councilmember Gregorie said, "Second."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Okay. Councilmember Parker, did you want to be recognized?"

Councilmember Parker said, "Yes. Thank you, Mr. Mayor. Councilmember Waring, I fully agree. I mean, whether it's an ordinance that comes from City staff, from this body, I keep just, I see them on this agenda for the first time, and I thought we have had a lot of discussion. They need to go to Committee first, right?"

Councilmember Gregorie said, "Just for clarification."

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Gregorie.

Councilmember Gregorie said, "Yes, because I think if it starts from the administration, it can come directly. Now, I brought that up at our last meeting that I think we should do the same for all ordinances."

Councilmember Parker said, "Okay."

Councilmember Gregorie said, "Now, where that's gone, I'm not sure, but that was one of my recommendations because I agree with you completely."

Councilmember Parker said, "Yes."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "We mostly do that."

There was laughter in the Chamber.

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Appel.

Councilmember Appel said, "So, just to kind of pile on here, I guess, as a Zoning Ordinance, this has to go to Planning Commission."

Mr. Summerfield said, "Yes."

Councilmember Appel said, "At some point."

Mr. Summerfield said, "Yes, this is an amendment."

Councilmember Appel said, "So, typically, things go to Planning Commission first and then they come to us although that's not required."

Mr. Summerfield said, "So, yes, so let me be clear, because this is related to a project that did have some time sensitivity, and at the request of a couple of Councilmembers, we have been trying to work very closely with the applicant to try to expedite our barriers to his project. This was

requested to come to Council first for first reading because it is just that first reading, and then it would go to Planning Commission, it would have its public hearing at Planning Commission, and then it would be back at City Council and before you could give it second and third reading it would require a public hearing at City Council, as well, to vet it through that public process."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Yes, it's going to go through it's normal process."

Councilmember Appel said, "Certainly, and I mean, I understand, sometimes, you know, we get zoning ordinances here for first reading, and that's perfectly proper, but I would say if this developer is on a timeline, I mean, the fastest way to go is file a variance application and get in front of a BZA agenda, and if he can make the case and gets the support of folks, at least we can solve this issue at least, and then we can have a more deliberate conversation about whether we want to change the ordinance for everybody. That's just some free zoning legal advice there."

There was laughter in the Chamber.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Don't send us a bill. Alright. There's a motion on the floor to defer to bring back a different style ordinance on this and then bring it to the Community Development Committee at this point."

On a motion of Councilmember Sakran, seconded by Councilmember Gregorie, City Council voted unanimously to defer Item M-3 and refer it to the Committee on Community Development:

An ordinance to amend Chapter 54 of the Code of the City of Charleston (Zoning Ordinance) by revising Section 54-220 pertaining to conference space requirements in the Accommodations Overlay Zone District in the Peninsula portion of the City. (DEFERRED)

Councilmember Gregorie said, "Mr. Mayor."

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Gregorie.

Councilmember Gregorie said, "I really don't want us to ignore the discussion that Councilmember Parker brought up, that I brought up, at the last meeting."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Well, I hear you loud and clear, and I think the answer to that was just given by our Planning Director that we were trying to facilitate--"

Councilmember Gregorie said, "No, that's not the answer to the question I'm pitching about, Mayor. The answer to the question, the issue, for me is what we apply for Council to--"

Councilmember Bowden said, "A point of order."

Councilmember Gregorie said, "Yes."

Councilmember Bowden said, "I think we're talking about that next. Could we just go ahead and introduce that so we can talk it about it on--"

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "That's a good point. So, next up is number four on bills for first reading, an ordinance to amend our Council Rules. Was it not Rules of Order?"

The Clerk said, "I think that's in a different part of the Code, but it's related."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "It's related. It's all a part of our Rules and, honestly, we will stick to the agenda. So, number four, can I entertain a motion to approve number four?"

Councilmember Shealy said, "Move for approval."

Councilmember Waring said, "Second."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "And we have a second, and I think I'd go to Councilmember Brady whose Ad Hoc Committee reviewed this."

Councilmember Brady said, "Yes. So, the Ad Hoc Rules Committee met last week to review. Since we deferred it at the last Council meeting, we had a nice discussion. I think we took care of some of the issues and some things that Legal had brought to us to help resolve the Constitutional issue. You guys and lady should have been sent that under separate cover for the new language. I would add that the proposal on how the Committee appointment process works is just one part of this overall package here where we've made some tweaks that the Clerk's Office has recommended and some other things that we would like to see be able to go into force that just clean up the Rules a little bit, as well, on that. So, it's already been moved and seconded, so I don't have to do that, but that's just kind of the background from what went on at the meeting."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Alright. Any discussion on this?"

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Gregg.

Councilmember Gregg said, "I just have a quick question. Section 237, paragraph 2, 'Reading of the journal of the previous meeting.' We're not going to re-read the whole minutes. I just want everybody to understand that means our meetings are going to last twice as long."

There was laughter in the Chamber.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "When we give approval, it's in effect a reading of the matter just like we gave second and third reading tonight of all of those 12 items, we didn't, you know--"

Councilmember Gregg said, "Okay. Thank you very much."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Alright. Well, any other discussion on this matter? Yes, I will call the question. Are you sure? We could talk about this for a while, right, Councilmember Waring?"

There was laughter in the Chamber.

On a motion of Councilmember Shealy, seconded by Councilmember Waring, City Council voted to give first reading on the following bill:

An ordinance to amend Article II (City Council), Division 2 (Rules of Order) of Chapter 2 of the Code of the City of Charleston (Administration)

The vote was not unanimous. The motion passed 10 to 3. Councilmembers Shahid, Bowden, and Mayor Tecklenburg voted nay.

The Clerk said, "So, the nays were Mayor Tecklenburg, Councilmember Shahid, and Councilmember Bowden? Okay. Thank you."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Right, but I think she's got a good count."

Councilmember Waring said, "Mr. Mayor."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Alright. The motion passes."

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Waring.

Councilmember Waring said, "I just wanted to thank Council, staff, and everybody for their indulgence. This turned into an arduous process, but I do look forward for the future discussions and the collegial atmosphere hopefully that will come with a confluence of conversation, and we can go about doing this next year. Thank you."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Yes, sir."

Councilmember Seekings said, "And for Councilmember Brady for stepping up."

Councilmember Waring said, "Oh, yes. Thank you."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Alright. We do have a request to withdraw numbers six and seven under first reading. I don't think those are needed anymore."

Councilmember Mitchell said, "Move to withdraw numbers six and seven in first reading."

Councilmember Gregorie said, "Second."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Okay. Any discussion?"

No one asked to speak.

On a motion of Councilmember Mitchell, seconded by Councilmember Gregorie, City Council voted unanimously to withdraw Items M-6 and M-7:

An ordinance to amend Appendix B "Business License Class Schedule (adopted Nov. 9, 2021)" to Chapter 7, Article II of the Code of the City of Charleston to modify the exemption to Lessors of residential buildings and dwellings. (WITHDRAWN)

An ordinance amending Article II - Recreation Department; Section 22-24-Municipal Golf Course-Management. (WITHDRAWN)

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "And, lastly, we do have a call for an Executive Session regarding a legal update on Dockside safety issues. So, can I entertain a motion--"

Councilmember Waring said, "Before we go into Executive Session---"

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Waring.

Councilmember Waring continued, "Thank you, Mayor. This Council sometime back did a resolution to ask for passage of the Hate Crime legislation. Well, that bill at least passed the House I think last week, so I would hope that we could at least send a letter thanking our delegation for being behind, obviously, Representative Gilliard, thanking them for that and hopefully maybe we can do a resolution asking for it's passage in the South Carolina Senate coming up. So, I hope we could maybe have that on the next agenda."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "No problem at all."

Councilmember Waring said, "Thank you."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Absolutely."

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Sakran.

Councilmember Sakran said, "Thank you. That's a great idea Councilmember Waring. It will be on the next agenda. Me and Jennifer have been working on that, Mayor."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Alright. Can I entertain a motion we go into <u>Executive</u> <u>Session?"</u>

Councilmember Shahid said, "So moved."

Councilmember Sakran said, "Second."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "We've got a motion and a second."

On a motion of Councilmember Shahid, seconded by Councilmember Sakran, City Council voted unanimously to go into Executive Session at 7:19 p.m.

On a motion of Councilmember Waring, seconded by Councilmember Gregorie, City Council voted unanimously to <u>come out of Executive Session</u> at 7:31 p.m.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Let the record show that no action was taken while we were in Executive Session. Is there any other business to come before us this evening?"

No one asked to speak.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Hearing none, we stand adjourned. Thank you, all."

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 7:32 p.m.

Jennifer B. Cook Clerk of Council