#### **COUNCIL CHAMBER**

Regular Meeting

March 26, 2019

The seventy-second meeting of the City Council of Charleston was held this date convening at 5:00 p.m. at City Hall.

A notice of this meeting and an agenda were mailed to the news media March 20, 2019 and appeared in <u>The Post and Courier</u> March 24, 2019 and are made available on the City's website.

## PRESENT (12)

## The Honorable John J. Tecklenburg, Mayor

Councilmember White	District 1	Councilmember Waring	District 7
Councilmember Shealy	District 2	Councilmember Seekings	District 8
Councilmember Lewis	District 3	Councilmember Shahid	District 9
Councilmember Mitchell	District 4	Councilmember Griffin	District 10
Councilmember Wagner	District 5	Councilmember Moody	District 11
Councilmember Gregorie (absent)	District 6	Councilmember Jackson	District 12

Mayor Tecklenburg called the meeting to order at 5:00 p.m.

The Clerk called the roll.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Now, if you would like to join us, Councilmember Seekings will lead us in a prayer and a Pledge of Allegiance."

Councilmember Seekings said, "Thank you, Mr. Mayor."

Councilmember Seekings opened the meeting with an invocation.

Councilmember Seekings then led City Council in the Pledge of Allegiance.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Thank you very much. I think everyone knows this, but just in case there happens to be an emergency and we have to evacuate the building, use these two exits to the hallway. Do not use the elevator, but go down the two sets of stairs and then the one set of stairs out the front to Broad Street. It's a very unlikely event, but just so you will know, and there is also an exit door from the room to my right.

Now, first order is to recognize the State Champion 11 - 12 year old All Star Team, along with their Athletic Staff. Are you all here? Would you all like to join me? Here they come, the State Champs. Alright."

There was a standing ovation in the Chamber.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "So, this 11- and 12-year old All Star Team first competed in the District Tournament in Bluffton, South Carolina on March  $2^{nd}$  and  $3^{rd}$  during the three-game

tournament. They defeated teams from North Charleston, Orangeburg, and Bluffton in the finals. Then, this win sent them to the State Tournament in Florence, South Carolina to represent the Southern District on March 8th. The team won their first game against Florence and played the Central Division Champion Columbia Team in the finals, which was a real back and forth game, which required our team to come from behind for an exciting win. The coaches for this team are LaNard Davis, Mario Drayton, and Darryl Capleton. The Team Roster is Jayden Brown, Marquis Simmons, James Maxwell, Cameron Davis, Jalen Brown-Singleton, Da'Sean Capers, Jamorian Roper, Kevin Brown, Dream Watson, and Jerrell Perry. On behalf of the City, we would like to congratulate you all and wish you continued success in the future. State Champion 11- and 12-year old All Star Team from Charleston, South Carolina. Coach, would you like to say a few words?"

There was applause in the Chamber.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Tell us about the experience."

Coach Davis said, "It's a good experience, of which I'm pretty fortunate because this is my third one in six years. So, I'm doing pretty good. I just want to thank the Department of Recreation, Laurie, and Robin, and all of them for their support. I especially thank Joe and Colette. They really take care of us. We just want to thank you all for inviting us here today, and it's a great thing. Thank you all very much."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Alright. We're very proud of you. Thank you. Can we get a picture together? Laurie, come up here and join us. We have a girl All Star on the team, and her name is Dream Watson."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Thanks again. Congratulations! Way to go!"

There was applause in the Chamber.

Mayor Tecklenburg continued, "Appreciate you all coming. Dream, congratulations! Way to go."

Coach Davis said, "Thank you."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Yes, sir. Thank you, Coach. Next, I'd like to introduce some amazing young students from the College of Charleston. They are part of the Charleston's Jewish Student Union Hillel. Is Mark Swick with us today? Samantha Krantz, Maddie Grosoff and whoever else you all have, come forward please. I know Samantha. So, you all, this is an amazing young woman. In honor of the many who had passed in the genocide of the Holocaust, she and her classmates planted, what, over a thousand daffodils last year?"

Ms. Krantz said, "Thousands, yes."

Mr. Swick said, "Several thousand over three years."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Several thousand daffodils over three years, and I met them about a month ago, and they told me that they wanted to bring awareness to genocide. So, this month coming up, we would like to proclaim to be Genocide Awareness and Prevention Month. Even though you think about the Holocaust happening after World War II, we have to keep an awareness and education going, as we even saw in the world just ten days ago a terrible mass killing of our Muslim brothers and sisters in New Zealand. So, we can't forget, and I have this proclamation. I don't think I'm going to read the whole thing, but I'll read a few highlights."

Mayor Tecklenburg read the proclamation.

#### ---INSERT PROCLAMATION---

There was applause in the Chamber.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Thank you. Mark or Samantha, would someone like to say a few words? Please introduce yourself."

Maddie Grosoff said. "I'm Maddie."

Samantha Krantz said, "I'm Samantha."

Ms. Grosoff said, "We wanted to thank the City of Charleston and the Mayor for always being so supportive and for helping us."

Ms. Krantz said, "We would also like to extend an invitation to you all for our event on April 4<sup>th</sup> at 6:00 p.m. in the Cistern Yard. The rain location is the Rita Hollings Cancer Building on campus which is Room 101. This event is called 'Together We Remember.' So, it's bringing all of College of Charleston students and the campus and the Charleston community together to remember as one and to really call for action against all genocide. We hope that you all will join us next Thursday, at 6:00 p.m. on campus. Thank you."

There was applause in the Chamber.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Great. Thank you for what you do. Maddie, thank you. Samantha, thank you so much."

Mr. Swick said, "Thank you, Mayor."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Alright. So, finally, it was mentioned in Councilmember Seekings's prayer, and I would like to further recognize a man who recently passed this week, Julian Smith, who was friend to all he met. I don't think he ever met a stranger. If he ever met a person, I think he was instantly their friend. He had that kind of warm personality. He became a fixture of Charleston in representing us for years as the Executive Director of the Cooper River Bridge Run. He was an Ambassador for Charleston as he helped establish similar runs, marathons, and events around the world, particularly around the country. If I may call on Councilmember Seekings to share a few remembrances about our good friend, Julian Smith."

Councilmember Seekings said, "Thank you, Mr. Mayor. Just very briefly, some of you might have noticed there were packets left on your chairs tonight from the Bridge Run which actually is occurring on Saturday, April 6th at 8:00 a.m. In that packet is not a number, so any of you who would like to run, I would like to invite you to be my quests. We'll get you a number, and if you can be at the start line at 8:00 a.m., we'll all do it together. Last Friday, Julian Smith, who was my friend, and that puts me in a very large subset of people in the world, passed away at the age of 67. He was, if you did not know him, both literally and figuratively larger than life. As the Mayor noted, there was not a stranger in his world, and his world came to an end all too soon, but what he did in this community is amazing. You can look at the Bridge Run. It started with humble beginnings of a thousand people. He's been running it for 25 years. It is now the biggest community event that we've got in this area, in this State, really in this region, maybe in the United States, but more so than a Bridge Run, he was an integral part of this community who people looked up to, me being one of them. He was a true friend and leader, and I can tell you he will be sorely missed. There is no replacing Julian Smith, but he will never be far from all of our thoughts and our prayers. His family has been amazing through all of this. He lived his last day as if it was his first. He was a fighter. He died of glioblastoma which, as you all know, is a rough way to go, but if you had seen him two weeks before, he was still as optimistic and as full of life as anyone in the world. So, tomorrow from 1:00 p.m. to 4:00 p.m. at James A. McAllister Funeral Home, there will be a visitation. Then, tomorrow night from 6:00 p.m. to 8:00 p.m. at the Hibernian Society. Please come and join in the celebration of the life of Julian Smith. For those of you who knew him and want to participate in keeping his memory alive, the Hollings Cancer Center was very involved in both his life and the life of the Bridge Run and in the community. Donations there will be greatly accepted. Let me just say, I can tell you, just on a personal note, I spent many an hour, day, week of my life with Julian Smith traveling all over, literally, the world, and he lit up a room like no one ever did. We would all like to be able to be that, and I just was happy to have been following him as he lit up this world. He will be greatly missed. So, thank you, Mr. Mayor. Prayers for Julian as he passes on, and we will all see him at the Finish Line. Thank you."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Thank you so much. So the next order of business, we have four public hearings this evening, and I'm betting Mr. Morgan is going to present those to us. The first is simply an ordinance regarding setbacks on the part of the Daniel Island Master Plan; but I will turn it over to you, Mr. Morgan, for further explanation."

Christopher Morgan said, "Thank you, Mr. Mayor, members of Council. We have a few slides that kind of exemplify this proposed amendment that is E-1. This is amendments to the Daniel Island Master Plan and the visual buffer zone that's at the back of some lots up against the marsh areas on Daniel Island. There are some images here. These are some lots that had already been subdivided that had their delineation of their critical area at the back of the lot or side of the lot had expired, so they were going to have to alter how they could be developed. What we are looking at doing instead is having a slight modification to the visual buffer zone that let's the distance of that visual buffer zone diminish slightly by a few feet, provided that the mitigation can have the vegetation fit within that narrower area. Instead of 10 feet, it might be eight feet. You still have the same amount of vegetation so, in effect, you have the same kind of visual buffer that you would have had anyway. This is just an image here that shows plats that were approved at a time in the past. This is a delineation on these plats of July, 2013, and it just lasted for five years. So, of course, that has expired, and that's part of the reason for this. This is a subject lot that shows how the visual buffer zone works and the amendment could work on the site, and just some other examples in the area. Not a lot of lots are affected by this, but this saves having to have a lot of individual variances before the BZA. So, our staff was very comfortable with this and feel it's a very minor amendment in general and recommended approval as to the Planning Commission, and now it comes before you."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Alright. Would anyone like to be heard on this matter?"

No one asked to speak.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Hearing none, it comes to Council."

Councilmember Seekings said, "Move for approval."

Councilwoman Jackson said, "Second."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "We have a motion to approve. Is there any discussion?"

No one asked to speak.

On a motion of Councilmember Seekings, seconded by Councilwoman Jackson, City Council voted unanimously to give first reading to the following bill:

An ordinance to amend Chapter 54 of the Code of the City of Charleston (Zoning Ordinance) by amending Section 54-263, the Daniel Island Master Plan Zoning text, to add provisions that allow the Visual Buffer Zone Setback to be reduced or eliminated and

allow the Visual Buffer Zone to be reduced when conditions specified in the new provisions are met (**AS AMENDED**).

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "E-2."

Mr. Morgan said, "This is another very minor amendment. This is related to the MU-1 and MU-2 Workforce Housing Districts. This is an amendment that allows, that clarifies how fee-in-lieu can work with condo-type units in those projects. This has already come before you all for a first reading, and both staff and Planning Commission recommended approval, and now it comes to you for second reading tonight and the public hearing."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Alright. Would anyone like to be heard on this matter?"

No one asked to speak.

Councilmember Seekings said, "So moved."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "We have a motion to approve."

Councilwoman Jackson said, "I'll second."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "We've got a second. Is there any discussion?"

No one asked to speak.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "We've been working on this for some time."

No one asked to speak.

On a motion of Councilmember Seekings, one (1) bill (Item E-2) received second reading. It passed second reading on motion by Councilwoman Jackson and third reading on motion of Councilmember Seekings. On further motion of Councilmember Griffin, the rules were suspended, and the bill was immediately ratified as:

2019-019

AN ORDINANCE TO AMEND PROVISIONS OF CHAPTER 54 OF THE CODE OF THE CITY OF CHARLESTON (ZONING ORDINANCE) PERTAINING TO ARTICLE 2, PART 15 – MIXED USE 1 - WORKFORCE HOUSING DISTRICT AND MIXED USE 2 - WORKFORCE HOUSING DISTRICT. (AS AMENDED)

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Thank you very much. E-3."

Mr. Morgan said, "This is in line with some of the amendments we're making for the Opportunity Zones. This was discussed by our Community Development Committee and then had a first reading before Council. This is an amendment to the Upper Peninsula Zoning District that would require that we get actual workforce units if a building is over four stories in height. Right now, it's just one of many things that people can earn their height through by providing workforce units. This would say that if you're going to go above four stories, you've got to actually have the workforce units. This is something we thought was very important to get implemented as we're seeing the Opportunity Zones come into the City. Almost the entire, I believe the entire Upper Peninsula District is in the Opportunity Zone area, so we thought it was something that should be moving forward with as much speed as possible to allow for those investments, and both the staff and the Planning Commission endorsed this amendment, and it is before you tonight for the public hearing."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Alright. Would anyone like to be heard on this matter? Yes, sir."

1. Anthony G. Bryant said this was a serious issue for him. He said Senator Tim Scott was on County Council Enterprise and Empowerment Zones, but the Opportunity Zones, in his opinion, ran throughout the country. He said developers benefited from the Enterprise and Empowerment Zones. He said Council would certainly approve it based upon the price points which were extremely high in this area. He said years ago before prices got so high, Councilmember Waring and Tim Keane tried to keep people in their homes and neighborhoods because of tax implications, increased property values, and Councilmember Waring never took credit for that. He said the Opportunity Zones needed to look at all of the properties owned by the State and Federal Government. He said the State Ports Authority, which was on State property, would flip over to a developer for a hotel. He said the City needed to make sure the zones reflected what they intended to reflect, not Workforce Housing, but low income housing.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Thank you very much. Would anyone else like to be heard on this matter?"

No one else asked to speak.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Hearing none, it comes before Council."

Councilmember Mitchell said, "Mr. Mayor, even the Upper Peninsula, the area that I represent, I want to make sure that when the developers come, I want to see exactly what they say about Workforce Housing, and what is going to be the percentage of the AMI they're going to be using? Most of them are using 80 percent to 150 percent of the AMI, and we need to have some units that are going to be below that. I know it's going to be hard to get, but I'm going to have to bring it back to Council because we need to have some units that are going to be in that particular housing, at least 60 percent of the AMI. It's not going any lower than that. I know that, but everybody is looking at economics now, and they want the higher price, but we have to look at that very seriously because the Upper Peninsula is going to be the last area that we have in this City to do any big developing. So, that's all in the district I represent, and I really don't want them to kind of wipe me out anyway, or wipe the district out for the people that are living in that area because we're going up higher. They can go up to 12 stories and things like that, but we're going to have to hold these developers' feet to the fire, too, on this because they're coming in our City to do this development, and we need it for tax breaks. We still need to have people staying here that can afford like our firemen, the policemen, and the teachers, and everyone else. Some people want to come back in the City who left the City because they couldn't afford to stay here. So, very seriously, when this comes back, I want to see the developers, and I want to really sit down and talk with them when they begin to start developing."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Right."

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Lewis.

Councilmember Lewis said, "Mr. Mayor."

Councilmember Moody said, "A point of order. We need a motion and a second."

Councilmember Seekings said, "So moved."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "We do have a motion. Do we have a second?"

Councilmember Lewis said, "Second."

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Lewis.

Councilmember Lewis said, "As I said in the Community Development Committee, I'm not too enthused about this zone, but because it was drawn by the Federal Government and the State Government, and not City Council, we really don't have a lot of leverage to say what we're going to do in this zone, but we know that the developers are going to benefit from this zone. It's not going to be the people that are living in the City of Charleston because if you look at all of the development right now that's going on in the Upper Peninsula and around Columbus Street and all of that area down there, those developers are going to benefit. We're not going to benefit from it, so I'm not too enthused about it."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Right. Councilmember Lewis and Council, if I may share with you, the matter here is about the Upper Peninsula, and it includes an Opportunity Zone, but that matter will come before us in just a little bit when we talk about our Community Development Committee Report."

Councilmember Lewis said, "I understand that."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Okay."

Councilmember Lewis said, "Okay. Thank you."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Just making sure we understood that because prior to this ordinance coming forward, unless you requested a MU-2 zoning, there was no requirement for affordability or Workforce Housing."

Councilmember Lewis said, "I think we're just blowing smoke with this, too. We're not going to get anything out of this."

Mayor Tecklenburg continued, "In the Upper Peninsula."

Councilmember Lewis continued, "The developer is going to get something out of this, but the people in Charleston, although we're going to approve this zoning, I just don't feel it's going to help us."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Alright."

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilwoman Jackson followed by Councilmember Shahid.

Councilwoman Jackson said, "Thank you, Mayor. I do have to associate myself with my colleagues, Councilmembers Mitchell and Lewis, and the gentleman who addressed us during the public hearing. I know that we're trying to put the best opportunity, not to use that word, the best circumstance, on the reasons that we have Master Planned the Upper Peninsula to be some of the tallest and most dense properties that we're going to be zoning and permitting over the next several years. I do appreciate that we're trying hard to include affordable units in these developments. I'm just concerned that it's a finite proposition, and we don't have that much land, and we don't have those many buildings that are going to be coming under this regulation. So, to keep our percentage at ten percent of the amount of the total units that we're going to be

permitting under this increase of density just bothers me. I said my piece during the Community Development Committee. The majority of the Committee wanted to put this forward to the Council, and so, I don't think that we've got a chance right now to make it any more robust, but I would hold that place that I think we need to keep looking at this and keep understanding, as Councilmember Mitchell has said, case by case, what we're going to be asked to approve with these individual development applications. Thank you."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Thank you."

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Shahid.

Councilmember Shahid said, "This is more of a question, Mr. Mayor, for Mr. Morgan. If you could refresh my memory, these units that are set aside, they will be timed out after 20 years?"

Mr. Morgan said, "I believe these go to--Mrs. Shaw Johnson."

Councilmember White said, "It doesn't say."

Councilmember Lewis said, "Two people on staff, and they can't answer a question."

Councilmember White said, "It's not spelled out in the ordinance."

Mr. Morgan said, "Yes. Because it kicks back to our other part of our Workforce Housing section and I think, Mrs. Shaw Johnson is coming up."

Geona Shaw Johnson said, "Christopher, it was my understanding, and City Council, that rental is 30 units. Ownership was 90 years."

Mr. Morgan said, "Right. Because it goes back to our other ordinance that's standard."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "How many years?"

Mrs. Shaw Johnson said, "On the rental units, it was 30 years." On for sale units, 90 years."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Thank you."

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Shahid.

Councilmember Shahid said, "Is there a way to convert the rental units into owner occupied?"

Mr. Morgan said, "This is all done at the time of permitting. You're allocating which units are going which way, so I don't think you would be able to change it at that time if you're using them as your credited workforce units."

Councilmember Shahid said, "Thank you."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Is there any other discussion?"

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Waring.

Councilmember Waring said, "Thank you, Mr. Mayor. I think it's important for us to note that, even though this is in the Federal Government Opportunity Zone, the zonings and subsequent rezonings are within the power of City Government. The Federal Government doesn't come in here and zone this property, and that would be the period of time to negotiate even

further. So, I feel the same way you do, Councilmember Lewis, because it was Councilmember Lewis that pointed out to all of us that this Upper Peninsula is, in fact, the last frontier if there is going to be any affordable housing created for the people that work in this City, and quite frankly, run this City, the faceless people, but they get it done. So, when the rezoning opportunities come, that is in fact the opportunity to negotiate further for affordable housing. So, that's institutional knowledge that needs to be passed on from, not only this Council, but the Council that will come. Thank you."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Thank you very much. Is there any further discussion?"

No one else asked to speak.

On a motion of Councilmember Seekings, one (1) bill (Item E-3) received second reading. It passed second reading on motion by Councilmember Lewis and third reading on motion of Councilmember Griffin. On further motion of Councilmember Shealy, the rules were suspended, and the bill was immediately ratified as:

2019-020 AN ORDINANCE TO AMEND PROVISIONS OF CHAPTER 54 OF THE CODE OF THE CITY OF CHARLESTON (ZONING ORDINANCE) BY AMENDING PART 17 – UPPER PENINSULA DISTRICT PERTAINING TO STRENGTHENING WORKFORCE HOUSING.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Thank you very much. Now, E-4, Mr. Morgan."

Mr. Morgan said, "This is an amendment related to parking for churches, allowing parking for churches in Conservation and Residential Zones, provided that conditions are met such as landscaping and location of the parking being approved by the staff, but it makes it a little bit easier for the churches to use Residential Zones and Conservation Districts for parking. Both staff and the Planning Commission recommend approval."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Alright. Would anyone like to be heard on this matter? Yes, sir. Please come forward."

1. Anthony G. Bryant thanked Councilmember Waring for the bill.

Councilmember Seekings said, "Thank you very much."

Councilmember Griffin said, "Move for approval."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Thank you very much, Councilmember Waring."

Councilwoman Jackson said, "I'll second."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "We have a motion. Would anyone else like to be heard on this matter? I saw Reverend Gordon here, but I didn't know if was coming to speak on this matter. You're good? Alright. We have a motion on the floor and a second."

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Mitchell.

Councilmember Mitchell said, "Yes, Mr. Mayor. I'm glad to see that this is done. I know my colleague, Councilmember Waring, brought it to the floor, but I'm glad to see this happening. We lost a lot of African American churches for that same reason, and two of them, I think, were in my district. One was on Spring Street, and one was the Shiloh AME Church. They moved

because of that same reason, the parking facilities. They didn't have a problem parking because Smith Street was all African American at one time. People look at me funny, but I said the problem wasn't there until the influx of other people moving into the area, and they started calling the parking enforcement officer on the church people. They started calling the policemen on them if their car's back tire touched the yellow line and many people were getting tickets all over the place. They got tired of it, and when they came to the Board meetings, they got tickets. So, they ended up moving and selling the church. The original church was destroyed, and that was a new church that was built after Hugo. They ended up moving out, and they still have to go out now and build another church.

It's ridiculous because one thing about us, we know that people go to church, it's a sacrament to them. That's the way the African American community works and they never had a problem in the area, but as soon as the influx of people came in, and they may have gotten angry. I have spoken about this on Council many times because I didn't like it, and now they moved away. We lost that particular church, we lost the one on Spring Street, and we've got some other churches that we're looking at moving off this Peninsula, and we've been called the Holy City. There isn't going be a Holy City because most of the churches are going to be moving for the same reason. We've got Macedonia leaving, and that's another African American church in my district also. So, hopefully this might help, and I hope that we abide by, and we let everyone know that this is the case for churches. They should also be able to use it when they're having their Board meetings. They might have it once a week. They might have choir rehearsal. We're going to let the parking enforcement officer know to be lenient with the church people when they're having those meetings because, otherwise, I'm going to bring it right back into Council, and we're going to have a problem."

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Griffin.

Councilmember Griffin said, "Well, I just want to kind of touch on your statements there. They were just spot on, and we do a great job of helping everybody in Charleston. We help developers. We help tourists. It's about time we actually stood up for what our name is, the Holy City, and it feels good when we actually do something good for the people that made our City great, our residents, our churchgoers. Sunday is still sacred in Charleston, and we don't want to ever lose that title of the Holy City, so we have to definitely respect and honor our people going to so many great services all over the City. Any time that we have an opportunity to get more people to have faith in our Lord, this is a great, great ordinance and we need to look out for all of the people that are going on Saturdays, Sundays, whenever, to join any congregation in our Holy City."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Thank you. Is there any further discussion?"

Councilmember Waring said, "Mr. Mayor."

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Waring.

Councilmember Waring said, "Thank you. I want to thank the staff for working through this one, Legal, our Traffic and Transportation Committee, and Department Heads. This was one that came before us, actually it was November of 2017, so that's how long it's taken to get this one. I don't want to be facetious, but inside, I really do want to say 'Hallelujah,' so this is good, but I think we can actually reflect on some of the parking zones, in particular, what Councilmember Mitchell was talking about. On Sundays, in some other districts, you get to park if you're there for the religious hours, and as a matter of fact, I have some of those pictures of the signs that say that, in particular, on Hasell Street and I think Wentworth Street, and those type of signs need to

be placed not only in those areas but, in particular, streets where you have sanctuaries on them. So, we can do better, but thank you so much for bringing this forward, so we can pass this today. Thank you."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Yes, sir, and thank you for your leadership on this matter. Yes, sir. Is there any further discussion?"

No one else asked to speak.

On a motion of Councilmember Griffin, one (1) bill (Item E-4) received second reading. It passed second reading on motion by Councilwoman Jackson and third reading on motion of Councilmember Mitchell. On further motion of Councilmember Shahid, the rules were suspended, and the bill was immediately ratified as:

2019-021 AN ORDINANCE TO AMEND CHAPTER 54 OF THE CODE OF THE CITY OF CHARLESTON (ZONING ORDINANCE) BY AMENDING SECTION 54-206 AND SECTION 54-207 TO MAKE PARKING FOR CHURCHES A CONDITIONAL USE WITHIN THE CONSERVATION AND ALL RESIDENTIAL ZONING DISTRICTS.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Next, our minutes have been deferred. We hadn't quite gotten them ready for you yet, so we're going to bring those back to the next meeting. So, next up is our Citizens Participation Period. We've got ten or a dozen folks. I'm going to ask everyone to keep it to two minutes, please, and Madam Clerk will call out your names. Please state your name and address when you come to address us. Thank you."

Madam Clerk said, "So, we'll begin with Mohammed Idris followed by Anthony Bryant, Ade OFunniyin, also known as Dr. O, LaSheia Oubre, and Johanna Carrington."

- 1. Mohammed Idris read a quote from the Post and Courier which stated 'Music therapist in tune with children'. He said the article said the music was destroying children, as it was being blast through the streets daily. He hoped Council could do something to work with people to stop the music as it was on T.V., radio, and video games. On another matter, he said Council had made a great change. He remembered the former Mayor saying they couldn't go any higher than three stories with buildings on the Peninsula.
- 2. Anthony G. Bryant said 40 percent of the State was poor and could not afford to retain legal counsel. He said people should read 'Treatise of the Human Nature' by David Hume, 'Dialogues and Natural History of Religion', 'The History of England', 'Theory of Moral Sentiments' by Adam Smith, and 'An Inquiry into the Nature and Causes of Wealth of Nations', 'Sketch of a Negro Code' by Edmund Burke, and 'Security for the Independence of Parliament'. He said true Charlestonians knew their history, and each one was about white men against slavery which was black history, as well. They had to talk in contemporary terms regarding their faith system. People's faith systems were in their deeds, not in words, as his grandfather had taught him. People pontificated all the time about their faith system, and the application was not there. It was not seen in the data or in humanity towards each other. People had to begin to be about the business of taking care of people again. The Supreme Court was too busy for poor people, and they had no government. People needed to participate. attend meetings, and get involved. People didn't have to be experts. The Army Corps of Engineers was doing what they had to do, and the people had to stand up for their community.

3. Dr. Ade OFunniyin said he was with the Gullah Society and people may have seen him and other members on the news talking about the reinterment of the bones on Anson Street. He had stood before Council once before talking about the reinterment of those bones, and he believed that the Mayor was suggesting a proclamation for their reinterment. Listening to what had been said about their beloved City, the Holy City, as it was called, and when he considered the many burial grounds that he had the experience of walking over the last couple of years that had been neglected, overgrown, highways built over them, buildings built over them, a large percentage of the burial grounds were of African and other descent. There were some burial grounds that Confederate soldiers and others were in that were well kept and maintained. He listened to people talk about the conditions that Charlestonians found themselves in."

The Clerk called time.

LaSheia Oubre yielded her time to Dr. OFunniyin.

Dr. Ofunniyin continued that others didn't seem to have passion or compassion for each other. Several months ago, he stood in the Chamber when the Mayor suggested the City apologize for slavery, and that was a motion that was not fully received by Council. To him, it spoke to where Charleston was as a City. Unless that was changed, future generations would be in the same Chamber dealing with issues that were far worse than the ones the City was dealing with today. He didn't know what Council would say in regards to the Mayor's proclamation. He hoped it was positive and affirmative, but he encouraged Council and those who were policymakers to really pay attention to what the citizens of Charleston were saying. When he said 'citizens of Charleston,' he included everybody, but some people were 'come here's' and some were 'been here's'. Some people had stayed here.

The Clerk called time.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Thank you."

Ms. Johanna Carrington yielded her time to Dr. OFunniyin.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Well, this is not intended to be a filibuster."

Dr. OFunniyin said, "No, I just have one other thing to say. I'm not filibustering."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Please wrap up, Dr. O."

Dr. OFunniyin said, "I'm not filibustering."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "I understand."

Dr. OFunniyin continued that people were suffering, and unless they paid attention to their suffering, he didn't care how many police chiefs were hired or who was brought in to solve problems. Unless they paid attention to the problems that people were faced with, they were not a Holy City.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Thank you, sir."

Councilmember Griffin said, "Mr. Mayor, just as a point of order. I think we need to make a decision on whether we're going to let people take other people's time because we've never allowed that before."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Well, I have allowed it on occasion."

Councilmember Griffin said, "But why are we allowing some people, but not others? We either need to do that or we need to not do that."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "I hear you. Let's move on with whoever is next. That was Ms. Carrington."

The Clerk said, "We have LaSheia."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "She yielded her time, as well."

The Clerk said, "Alright. Let's see who we have after that. Ralph Carrington."

Ralph Carrington said, "I concede my time to Ms. Carrington."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "We're going to ask you, if you've signed up, to please speak for yourself. We'll be happy to have your comments. Speak for yourself."

The Clerk said, "Alright. Quadre Stuckey."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Would you like to address the Council? You signed up to speak."

4. Quadre Stuckey said he was a native Charlestonian and an artist, actor, and entrepreneur. He was a part of the Gullah Society, and he was the next generation. He had been working with Dr. O and the group, and they had done a lot of great things with the Gullah Society. He hoped Council would come out to their celebration on May 4, 2019 where they would have the reinterment going on along with a parade, culture, festivals, and unity for the whole City. They wanted everybody to come out to support, show love, and show everybody what the Holy City was really about because it was all about the bigger picture of 'Love Conquers All', so they wanted to bring everybody together and paint a bigger picture.

Councilmember Waring said, "Mr. Mayor, I'm going to ask a privilege. Ms. Carrington did sign up to speak. She attempted to yield her time, and that wasn't allowed. I would hope you and Council would allow Ms. Carrington to speak. These people have actually done some good work."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "They've done great work."

Councilmember Mitchell said, "Great work, following, I can tell you they've done what we didn't. These are salt of the earth people over here. If we would allow Ms. Carrington to have whatever the time is allowed."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "I understand. Let's finish the list, and I'd be happy to recognize Ms. Carrington."

Ms. Carrington said, "Thank you, Councilmember."

The Clerk said, "So, we'll have Jason Taylor, and Denetria Smith."

- Jason Taylor said he didn't have a district. He had a community, and what had 5. happened in the community was deplorable. Based on Team One's Owner Reports, there were 22 significant crimes. Team Two in the same period had two significant crimes. There were meetings with his neighbors and Chief Reynolds. The issue was community policing. He was a Charlestonian. Chief Greenberg was on roller blades in the neighborhood. They were citizens of the community, and they demanded community policing, responsiveness, and accountability. The Police Department had not shown up for their Neighborhood Association meeting. In the Westside, the police had not showed up since 2019 to the Neighborhood Association. They were now tracking, on cameras, the absence of a police presence on the Westside, the Hampton Park Terrace area, North Central, and the crime correlated to that. The absence of police on the street, the isolation of police, was all Chief Revnolds' policy. He said in his own department, he wanted the 2018 pledge to end DUI fatalities involving pedestrians. Two officers arrested with DUI were allowed to resign. One failed a drug test and was allowed to resign. He said policing started within the department, and they demanded accountability, transparency, and the department to put to the CNA Mr. Rhodes's case and answer his 17 e-mails and phone calls. He was also there for Marshall Walker who had offered to host a meeting. He knew that Chief Reynolds met with Arthur Lawrence and Audrey Lisbon who had spoken about community policing, and what they knew growing up in Charleston was that the police were their friends.
- 6. Denetria Smith said she was a native of North Charleston and a maintenance technician at Mercedes Benz Vans. She was honored to be there, and it was a pleasure. She was optimistic about Charleston carrying the Holy City name. She hadn't heard of any other City in the nation that carried that name, and she was excited about them walking and wearing their suit well.
- 7. Johanna Carrington said under the Gaillard Reconstruction Project 36 bodies were located. What they found out about those bones was that they came from around Sierra Leone in the 1700's, which meant there were a lot of people in Charleston during that period of time. They also found out that many of them may be related to those people. She was a native Charlestonian, born almost 88 years ago, and she may be a relative to those persons found. They put out the information and asked people if they would like to find out if they were related, as well. The response was 11,000 people who wanted to know. Charleston liked to talk about its history, and this was another chance to do so. The people came in the 1700's. and they didn't know what kind of history Charleston would get out of that, but they knew there was an opportunity to do something well to find out where they all came from. She thanked Council for listening to them, and she hoped that on May 4th Council would be there to cheer them. The Holy City would find out how much of that went back beyond when they all were here or how long they had been on Earth. She hoped Council would take advantage and support this to see the creation of people who had been there before they came, who Council may be related to.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Thank you. Would anyone else who yielded time like to be heard? Please come forward. It's absolutely fine. Would you like to be heard?"

8. LaSheia Oubre said they were the Gullah Society, and they hosted Rodney Leon from the New York Burial Ground who created the most admirable memorial for 410 people. They were hoping that in Charleston a memorial for the 36 and all of the others that were buried there would also be allowed to be created, built, and displayed in the City. She said they called on the young people of Charleston, so they could understand what their history was. They had worked with and created art with children from kindergarten all the way to college, and she hoped that Council would be able to come out on May 4th to be part of the historical procession which would begin at the College of Charleston Cistern and down George Street. On May 5th, an Ecumenical service would be held at St. John's Reformed Church at 4:00 p.m. of many different faiths to show that Charleston was the Holy City, as Charleston said it was. She hoped to see everyone there.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Would anyone else who didn't sign up like to be heard? Marc, you feeling alright?"

There was laughter in the Chamber.

Councilmember Griffin said, "Mr. Mayor."

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Griffin.

Councilmember Griffin said, "What I said earlier, and I did not mean any disrespect whatsoever to the Gullah Society, I think that every one of you should have been given ample time to speak. Honestly, I don't think two minutes is enough anymore. Our citizens are what make our City great. We shouldn't put a time limit on them anymore. That's what I was trying to say."

There was applause in the Chamber.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Well, thank you very much. We have a lot of business to conduct. That will be the end of our Citizens Participation."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Shahid."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "I'll recognize him in just a moment. Can I have order, please? Did we have one more gentleman that would like to be recognized? Please come forward."

9. Grant Mishoe said he was the genealogist and the historical researcher for the Gullah Society. He had been researching slave cemeteries and African American cemeteries for about 30 years. He was a retired firefighter from North Charleston, and said that to say African American cemeteries on the Charleston Peninsula had gotten a raw deal was an understatement. From Pittsburgh Avenue to the tip of the Battery was roughly four square miles. In that four square miles, minus one cemetery, there were 93 cemeteries. He said of those cemeteries, 28 were white, 60 were black, and there were six public cemeteries run by the City. The ones in original condition were 16 white, 20 black, and none of the public cemeteries. All of the public cemeteries, with the exception of one were now buildings, streets, parking lots, or a football stadium. There was one cemetery still left that was owned by the City in West Ashley, and it was a trash dump and completely overgrown. The ones that were gone were 12 of the white cemeteries, 35 of the African American cemeteries, and all five of the public cemeteries in the Peninsula, which was 52 out of 94. Percentage wise, that was 23 percent white, 67 percent of the African American cemeteries in Charleston were gone. He said his family, who were French Protestants, owned slaves, and his family had been in Charleston since 1687. He said he loved doing this, and this was his way of giving back. He said the cemeteries needed to be recognized. There was a problem that needed to be taken care of as I-26 wasn't being built through Magnolia Cemetery, but it was built next to the cemeteries on Monrovia Street.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Thank you, sir. Alright. Our next order of business is Petitions and Communications."

Councilmember Shahid said, "Mr. Mayor."

Councilmember Waring said, "Mr. Mayor."

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Shahid followed by Councilmember Waring.

Councilmember Shahid said, "They had talked about the citizens who spoke about this May 4<sup>th</sup> and 5<sup>th</sup> event. Are there details about these events that can be passed on to us?"

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Right."

Councilmember Shahid said, "Thank you."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Thank you for sharing that."

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Waring.

Councilmember Waring said, "Mayor, I'd like to go back. The citizen that came up and complained negatively about our Police Chief was wrong. We have one of the finest Police Chiefs in America, and I know you know that, and all 12 of us know what went into that. The effort that he's putting forth creates the environment for people to come to the microphone and speak freely in a negative way in a civilized environment. But, that shouldn't be allowed to go without being addressed. Now a lot of times, believe me, we have to have thick skins because we asked for this job, but when we hire people to protect the community, as we've done. We recruited Chief Reynolds and his team, we have the largest municipal police force in the State of South Carolina. There is none better than the one that we have. So, you were wrong, but you had the right to do it, and now it's my time to speak. I just want to set the record straight on that, Mr. Mayor, and hopefully, I know our Council and you feel the same way. Thank you."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Thank you and I could not agree more. Thank you very much."

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Mitchell.

Councilmember Mitchell said, "Yes, Mr. Mayor, I was alluding to the same time, and that's why I was watching and waiting. I know we don't have a rebuttal against anyone who comes to speak, but when they talk about the Police Chief that way, it got to me because I work with him a lot. I can call him, any one of us can call him, on a daily basis, and he will be there. In so far as the community is concerned, we have officers working in the community. I'm on the Eastside of town, and if I call them, they will be there. The community has to take care of the community sometimes and make calls and come and let people know what's going on. You can't wait for the police to come and do everything.

So, when the people are talking about 'the police are not there', I live in North Central, and I've been in North Central probably over 40 years. The officers are up and down that street, up and down King Street, up and down Huger Street. All of these streets, they are there, so I don't know what somebody is saying if they don't see officers there, but they are there. The officers are spread out in certain areas and other areas, too, because everybody else wants them. So, what are you going to do, hire a million officers? That's not going to do any good. People have to be about their business. So, I really took a step back when I heard that, and the Chief is having all of these different meetings throughout the community. He goes to different churches to meet them. He's been to my church many times, and he always goes around the churches to meet and have dialogue with the people in the community to find out what's going on. So, I really took a slap in the face when the individual came up here and said this, and I know this place, because this is my home. I'm not a 'come here'. I've 'been here' all of the time. I might have left here and went to New York, NYU, but I came back here to Charleston and have been here. I always tell everyone, and my colleagues know this, at 14 years old, I got arrested 25 times in the Civil Rights Movement right here in the City. This is not the way the City of Charleston was. So, we made a difference, and we're looking for other people to carry us on, young people to carry us on, and make a difference also. So, when the people come up like this, I take a back step to that, and it bothered me, so I had to say something."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Thank you, sir."

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilwoman Jackson followed by Councilmember Moody.

Councilwoman Jackson said, "Thank you. I, too, want to associate myself with your statements, Councilmembers, in disagreement that we have a Police Chief that is not doing the work that we're asking of our officers. I think maybe this is a good time to just make a brief announcement, Mayor, about the Community Input Sessions that are taking place this week. I didn't bring the actual schedule, but I know that there are four or five scattered around all boroughs of the City, so maybe we can do that before we adjourn the meeting tonight and get it on the record. The publicity has been very thorough. The Neighborhood Services have sent out their own announcements. The Police Communications Officer has blasted it out two or three times. I think people are putting it on their Next Door networks, but it would be good, in light of the discussion that we just heard, that we are going to have a chance for anyone who wants to come out across the City to give their input on how we're doing with our policing."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Absolutely."

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Moody.

Councilmember Moody said, "Yes, you're right, Councilmember Waring, he has the right to come forward, but I think we need to respond to this. My experience has been whenever we have a rash of violations, break-ins, stuff like that, we need to communicate, and I'm sure that there is probably a lack of communication going on here between these citizens and the Police Department because I know the police respond. The problem is if people are not locking their cars, they're not locking their houses, they're not keeping their property safe, exactly what you were saying, there is a responsibility there. I know that the police take every one of these violations seriously. They track them, and they watch them. Every week they watch all of those statistics. Every week the different teams have meetings, and they go to those areas where they have problems, and that problem area moves all around this City. It's not reserved to Downtown, I can tell you. We've had problems West Ashley in my district, and it involves the community getting involved. So, my message to you, sir, is that, I don't know, maybe Public Safety, the

Committee, could take a look at this stuff and let the Chief come and respond because, I guarantee, you will find there are a lot of these statistics that are pointing right back, and we need the community input. It's not because of a lack of diligence on a lot of our police force, so we need to have that communication going on. Thank you, Mr. Mayor."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Thank you. Councilmember Waring, did you want to add anything else?"

Councilmember Waring said, "Just to point out that one of the Community Listening Sessions is actually going on right now West Ashley at Bible Way Baptist Church, so to your point, Councilwoman Jackson."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "That's right."

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Lewis.

Councilmember Lewis said, "Mr. Mayor, I can tell you every neighborhood organization meeting I go to, I always inform my Team Commander, and he always tries to make sure someone is there. Sometimes circumstances might not permit them to be there, but I know I was in Washington, DC during my last North Central meeting, and I called Lieutenant Hawkins. He was out sick, but he called me back, and he told me he would have somebody at the meeting. I wasn't there, but he usually responds when I call him. If there is a problem in his district, he lives around the corner from me, he is running against me for City Council. He can come and tell me he has problems and I'll work on it, whether he is my opponent or not, but don't come in badgering my Chief because I don't like that either. I could tell you from self-experience, the police officers are always in District #3, especially around Sumter Street, Carolina Street where he lives, and that area. So I just want to set the record straight. I didn't want to say anything because he was running against me, but I just couldn't sit here and just hold my peace."

Councilmember Moody said, "Now it all makes sense. Stupid me."

There was laughter in the Chamber.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Thank you, Councilmember Lewis. I'm going to add that I've had a lot of very good days serving as Mayor. I love this job, but one of the greatest days I had as Mayor was when Chief Luther Reynolds accepted the position of Police Chief of this fine City. What I recognized about him was that he not only had the mind, the professionalism of policing, but he had the heart. He has a heart for the community policing and for our community, for our brothers and sisters. It's an amazing combination that we have in this Chief, and we are really blessed to have him. Now that being said, he recognizes, as we all do, that we've all got room for improvement. We can all do a better job at whatever we're doing. That's why we're so proud to be involved in this audit that the police department is engaged in right now. As was mentioned, they're meeting right now and every day this week. I don't have the specific dates and times, but I believe it's every night this week to allow for the kind of community input. We can read them off in a minute if you all like if you've got them right there. I'll ask Madam Clerk to, please, read off those meetings, so they will be in the record."

The Clerk said, "Madam Clerk is going to have to make this bigger."

There was laughter in the Chamber.

Councilmember Moody said, "Madam Clerk, you need to turn the microphone on."

There was laughter in the Chamber.

The Clerk said, "Thank you, Councilmember. So, March 26<sup>th</sup>, it's at Bible Way Baptist at 2019 Savage Road from 6:00 p.m. to 8:00 p.m.; on the 27<sup>th</sup>, St. James Presbyterian, 1314 Secessionville Road from 6:30 p.m. to 8:30 p.m.; the 28<sup>th</sup>, Burke High School, 244 President Street from 6:00 p.m. to 8:00 p.m.; and then on the 29<sup>th</sup> at St. Julian Devine Center, 1 Cooper from 6:00 p.m. to 8:00 p.m."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "So, we urge our citizens to participate. Alright. Thank you all very much. Let's move along with our Petitions and Communications. First up is a Resolution for the reinterment of the bones, and remains, that were found at the Gaillard Center. Apparently, when they were found there was a public notice given that was required. We don't know that this is legally required, but now that we're at the point where we're prepared to reinter, we would like to give this Resolution as public notice that the bones, that the remains, will be reburied, reinterred, and where they will be reinterred. If I may add one sentence, because I want to acknowledge Dr. O, as he is affectionately known, and the Gullah Society. They weren't specifically mentioned here. So, I'd like to ask Council to allow the addition of a sentence at the end of the second full paragraph where it's talking about the study and documentation to be done on the remains to say, 'Said study, documentation, and planning for reinterment is being accomplished with the assistance and partnership with the Gullah Society', just so we acknowledge our partnership with the Gullah Society."

Councilmember Moody said, "Move for approval."

Councilmember Griffin said, "Second."

Councilmember Mitchell said, "With the amendment."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "We have a motion for approval as amended and a second. Is there any discussion?"

No one asked to speak.

On a motion of Councilmember Moody, seconded by Councilmember Griffin, City Council voted unanimously to approve the Resolution for the reinterment of remains found at the Gaillard Center, as amended.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Thank you, Dr. O and the Gullah Society for your work."

There was applause in the Chamber.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "So, next we have five different Boards and Commissions. I believe additional information has been sent out on requests of individuals of who had also applied online for the various positions and also the attendance of the past meetings for these particular Committees."

Councilmember Moody said, "I move for approval of I.b.(i) through (v).

Councilmember Shealy said, "Second."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "We have a motion to approve I.b(i) through (v)."

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Griffin.

Councilmember Griffin said, "Mr. Mayor, I just want to say thank you for that. I know it was probably not an easy task, but it was very, very helpful, and I appreciate you doing that for me. Thank you."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Yes, sir."

Councilmember Moody said, "Mr. Mayor."

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Moody.

Councilmember Moody said, "I was going to ask Councilwoman Jackson about the only man that is on her Committee who has kind of a bad attendance record and if she had a response to it."

There was laughter in the Chamber.

Councilwoman Jackson said, "I definitely have a response. That young man is a part-time student and a part-time worker. He works at the non-profit that I'm blanking on the official name, but they work on sexual harassment. I think they work with rape victims in terms of helping women go through that horrible process, but he has found a full-time job. This past year, when he had a weak attendance record, he was called home to be the primary caregiver for his older brother who was going through cancer treatments, so we gave him a sustained excuse."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Alright."

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Moody.

Councilmember Moody said, "I said it somewhat in jest, and I didn't know what the reason was, but in looking through those attendances, there were a lot of them that were excused. I don't know, but there ought to be some instruction on all of these Committees. I understand when things happen and people can't attend a meeting, they call and let them know, so you're sure that you have a quorum and all of that kind of stuff. I think we ought to insist on all of these folks at least call in and announce that they're not going to be there. I think that's just respectful."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Right."

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Shealy.

Councilmember Shealy said, "Yes, I actually wanted to mention on that same Committee, I think Michelle Hill had the longest perfect attendance record. She deserves that gold star."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Okay. I'll let Michelle know that. So, without further discussion to approve I.b.(i) through (v)."

On a motion of Councilmember Moody, seconded by Councilmember Shealy, City Council voted unanimously to approve the appointments and reappointments to the Resiliency & Sustainability Advisory Committee, Commission on Disability Issues, Accommodations Tax Advisory Committee, Board of Architectural Review – Large, and Commission on Women.

# ---INSERT APPOINTMENT MEMO---

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "So, then just to briefly add on to the discussion about the attendance in reviewing and pulling together all of that information, and seeing what we might be able to do to be more transparent and accountable, we plan to post online our attendance of these

various Boards and Commissions. Also, we have not been posting the minutes for the various Boards and Commissions and meetings, and we also plan to add the posting of the minutes for all of these organizations. In the future, when we bring recommendations to you, in addition to doing like we were doing with Robin, and now this time we'll share with you anybody else who did apply, number one, and we'll share with you the attendance as we did this time. We'll make that a regular practice."

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Seekings.

Councilmember Seekings said, "I want to start this by footnoting one by saying I'm not trying to create any work for anybody, but if you're going to start posting minutes, can we get a list from the Clerk's Office as to which of the Boards and Commissions get minutes or don't? Because there are a lot of Boards and Commissions that exist pursuant to our ordinances that don't keep minutes because and I'm not asking to expand it, but anyway."

The Clerk said, "Yes, I'm about to answer some of those questions because the Clerk's Office can't handle any more minutes, and we don't cover every Board and Commission."

Councilmember Seekings said, "So, that's why when you say you're going to post minutes, we need to know whose got minutes and who doesn't because not all of them do."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Let me say this, the Boards and Commissions that we take minutes on we will post them online."

Councilmember Seekings said, "Right."

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Griffin.

Councilmember Griffin said, "Mr. Mayor, I appreciate, and I think that's a great idea. It's evident that we have people in this City who want to be on these Boards and Commissions. By being as transparent as possible, we're at least showing everybody why these people are serving on these Boards, and also, having the minutes accessible comes in handy because a lot of these Boards and Commissions bring a lot of really important things to Council. Being able to look at those minutes, then our citizens understand why it's coming to us and what the thought process was for the Board, so I think that's a great, great idea. These Boards and Commissions get, they make our City great, and they also bring a lot of the stuff that we vote on to the table here. So, a lot of the groundwork is laid in these Boards, and I just want to be able to honor these people, and I want us to be able to get as many people involved as possible and I think, by being transparent, we're going to do that."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Thank you. Alright."

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Moody.

Councilmember Moody said, "Yes, I just wanted to raise one question. Some of these Boards and Commissions like the Planning Commission and some of the other ones, the bigger type Commissions, have a Continuing Education requirement or some kind of training that's supposed to occur when these people are appointed, and my understanding is that the attendance at those things has not been all that--."

The Clerk said, "You're correct. There are some Boards that are required to do that by the State, and a lot of them are Planning Commission related Boards. I would think that the Planning staff would have the documentation. The Clerk's Office doesn't have all of the

documentation on it. I do have a number of staff members that cover some of the City Boards and Commissions."

Councilmember Moody said, "Yes. My understanding is that whoever is supposed to be attending those things, that some people have been on these Commissions and have not done that. To me, that's just as important of being in a meeting, understanding what you're supposed to be deciding. What your rules are? What you're all about? That's just my word of mouth. It may be completely wrong, but I would like to see something on that at some future meeting, and I can talk with Planning."

The Clerk said, "I can provide the information, but I think they would have to provide the documentation."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Alright. We can do that."

Councilmember Moody said, "Thank you, Mr. Mayor."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Yes, sir. So, next are our Council Committee Reports. First up is Committee on Public Safety, Councilmember Shahid."

Councilmember Shahid said, "Thank you, Mr. Mayor and members of Council. The Public Safety Committee met yesterday afternoon to take up two items. One was to receive a report on our civil sidewalks ordinance from Lieutenant King and then also to consider the amendment to Chapter 28, Section 45 of that particular ordinance which, essentially, is just stretching the boundaries of the sidewalk ordinance one block in either direction where they exist on King Street and Broad Street and on north and south Market Street."

Councilmember Lewis said, "I move to approve the Public Safety Committee Report."

Councilmember Griffin said, "Second."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "We have a motion to approve. Is there any discussion?"

No one asked to speak.

On a motion of Councilmember Lewis, seconded by Councilmember Griffin, City Council voted unanimously to adopt the Committee on Public Safety Report as presented:

- i.) Report in accordance with the Civil Sidewalks Ordinance
- ii.) An ordinance to amend the Code of the City of Charleston, South Carolina, Chapter 28, Section 45 to include streets crossing King Street for one block in either direction of King Street between and including Line and Broad Streets and streets crossing North and South Market Streets for one block in either direction of North and South Market Streets between King Street and East Bay Streets.

First reading was given to the following bill:

An ordinance to amend the Code of the City of Charleston, South Carolina, Chapter 28, Section 45 to include streets crossing King Street for one block in either direction of King Street between and including Line and Broad Streets and streets crossing North and South Market Streets for one block in either direction of North and South Market Streets between King Street and East Bay Streets.

Councilmember Shahid said, "Mr. Mayor, while I've got the microphone, Chief would you just come forward for a second, please? I just want to add to the chorus of what was said and to publicly apologize for those comments made to you, Chief, and your Police Department, and your troops. The Chief and I talk on a regular basis. I interact with his superior staff members on a regular basis. They have responded to every question I've asked, every inquiry that I've had. Even a woman who called me twice today about azaleas being stolen from a garden next to her, the police went out there yesterday, and talked to her. I am so proud of this Police Department and so proud of, Chief, what you have done in just a short period of time. I just want to take this opportunity, for the record, it's very clear that we are moving in the right direction, and I just want to thank you and your staff for all that you have done after that, of course, that was said earlier today."

Chief Luther Reynolds said, "I appreciate the support. I need the support. I can't do it without your support. We have a long ways to go. I'm humbled by that support. I'm not afraid of criticism. I understand that we have room for improvement. I promise you, we have room for improvement. We're going to learn a lot from this audit, we're going to make changes, and we're going to continue to get better. We are committed to being accountable to our communities, to being transparent, to being men and women of integrity, and we're not perfect, but we are accountable. It's an honor and a privilege to be here. As long as I'm here, I'm going to give this City my best, give the Mayor my best, give the Council my best, and I appreciate the support. We need that. We have a lot of important work to do. Our communities need us, and we can't do it without you, so we have a long way to go. I tell our troops and our Command, we talk a lot about a lot of issues regularly, it's like a marathon, and we're not even half way through the first mile, but we're pointing in the right direction. So, thank you."

Councilmember Shahid said, "Thank you, Chief."

There was applause in the Chamber.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Thank you. So, next is our Committee on Public Works, and Councilmember Griffin was conducting that serving as Chairman today."

Councilmember Seekings said, "Move for adoption of the report."

Councilwoman Jackson said, "Second."

Councilmember Griffin said, "Thank you, Mr. Mayor. The Committee on Public Works met today. It says 3:00 p.m., and I introduced our new Director to Harry/Perry time, it started at 3:15 p.m. Director, would you like to speak a little bit? Maybe give us an update on what you touched on today. This is Matthew Fountain. He was introduced at one of our previous meetings, but his first day was Monday or was it last Monday?"

Matthew Fountain said, "Last Monday."

Councilmember Griffin said, "Last Monday."

Mr. Fountain said, "Yes. Did you have any areas you wanted me to touch on specifically?"

Councilmember Griffin said, "Just maybe a brief synopsis of what you talked about."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "I'll be glad to recognize our new Stormwater Director, Matt Fountain."

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Stormwater Director Matt Fountain.

Matt Fountain said, "Basically, we reviewed a number of the projects we have going on and what the status is on those projects and tried to set a good standard for providing regular updates and keeping everyone informed on what we've accomplished recently, what we have next planned for the project, and what the overall schedule for those projects are. Bringing AECOM onboard with the project manager, and this went to Ways and Means today. That will be very helpful for letting us continue to move projects forward rapidly and let us help with our staff levels by kind of supplementing that through their contract."

Councilmember Griffin said, "Does anybody have any questions for him or anything like that? Councilmember Lewis?"

Councilmember Lewis said, "No, I'm happy."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "I'll conduct the meeting."

Councilmember Griffin said, "I'm just asking, Mr. Mayor. I didn't call on anybody."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "I understand. After your report, I'll be happy to recognize anybody."

Councilmember Griffin said, "My report is concluded. Thank you."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Yes. Thank you very much. Next is our Committee on Ways and Means."

Councilmember White said, "Move for the adoption of the report."

Councilmember Lewis said, "Second."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "We have a motion and a second. Is there any discussion?"

No one asked to speak.

On a motion of Councilmember White, seconded by Councilmember Lewis, City Council voted unanimously to adopt the Committee on Ways and Means Report as presented:

Councilmember Waring was excused from the meeting at 6:24 p.m.

## --- INSERT COMMITTEE ON WAYS AND MEANS REPORT---

(Bids and Purchases

(Police Department: Approval to submit the FY19 Homeland Security Grant in the amount of \$120,000 that requests funding for a MWC equipment truck for the purpose of underwater response/swiftwater rescue operations. The application for this grant is due 3/31/19. This grant does not require a City match.

(Fire Department: Approval to apply for the FM Global Fire Prevention Grant Program in the amount of \$4,000 for the Fire Marshal Department. Funds will be used to purchase the scene lighting for fire investigations. No City match is required.

(Office of Cultural Affairs: Approval to apply for \$6,000 in funding from the South Carolina Department of Parks, Recreation & Tourism for tourism advertising funding. Funds will be used to support the 2019 MOJA Arts Festival. A 2:1 City match is required. Matching funds will come from corporate sponsorships and paid

admissions.

(An ordinance to amend the description of the Charleston Neck Redevelopment Project area as established by Ordinance No. 2004-151; to amend the Public Infrastructure Improvements Agreement dated as of September 1, 2015 between the City of Charleston, South Carolina and Highland Resources, Inc., as successor to Ashley River Investors, LLC; and other matters relating thereto. (**DEFERRED**)

(Public Service: Approval of a Master Agreement for Professional Services between the City of Charleston and AECOM Technical Services, Inc.

(Request approval of the Amendment to Lease for tenant improvements at 2093 Executive Hall Road required for police forensics accreditation in the amount of \$10,760. The property is owned by Traverse Point, LLC. (TMS: 351-01-00-049)

Councilmember Moody said, "Mr. Mayor."

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Moody.

Councilmember Moody said, "Just a point of order here, that item looks almost like it was maybe approved here, but that is deferred, the item on the TIF District."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "That is correct."

Councilmember Moody said, "We just need the record to show that we're deferring that one also, not approving."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "That is correct. Item #7 on Ways and Means was deferred. Thank you very much. Let the record show that. Now, we have bills up for third reading, and I think that was deferred, so bills up for second reading, we have L-1."

Councilmember Moody said, "Move for approval."

Councilwoman Jackson said, "Second."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "This was regarding our lease/purchase agreements. Is there any discussion?"

No one asked to speak.

On a motion of Councilmember Moody, one (1) bill (Item L-1) received second reading. It passed second reading on motion by Councilwoman Jackson and third reading on motion of Councilmember Mitchell. On further motion of Councilwoman Jackson, the rules were suspended, and the bill was immediately ratified as:

2019-022

AN ORDINANCE TO AUTHORIZE THE EXECUTION AND DELIVERY OF LEASE/PURCHASE AGREEMENTS WITH BANC OF AMERICA PUBLIC CAPITAL CORP. IN ORDER TO PROVIDE FOR THE ACQUISITION OF CERTAIN POLICE, FIRE, PUBLIC SERVICE, FLEET, STORMWATER AND VARIOUS OTHER VEHICLES AND EQUIPMENT; TO PROVIDE THE TERMS AND CONDITIONS OF SUCH LEASE/PURCHASE AGREEMENTS; TO PROVIDE FOR THE GRANTING OF A SECURITY INTEREST TO SECURE ALL OBLIGATIONS OF LESSEE UNDER THE LEASE/PURCHASE AGREEMENTS; TO AUTHORIZE THE EXECUTION AND DELIVERY 04520F ALL DOCUMENTS NECESSARY OR APPROPRIATE TO THE CONSUMMATION OF SUCH

# LEASE/PURCHASE AGREEMENTS; AND TO PROVIDE FOR OTHER MATTERS RELATED THERETO.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Alright. Next we have items up for first reading. I think we have four items up."

Councilmember Mitchell said, "Move for approval of M-1 through M-4."

Councilmember Seekings said, "Second."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "We have a motion to approve all four items, M-1 through M-4. M-1 includes that Opportunity Zones matter. So, is there any discussion on any of these?"

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Moody.

Councilmember Moody said, "I was curious on Item M-4 why that particular one is needed. I saw Mr. Riccio in here earlier. Is there a problem with blocking---"

Councilmember Seekings said, "Yes."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "We do. Yes, sir. It's been reported a number of times. This just, I think, clarifies our existing ordinance a little bit about blocking."

Councilmember Moody said, "So, what are we going to do to correct this? I guess we're going to pass the ordinance, but you've got to enforce it, so Mr. Riccio's going to be on one of those carriages riding around."

There was laughter in the Chamber.

Dan Riccio said, "Well, you know we have six tourism enforcement officers out in the streets seven days a week collectively. We do enforce all of the ordinances of Tourism, all the issues in the Tourism Ordinance. The problem we had with this particular ordinance is it didn't clearly define blocking the sidewalk or entering the public right-of-way or roadway. So, the officers would never approach anybody while they're on a tour, but after the tour is given and the guests leave, they approach the individual, and they have been challenged by some tour guides that are attorneys that it would not apply, and they're allowed to do what they're doing. So, to give them the extra tools, we went ahead and clearly defined, for safety reasons, blocking the sidewalk because a lot of them leave the sidewalk, and they enter the roadway in front of a vehicle, so that's basically why we did that."

Councilmember Moody said, "Well, that was really my question, and I didn't want to go to hanging a number around a tour guide like we are sending them off. We're just trying to get them to stay to the side and kind of manage their tours."

Mr. Riccio said, "Exactly. Any tours, we never approach during the tour. For one, it's not safe. Two, we don't want to set a bad--"

Councilmember Moody said, "Send the wrong message."

Mr. Riccio said, "Exactly, the wrong message."

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilwoman Jackson.

Councilwoman Jackson said, "I'm just curious. I've just been thinking about how you

would get the word out, to be able to plan, that this will be a good change to our ordinance. Do we keep a database of the licensed tour guides? Do we communicate with them regularly through our services or something?"

Mr. Riccio said, "Well, we won't say licensed."

There was laughter in the Chamber.

Mr. Riccio continued, "We'll say 'volunteer registration'. Let's be clear on that."

Councilwoman Jackson said, "Yes, known to the City."

Mr. Riccio said, "Yes, we do, and it's a voluntary registration, and we have very good communication with the Tour Guide Association. We attend their meetings. We have constant communication, and if we have a concern, even after the fact, that if we are not able to particularly identify a certain tour guide, we will seek help through the Tour Guide Association, and they're very helpful. Again, this was enacted for that one percent that really wasn't following the rules and challenging the ordinance. I had just as many complaints from other tour guides as we did from our own officers and other citizens. So, it wasn't like everyone's against tour guides. It was strictly to be safe in the community."

Councilwoman Jackson said, "Yes, I was assuming that we could have a way of being proactive to get the word out."

Mr. Riccio said, "Absolutely, and they know. This went to the Tourism Subcommittee and the Tourism Commission, and that was explained to them. They have the representatives there, and we also have attended their meetings and explained that to them."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Are there any other questions for Items M-1 through M-4?"

No one else asked to speak.

On a motion of Councilmember Mitchell, seconded by Councilmember Seekings, City Council voted unanimously to give first reading to the following bills:

An ordinance to amend Part 15 (Mixed Use 1 - Workforce Housing District Mixed Use 2 - Workforce Housing District) of Article 2 (Land Use Regulations) of Chapter 54 of the Code of the City of Charleston, South Carolina (Zoning Ordinance), to implement the Federal Opportunity Zone Program, by creating certain incentives to encourage the development of "Opportunity Units" for households with incomes less than or equal to 60% of the Area Median Income (AMI).

An ordinance to amend Division 2 (Tourism Commission) of Article II (Administration and Enforcement) of Chapter 29 of the Code of the City of Charleston, South Carolina (Tourism Ordinance), by striking references in Sec. 29-33 to the Mayor's Office of Tourism and inserting instead references to the Department of Livability and Tourism, and by adding language to Sec. 29-33 emphasizing the application of Robert's Rules of Order to the conduct of business before the Commission.

An ordinance to amend Chapter 29, Article V, Sec. 29-206 (a), 29-208 (c) (5) and(c) (6), Sec. 29-209, and Sec. 29-212 (b) and (c) (1) of the Code of the City of Charleston pertaining to the gatekeeper loading and medallion issuance procedure, recording of tour information, sanitation communication, and management requirements.

City Council March 26, 2019 Page 28

An ordinance to amend Chapter 29 of the Code of the City of Charleston by adding regulations pertaining to the blocking of the public right-of-way by walking tours.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Our next Regular Meeting will be Tuesday, April 9th. Is there any further business to come before us?"

No one asked to speak.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Hearing none, we stand adjourned."

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 6:29 p.m.

Vanessa Turner Maybank Clerk of Council